

10-30-2020

One News Event, Three Media Frames

Le Xin

University of South Florida

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalcommons.usf.edu/etd>



Part of the [Mass Communication Commons](#)

Scholar Commons Citation

Xin, Le, "One News Event, Three Media Frames" (2020). *USF Tampa Graduate Theses and Dissertations*.
<https://digitalcommons.usf.edu/etd/8605>

This Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by the USF Graduate Theses and Dissertations at Digital Commons @ University of South Florida. It has been accepted for inclusion in USF Tampa Graduate Theses and Dissertations by an authorized administrator of Digital Commons @ University of South Florida. For more information, please contact digitalcommons@usf.edu.

One News Event, Three Media Frames

by

Le Xin

A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment
of the requirements for the degree of
Master of Arts
Zimmerman School of Advertising and Mass Communication
College of Arts and Sciences
University of South Florida

Major Professor: Artemio Ramirez, Ph.D.
Roxanne Watson, Ph.D.
Yao Sun, Ph.D.

Date of Approval:
October 9, 2020

Keywords: news framing, framing theory, Hong Kong media, Mainland media, American media

Copyright © 2020, Le Xin

Table of Contents

| | |
|--|-----|
| List of Tables | iii |
| List of Figures | iv |
| Abstract | v |
| Chapter One: Introduction | 1 |
| Chapter Two: Literature Review | 5 |
| Case Background | 5 |
| Hong Kong History | 9 |
| Hong Kong Politics | 10 |
| Framing Theory | 12 |
| China censorship | 15 |
| Research Questions | 16 |
| Chapter Three: Method | 18 |
| Content Analysis | 18 |
| Word Cloud | 20 |
| Coding Procedures | 20 |
| Coding Book | 21 |
| Chapter Four: Result | 23 |
| Overall coverage | 23 |
| RQ1. Protests News Tone | 25 |
| RQ2. Protesters News Tone | 25 |
| RQ3. Government and Government officials News Tone | 26 |
| RQ4. Key words | 26 |

| | |
|---|----|
| Chapter Five: Discussion | 36 |
| Differences in the protests framing | 36 |
| Differences in the protesters framing | 38 |
| Differences in the government framing | 39 |
| Differences in vocabulary frequency | 40 |
| Political Reasons for Different Frameworks..... | 43 |
| Future directions and Limitations | 46 |
| | |
| Chapter Six: Conclusion | 48 |
| | |
| References..... | 49 |

List of Tables

| | |
|--|----|
| Table 1 Media Coverage Main Topic | 28 |
| Table 2 Protests Chi-Square Tests | 29 |
| Table 3 Protests * Organizations Crosstabulation | 29 |
| Table 4 Protesters Chi-Square Tests | 30 |
| Table 5 Protesters * Organizations Crosstabulation | 31 |
| Table 6 Government Chi-Square Tests | 32 |
| Table 7 Government * Organizations Crosstabulation | 32 |

List of Figures

| | |
|--|----|
| Figure 1 Word cloud of keywords in the New York Times | 33 |
| Figure 2 Word cloud of keywords in the Southern Metropolis Daily | 34 |
| Figure 3 Word cloud of keywords in the Ming Pao..... | 35 |

Abstract

As a protest movement that has attracted international attention, the 2019 Hong Kong protest has become the focus of media and public attention due to political issues involving China mainland and Hong Kong. The reporting process and framing of news media for news events is actually a process of selecting and reorganizing related events. The media of different countries also reported the 2019 Hong Kong Protest like this process. However, the reporting frameworks in different media organizations are also completely different because of the differences in the nature, positioning, and political factors of those media. Based on the framing theory, this research selected *the New York Times* in the United States, *the Southern Metropolis Daily* in Mainland China, and *the Ming Pao* in Hong Kong as the research objects to compare and analyze the differences in news reports on 2019 Hong Kong protests. Content analysis is the main research method. According to actual needs, this research divides the tone of the news into four aspects to analyze the structure of protests, protesters and government. The research results show that there are indeed differences in reports between different media in different countries.

Chapter One: Introduction

Hong Kong's revised *The Fugitive Offenders Amendment Bill* on 13 February 2019 has been opposed by the city's business and legal communities. The business community believes that this may affect the business environment in Hong Kong, and the legal community believes that the meeting will undermine Hong Kong's judicial independence. As a result, some democratic protesters have been staging violent protests since March, including demonstrations and attacks on police. Frequent demonstrations and violent incidents have seriously affected Hong Kong's tourism and consumption-related economic activities. Media reports, as an important channel for the public to obtain information about events, affect the public from all levels, especially the public's judgment of events. With the gradual expansion of the incident, the mainstream media in China and the United States have separately reported on the 2019 Hong Kong protests. It is interesting that different countries and media have different forms of coverage of the same news event. For example, The New York Times trumpeted the fact that Hong Kong police used rubber bullets to break up a demonstration, while ignoring the fact that the police were surrounded by dozens of rioters. The media reports convey the cognitive structure of a media organization's information processing. The results of processing news information according to different cognitive structures also reflect some organizations' basic judgments on the nature of news information content. Readers can also judge organizational positions, motivations, tendencies,

and attitudes based on specific news information. Scheufele & Tewksbury (2007) point out that the way that an issue is framed in news reports can influence the audiences' understanding and interpretation of the issue. The frame structure in news files is defined as "the process by which people develop a particular conceptualization of an issue or reorient their thinking about an issue" (Chong & Druckman, 2007, p.2). Research from Birkland (1997), Kim (1984), and Cobb and Elder (1983) show that political elites often use news events to influence public policy and mobilize public opinion to support their goals, because major news events can change the parameters of policy debates. Schnell & Callaghan (2004) point out that events may introduce new or additional framing that are inconsistent or irrelevant to previous frames and thus have the ability to reshape public perceptions of the issue. For example, the Chinese government uses the news media as a means to monitor its citizens during natural disasters, especially in times of disaster. Fu, Zhou, Zhang, Chan and Burkhart (2012) point out that in news articles covering natural disasters, few people frame these stories as "negative comments on the government" or "public criticism of the government". Through the news framing structure, the news media can successfully suppress the negative attitude of the public towards the government. Some studies have shown that news coverage of the 2019 Hong Kong protests by Chinese and American media has seriously affected audiences' views on Hong Kong politics and economy (Zhang, Kim, Mohr, Myslik, Khalitova, Golan & Kioussis, 2017; Zhu, 2018). In the wave of protests in Hong Kong caused by the revision of *The Fugitive Offenders Amendment Bill*, many media have pointed out the inconsistency between the Chinese and American reports. For example, the

Swedish media commented that the New York times report lacked authenticity and only showed the vicious images of police wielding batons and firing bullets at ‘innocent citizen’. However, research on news content through qualitative methods is limited. Although there are different voices on the Internet about this incident, there is no systematic analysis of the specific content of the controversial 2019 Hong Kong protests. Media reports play a significant role in the public's judgment of events. The exploration of the differences in the framing coverage of different organizations can help people further understand the media report, make the media reports authentic and positive guidance, and help the public keep a clear mind, recognize the truth of the event, adhere to the correct and positive judgment.

The purpose of this thesis is to explore the differences in the framing coverage of different organizations in the same event by comparing the reports of journalists from China mainland, Hong Kong and the United States on the protests caused by Hong Kong's revised *Fugitive Offenders Amendment Bill*. Comparing the behavior of Chinese and American media organizations can also help us to understand the definition of frame structures of different media journalists and the impact of government on news content. Besides, this research can help readers distinguish between the different cultural backgrounds of the East and the West and their understanding of cultural factors such as freedom. Furthermore, content analysis is considered an appropriate qualitative method of exploration for this research as it can demonstrate how different media reports frame construct stories about an event.

This thesis is divided into the following sections. Chapter 1 will explore the existing research on the 2019 Hong Kong protests, the specific political and economic factors of Hong Kong and mainland China, the basic theory of frame understanding by news media and some related scholars, introduce the research question. This thesis analyzes political, social and cultural levels of mainstream Chinese and American media's understanding of the framing theory of 2019 Hong Kong protests. In addition, the research method uses content analysis, including the news report, research content, specific period, research tool and method selection process. Finally, through the results of content analysis, the author compares and summarizes the specific framing of Chinese and American media coverage of the Hong Kong protests in 2019 and draws conclusions

Chapter Two: Literature Review

Case Background

Initially, demonstrations in Hong Kong were organized by pro-democracy (like some anti-government groups) protesters (Bosco, 2016). Demonstrations and protests in Hong Kong became more common, supportive groups used similar methods to confront protesters. The study chose this protest in 2019 because a large number of media considered it to be "the worst crisis in Hong Kong" and "the most participated parade" since the return of Hong Kong in 1997.

The Fugitive Offenders and Mutual Legal Assistance in Criminal Matters Amendment (Legislation) Bill (FOAB) led to the Hong Kong protests in June 2019. The Hong Kong government chose this time to promote the FOAB because of a murder case. Hong Kong resident Xiaoying Pan was killed in a Taiwan hotel on February 17, 2018, and she was thrown out in the park grass the next day. The suspect Tongjia Chen, the boyfriend of the deceased, returned to Hong Kong by plane alone after the incident. Under Hong Kong law, Tongjia Chen had to accept murder-related charges in Taiwan. However, there is no extradition agreement between Hong Kong and Taiwan, so he has stayed in Hong Kong, avoiding legal responsibility. Because of this case, Hong Kong officials believed that it was necessary and imminent to amend the extradition regulations. The Hong Kong government believed that existing legal loopholes had made the city a paradise for mainland criminals (Chen, 2019). The Hong Kong government proposed a

comprehensive amendment to the Fugitive Offenders Ordinance in February 2019 to simplify the procedures for extradition cases and expand Hong Kong's extradition treaty. The key point in the regulations that aroused controversy is the mechanism for the transfer of fugitives. The transfer area includes not only Taiwan but also mainland China and Macau.

According to this bill, the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region Government (HKG) and some people have divergent views on the purpose and role of the bill, particularly the city's business and legal communities. The business community believed that this could affect the business environment in Hong Kong. And the legal community believed that the meeting would undermine Hong Kong's judicial independence. It is said that the mainland legal system cannot be trusted and does not even meet the basic standards of judicial justice. People believe that the implementation of the bill will endanger their lives, personal safety, and democratic freedom (Chen, 2019). According to a survey conducted by local media in Hong Kong, there were four main reasons why people opposed the revision to the FOAB. First, people worried that Hong Kong's legal system and the one country, two systems system would be impacted (83.7%). The second reason was the HKG was unresponsive to the views of the public (56.2%). Third, Hong Kong residents were worried that that their families, friends and themselves would be extradited to return to the Mainland (73.8%). The last reason was that the interviewees worried that the amendment of the regulations would affect the business environment (37.4%).

Consequently, some protesters have protested by holding violent events, that gone the gamut from peaceful demonstrations to attacks on police. Frequent demonstrations and incidents of

violence have severely affected Hong Kong's tourism and consumption-related economic activities. The Hong Kong government believed the bill could create a legal system for the reasonable transfer of fugitives by improving the existing legal system. The HKSAR Government worked with the Chinese government to combat criminals and prevent Hong Kong from becoming an extrajudicial place for criminals. However, the bill has also caused protesters to worry that Hong Kong would be subject to mainland China's legal jurisdiction and related restrictions, which would undermine the people's freedom and rights. Protesters made five demands. They are: (1) withdraw the extradition bill; (2) retract the "riot" designation; (3) drop charges against those arrested; (4) independent police inquiry; and (5) democracy (Chan Kin-wa, 2019).

First, the protest started with a request to withdraw the extradition bill. This would have sent suspects in Hong Kong to China for trial. As a special administrative region, Hong Kong had some autonomy from Beijing, like its judiciary and legal system, but the proposed bill sparked concerns about China. Bowing to public pressure, Hong Kong's chief executive, Carrie Lam, suspended the bill just six days after the first mass protest, but didn't shelve it. As a result, people continued to demand that it be withdrawn completely. As the government kept refusing to formally withdraw the bill, people continued taking to the streets, fearing it could be resurrected. Second, thousands of protesters blocked the entrance to the Legislative Council building on June 12, 2019. The incident was classified as a riot. Lam said the allegations of riots would not be used in relation to peaceful protesters. However, this was controversial among some protesters,

so the protesters were demanding that the designation be dropped. Third, they also wanted amnesty for those who had been arrested. Without prosecution, the government's amnesty would weaken the rule of law. Fourth, protestors were also demanding an independent inquiry into the police handling of the protests. Officers had shot non-lethal projectiles at a close range, and liberally fired tear gas in residential and tourist areas, even in subway stations. It became one of the biggest rallying cries. In one of the latest skirmishes, a young woman was hit in the eye. She is a symbol of the movement against police brutality. Lam said an inquiry into police actions would be bad for officers' morale, and insisted that a government watchdog group, led by civilians, would do as much of a good job. The fifth demand is greater democracy, and the biggest ask. Under the current system of rule against China, Hong Kong leaders and some members of the legislature are loyal to Beijing, so demonstrators have called for universal suffrage so that everyone has the right to vote, which is actually the key to electing leaders. As the momentum of the campaign increased, so did the demands of protesters, but the government had given no more response for the time being. The diplomatic deadlock was also a key factor in this protest. The protest movement is leaderless, which means that no particular group or individual can speak for everyone.

Protests in China on February 13, 2020 have been suspended due to an outbreak of coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19). Before that, protests had also tended to wane, thanks to increased enforcement by the Hong Kong police.

Hong Kong History

The book *A Modern History of Hong Kong* concludes that the modern history of Hong Kong tells readers a story about how a remote fishing village grew into a symbol of capitalism (Tsang, 2004).

Hong Kong was under Chinese jurisdiction from the Qin Dynasty (221BC-1841). But after the two Opium Wars, China in a position of reduced power, was forced to cede Hong Kong to Britain in 1841. It was not until 1841 during the reign of Queen Victoria that Hong Kong became a British colony for the 100 years period ending in 1941. Hong Kong was divided between China and Britain through the "*Treaty of Nanjing*", "*Convention of Peking*", and "*Convention Between Great Britain and China Respecting an Extension of Hong Kong Territory*" signed after the two Opium Wars (Shuyong, 2011). Subsequently, during the Second Sino-Japanese War, Japan occupied Hong Kong for three years and eight months (1941-1945) (Tsang, 2004; Shuyong, 2011). In the Second World War, Allies, including the Soviet Union, the United States, the United Kingdom, China, and other countries, supported each other in resisting fascism and finally defeated the invaders. With the acquiescence of China, Hong Kong was returned to British rule which was in place between 1945 and 1997 in the Civil War. In 1997, Hong Kong's sovereignty was transferred, the identity of Hong Kong from a British colony to the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region (Uberoi, 2018).

Since Hong Kong opened the commercial port on January 26, 1841, the economic outlook has undergone great changes. Since the 1960s, Hong Kong's economy has developed rapidly,

creating remarkable economic miracles and becoming one of the "Four Asian Tigers"¹. Hong Kong has developed from an agricultural society in the past to become a modern cosmopolitan city, becoming an international financial center, trade center, shipping center, tourism center, and information center in the Asia-Pacific region (Shuyong, 2011).

Hong Kong Politics

Hong Kong was a British colony before returning to China in 1997. Since 1997, Hong Kong, as a special administrative region of the People's Republic of China, has been operating under a system of one country, two systems with China politically and economically. This historical background has also led Hong Kong to attach great importance to its political freedom and freedom of speech. Some researchers said that what happened in Hong Kong was the transfer of power between sovereign states. This process ignored the wishes of some residents, which led to some unstable factors in Hong Kong politics, such as differences in values during colonial rule (Zhu, 2018).

Some media use state-owned media as an important tool of political public relations (Zhang, et al., 2018). Therefore, the political situation in Hong Kong itself, the political relationship between mainland China and Hong Kong, and the political relationship between the United States and Hong Kong are relevant to this study. This association has two implications. First of all, whether or not a country enjoys the freedom of press, the media under the government's

¹ The Four Asian Tigers refer to the four rapidly developing economies in Asia from the late 1960s to the 1990s: South Korea, Taiwan, Hong Kong and Singapore.

jurisdiction must have related political tendencies, so when the media reports news events, it will also reflect the government's attitude toward political issues in these events are framed. Second, the impact of the framing will not necessarily be globally balanced, however, it will be reflected in the relationship between governments. This effect will also be reflected in the duration of diplomatic relations between countries.

Hong Kong's political system is based on Hong Kong Basic Law, its legislature, and the head of government as the Chief Executive. The implementation of "Universal Suffrage" soon became one of the most contentious aspects of the Hong Kong Basic Law (Yu & Liu, 2015). Affected by democracy, Hong Kong citizens have been fighting for universal suffrage. Democrats even consider that the failure to implement universal suffrage is an obstacle to the development of democracy in Hong Kong. Pro-government camps believe that this move is in line with the provisions of the Basic Law. A speech by a representative of the 2013 National People's Congress in an informal meeting once again made universal suffrage a controversial issue. Following this, in 2013, Hong Kong citizens held several demonstrations to reflect the wishes of some citizens. Hong Kong political groups are mainly divided into two camps, including the pro-democracy camp (opposition camp) and the pro-Beijing camp (pro-establishment camp). During the 2019 Hong Kong protests, the main dialogue chief of the protesters was Carrie Lam, a member of the pro-Beijing party camp. She is the fifth chief executive of the Hong Kong special administrative region of the People's Republic of China and the first female leader in Hong Kong's history. As violent vandalism by rioters wreaked havoc on

Hong Kong's retail, restaurant, tourism, and hotel industries, she urged the government to use its utmost determination to stop the violence.

There is a correlation between the framing and agenda of state-owned media and the framing and agenda of international news, which has also achieved the influence of state-owned media (Zhang, et al., 2018). Traditional media newspapers remain the backbone of state-owned media. The news framing of traditional media is also more influenced by journalistic norms, political roles, and cultural backgrounds (Tewksbury & Scheufele, 2007). The 2019 Hong Kong march also hints at protesters' view of the government as an obstacle to a stalled democratic process (Elizabeth, 2020).

Framing Theory

The broad definition of framing has become popular in many traditional disciplines, including psychology, economics, sociology, and communication. Different scholars define frame theory as a concept at different levels of analysis (Scheufele, 1999). However, no matter where the foundation of frame theory comes from, in the news field, framing refers to suggest how the audience interprets a problem or event (Tewksbury & Scheufele, 2007). In daily life, news can influence the audience's attitudes and behaviors through the frame. News reports contain news information and a news framing. Frames are used to establish links between information, that is, news content lays the foundation for the framing. If an audience already has a news frame when they accept a new news story, the content of the frame can be accepted simply. Therefore, it is very important to research the original belief base of the audience and the

news tone. For example, in Normile's paper (2019), the content mainly described the attack on Hong Kong University by protesters. Audience under the influence of Chinese media will fill in according to the existing framing, such as adding a picture of protesters' violent protests in their minds. Conversely, American media audiences will be biased toward the idea of defending the protesters' protests, while depicting the Hong Kong police treating protesters violently.

The purpose and direction of this research focuses on the aspects of frame building. The facts used in reporting major news events in international news are objective, but some reports do exist for the purpose of agenda-setting of the government or related organizations (Zhang, et al., 2018). The current form of globalization is gradually affecting the framing of journalism and causing greater contradictions in international events (Dai & Hyun, 2010). Some political officials or interest groups also control the direction of media coverage because of their status, position, or interests. (Bosco, 2016; Zhang, et al., 2018). Many studies have shown that journalists will be affected by the content in speeches by the government or individual companies, in their processing methods and the form of framing construction.

Violence is the main frames used in protest-related news reporting (Chan & Lee, 1984; McLeod & Hertog, 1999). This report focuses on the confrontations between protesters and police. The news media cleverly puts protesters who create trouble in the same frame as those who maintain public authority (Veneti, Karadimitriou & Poulakidakos, 2016). In this case, the frame has two modes of operation. One is that peaceful operations that represent protesters are

ignored altogether (Boykoff, 2006). One type of violence is prominently reported. Also, the dramatic increase in media coverage of the protests has often increased their influence.

Yu and Liu pointed out in research (2015) that media coverage of terrorist attacks in the United States varies. The content of the report will be based on at least five aspects of how journalists handle news: greater social norms and values, constraints on organizational pressure, external pressure from interest groups and other policymakers, professional management, and Ideological or political tendencies (Shoemaker & Reese, 1996; Tuchman, 1978; Tewksbury & Scheufele, 2007). Sometimes the media knows what other media companies are saying, but the audience may not accept it.

To sum up, news framing has the ability to reshape the public's views on issues. Different media will use different framing coverage to convey their attitudes and thoughts to the public. In the wave of protests in Hong Kong caused by the revision of *The Fugitive Offenders Amendment Bill*, many media have pointed out the inconsistency between the Chinese and American reports. For example, the Swedish media commented that *the New York Times* report lacked authenticity and only showed the vicious images of police wielding batons and firing bullets at 'innocent citizens'. However, research on news content through qualitative methods is limited. I try to research the overall tone of the framing, which also reflects the influence of news. The tone contains four aspects. These are positive, negative, neutral, and not applicable. The hypotheses proposed in this research are also mainly focused on the specific tone of framing.

China censorship

China's mainland, Hong Kong, and the United States have different censorship systems.

Relatively, China mainland's censorship system is stricter and involves more details. In terms of media production in China mainland, The National Radio and Television Administration has the greatest power (Chan, 2020). Its primary duties are to regulate the screen media of state-owned production outlets, formulate management regulations, review media content and quality, and inspect and coordinate the propaganda work of Chinese leaders. China mainland's censorship policy not only affects traditional media but also affects the production of Internet content, including social media and online video (Chan, 2020). China's mainland will enforce restrictions and increase censorship magnitude according to what the government and the Communist Party want to reduce exposure and the way in which the government wants the issue framed (Gueorguiev & Malesky, 2019). These contents include keywords or contents such as one-child policy adjustments, healthcare reforms, and negative government comments (Wu & Mai, 2019). According to research by Wu and Mai (2019), in addition to restricting media coverage, audience responses, and censorship magnitude within the country, the censorship system in Mainland China also prevents foreign websites and applications from being accessed by mainland Chinese Internet users through the Great Firewall, such as Facebook, Google, and yelp.

Hong Kong's censorship system is relatively complicated. Since the handover of Hong Kong's sovereignty in 1997, Hong Kong's cultural production has gradually become linked to the

mainland's cultural production. The Hong Kong Special Administrative Region adopts the policy of one country, two systems, Hong Kong has its own relatively independent legal and economic system, and its media censorship system is relatively independent. With the gradual expansion of China's international influence, Hong Kong media can no longer ignore the influence of China mainland on Hong Kong's media cultural production (Frisch, Belair-Gagnon, & Agur., 2018).

Various studies have summarized the censorship system and content of mainland China (Jingyi, 2017; Gueorguiev & Malesky, 2019; Wu & Mai, 2019; Chan, 2020; Hassid, 2020) , and the censorship system of Hong Kong (Frisch, Belair-Gagnon, & Agur., 2018; Chan, 2020). However, they overlooked an important issue, which is how much more strictly is the censorship system in Mainland China compared to that in Hong Kong in relation to the coverage of the same news incident.

Research Questions

The purpose of this study is to explore the differences in the news reporting framing of different organizations in the same event. Therefore, based on different political factors in China, Hong Kong, and the United States, I recommend the following research questions (RQ):

RQ1: In a news report covering the 2019 Hong Kong protests, what is the difference in the tone of protests among *New York Times*, *Southern Metropolis Daily*, and *Ming Pao*?

RQ2: In a news report covering the 2019 Hong Kong protests, what is the difference in the tone of protesters among *New York Times*, *Southern Metropolis Daily*, and *Ming Pao*?

RQ3: In a news report covering the 2019 Hong Kong protests, what is the difference in the tone of government officials among *New York Times*, *Southern Metropolis Daily*, and *Ming Pao*?

RQ4: In a news report covering the 2019 Hong Kong protests, what are the keywords among *New York Times*, *Southern Metropolis Daily*, and *Ming Pao*?

Chapter Three: Method

Content Analysis

As an emerging form of traditional media in line with the Internet era, electronic newspapers retain the authority of traditional media and the convenience of emerging media. Therefore, this research used electronic versions of mainstream Chinese and American media as the source of information.

The New York Times, *the Southern Metropolis Daily*, and *the Ming Pao* were selected as the newspaper organization for the research. *Southern Metropolis Daily* is a newspaper published in China mainland. It was officially released the same year that Hong Kong returned to China in 1997. Ranked first in the country's overall competitiveness (Du & Han, 2020). It mostly takes a relatively free stance (Yuli, 2017). *The New York Times* is a daily newspaper published in New York, USA. It has a history of 169 years. It has a good reputation and authority (Jin, 2019; Nurhaliza & Tanto, 2019). Its influence is great. Many newspapers and news agencies around the world used it directly as a source of news (Jin, 2019). According to the Hong Kong University in 2016, the only newspaper with a neutral political stance among the top three Hong Kong local newspapers was Ming Pao. In order to maintain its credibility, Ming Pao's news reports emphasize the principle of objective reporting (Lee et al., 2004; Lee & Lin, 2006). Therefore, Ming Pao served as the news source for the Hong Kong local newspapers under this research.

To investigate the research questions, I conducted a content analysis of the Chinese newspaper *Southern Metropolis Daily* (<http://www.southcn.com/>), the American newspaper *New York Times* (<https://www.nytimes.com/>), and the Hong Kong's newspaper *Ming Pao* (<https://news.mingpao.com/pns/明報新聞網/main>). The news content was accessed by searching for the keywords "Hong Kong Protest", "2019 Hong Kong", "Hong Kong government", "Hong Kong police", "Anti-amendment", "Chinese government" and "Hong Kong" in the archived news reports of the three websites. Only news stories were selected and other articles were removed, such as web logs, book reviews, and biographies. Manually remove content unrelated to the 2019 Hong Kong protests based on the main content of the news.

My research randomly selected 120 reports on related topics in the *New York Times*, *Southern Metropolis Daily*, and *Ming Pao* during July 1 and September 4 in 2019 as the research sample. July 1st is a sign of the intensification of the anti-regulation movement. September 4 is the day when the government announced the withdrawal of the amendment. The researcher numbered all the search results of the three media organizations and randomly selected 40 related articles from different media. The researcher first coded 10 related news in order to perfect the codebook for this research. Through four meetings with the second coder, some guidelines in the coding book were redefined to make them more clearly and accurately. For example, after precoding, the public's attitude toward the Hong Kong police is also classified as the tone of government official. For intercoder reliability, two researchers participated in the coding process.

Coder 1 and Coder 2 coded the entire sample respectively, and our coded data Krippendorff's alpha was 0.877. This result confirms the validity and reliability of the codebook.

The data collection period started in August 2020 and ended in September 2020. The coding date was from September 16th, 2020 to October 14th, 2020.

Word Cloud

This part adopts the word frequency analysis method and uses the online word frequency analysis software WordArt (<https://wordart.com>) to quantitatively analyze the core content of news samples and the frequency of keywords. By importing 120 news texts of the 2019 Hong Kong protests into WordArt. After artificially filtering modal particles, prepositions, pronouns, numerals and meaningless words, the researcher recorded the top 20 most frequently used words. After removing irrelevant words, the top 100 words in appearance frequency were used to generate a word cloud plot.

Coding Procedures

The first step in the coding phase is to record general information, including ID, newspaper organization, article date, author, article size (small: 1-500 words, medium: 501-1000 words, large: 1001+) and the presence of photos or not. Although the research does not include a visual frame, researchers can measure the overall tone of a picture into a news story whether it is positive or negative. Next, I will define news content based on previous research (Veneti, Karadimitriou & Poulakidakos, 2016; Zhang, et al., 2018). Then, researchers should code the frame of the news. According to the research questions on the investigation of news tone, this

research will define four kinds of news tones according to the code book, including positive, neutral, negative, and not applicable. Finally, in order to be able to check whether reporting by the different newspapers included a sufficient difference in frames of protest, protesters, and political officials, I will generate a word cloud image to check the frequency of keywords in the news. The research will use SPSS 24.0 for quantitative analysis and data entry for detailed results.

Coding Book

For news articles, based on previous research (Zhang, et al., 2018), the analysis will use 11 issues related to the 2019 Hong Kong protests: (1) Hong Kong legislation, (2) Protests (e.g., repatriation demonstrations), (3) Finance / Economy/ Travel, (4) Crime (whether the protest was violent), (5) Chinese government response (official response, press conference, police response), (6) Public opinion, (7) A historical review of Beijing-Hong Kong relations, (8) International response, (9) China's democracy / human rights issues, (10) Military intervention, (11) Others.

For the tone coding of the issues is based on the existing studies and the following results were obtained (Yu & Liu, 2015; Veneti, Karadimitriou & Poulakidakos, 2016; Zhang, et al., 2018). The code for the protests is as follows: (1) Positive (for example, political freedom, peaceful protest, protest is a process of democratic movement, etc.), (2) Neutral / Mixed (No obvious attitude / both positive and negative content included), (3) Negative (for example, affecting social order, intensifying social unrest, inciting other countries, shaking the Communist Party of China, etc.), (4) Not applicable (unsuitable or no relevant content in the news).

The protesters are coded as follows: (1) Positive (for example, democratic leaders, freedom fighters, and good neighbor, etc.), (2) Neutral / Mixed (No obvious attitude / both positive and negative content included), (3) Negative (violent, split, illegal, etc.), (4) Not applicable (unsuitable or no relevant content in the news). Similarly, for each news article, the coder can only choose one frame and one emotional attribute.

The codes for government and government officials are as follows: (1) Positive (for example, the Chinese government takes timely measures, the Hong Kong police defend justice, and promptly stops violence, etc.), (2) Neutral / Mixed (No obvious attitude / both positive and negative content included), (3) Negative (for example, excessive use of force by the Hong Kong police, government harmed anti-government protesters, government attempts to control public opinion, etc.), (4) Not applicable (unsuitable or no relevant content in the news).

Chapter Four: Result

Before analyzing the results, the researchers analyzed the reliability of the encoder, which is also the basic condition for the effectiveness of content analysis (Lombard et al., 2002; Fuchs et al., 2020). Two coders worked on reliability testing. After they coded 40 random news articles independently, the value of Krippendorff's alpha (α) evaluated the reliability of the existing coding books. By comparison, the intercoder reliability Krippendorff's alpha between Coder 1 and Coder 2 was .877. The differences in reliability testing have been discussed and resolved.

There are two steps to examine the research question through content analysis. The first step is to verify that if the p-value of the chi-square test is less than 0.05, it means that there is a significant difference between at least two newspapers. If the p-value is less than 0.05, the researcher will use the paired z test to analyze the differences between specific newspapers.

Overall coverage

This research explores news frames of the 2019 Hong Kong Protest across media and nations to establish possible frameshifts within American, China mainland, and Hong Kong newspapers. This research attempts to answer these questions.

RQ1: In a news report covering the 2019 Hong Kong protests, what is the difference in the tone of protests among the *New York Times*, *Southern Metropolis Daily*, and *Ming Pao*?

RQ2: In a news report covering the 2019 Hong Kong protests, what is the difference in the tone of protesters among the *New York Times*, *Southern Metropolis Daily*, and *Ming Pao*?

RQ3: In a news report covering the 2019 Hong Kong protests, what is the difference in the tone of government officials among the *New York Times*, *Southern Metropolis Daily*, and *Ming Pao*?

RQ4: In a news report covering the 2019 Hong Kong protests, what are the keywords among the *New York Times*, *Southern Metropolis Daily*, and *Ming Pao*?

There are two steps to examine the research question through content analysis. The first step is to verify that if the p-value of the chi-square test is less than 0.05, it means that there is a significant difference between at least two newspapers. If the p-value is less than 0.05, the researcher will use the paired z test to analyze the differences between specific newspapers. Table 1 lists the main themes of the 2019 Hong Kong protests in the news samples. Previous research proved that the topic of news content can predict cultural, political, and communication trends (Lypka & Werder, 2011). It will help us to have a better understanding of the results. In the *New York Times*, there is more content about protests (45%), public opinion (12.5%), China's democracy/ human rights issues (12.5%). In the *Southern Metropolis Daily*, there is more Chinese government response (40%), crime (15%), and public opinion (15%). In the *Ming Pao*, the more news topic includes protests (62.5%) and public opinion (17.5%). Overall, more news on the 2019 Hong Kong Protests includes protests themselves (38.3%), followed by Chinese

government response (15%) and public opinion (15%). Reports rarely deal with Hong Kong legislation (1.7%) and military intervention (1.7%).

RQ1. Protests News Tone

The first research question is trying to explore the difference in the tone of protest between the *New York Times*, *Southern Metropolis Daily* and *Ming Pao*. Table 2 indicates that there are indeed differences in the tone of attention to protests in the news among the three newspapers ($X^2=51.33$, $df= 6$, $p<.001$). The paired z-test in Table 3 provides specific details. The minimum expected count is 6.7, which is greater than five. It shows that our data is reliable. On the whole, the media's news tone about the protests has more negative ($n=50$, 41.7%), followed by neutral ($n=29$, 24.2%) and positive ($n=20$, 16.7%). The *New York Times* ($n=16$, 40%) reported more positive news on the 2019 Hong Kong protests than *Southern Metropolis Daily* ($n=0$, 0%) and *Ming Pao* ($n=4$, 10%). The *Southern Metropolis Daily* ($n=29$, 72.5%) reported more negative protests news than *Ming Pao* ($n=14$, 35%) and *New York Times* ($n=7$, 17.5%).

RQ2. Protesters News Tone

The second research question is trying to solve the difference in the tone of protesters between the *New York Times*, *Southern Metropolis Daily* and *Ming Pao*. Table 4 points out that there are indeed differences in the tone of attention to protests in the news among the three newspapers ($X^2=29.48$, $df= 6$, $p<.001$). Table 5 demonstrates the paired z-test between protesters and organizations. Entirely, most of the news were negative ($n=59$, 49.2%) about the tone of the protesters. In the sample randomly selected by the *Southern Metropolis Daily*, there was no

positive voice of protesters (n=0, 0%). It is significantly less than the *New York Times* (n=13, 32.5%) and *Ming Pao* (n=9, 22.5%). The tone of the negative protesters in the *Southern Metropolis Daily* (n=29, 72.5%) was obviously more than *New York Times* (n=14, 35%) and *Ming Pao* (n=16, 40%).

RQ3. Government and Government officials News Tone

The third research question is trying to work out the difference in the tone of Chinese government between the *New York Times*, *Southern Metropolis Daily* and *Ming Pao*. Table 6 reveals that there are indeed differences between the three newspapers in the reports of the Chinese government, the Hong Kong government, and the Hong Kong police ($X^2 = 82.32$, $df = 6$, $p < .001$). Table 7 contains some details through paired z-test value. The *New York Times* (n=1, 2.5%), *Southern Metropolis Daily* (n=28, 70%), and *Ming Pao*'s (n=8, 20%) positive news on the government are completely different in statistical significance. Similarly, in the reports of the Hong Kong protests in 2019, the *New York Times* (n=32, 80%), *Southern Metropolis Daily* (n=0, 0%) and *Ming Pao* (n=18, 45%) had different rates of negative tone towards the government.

RQ4. Key words

The last research question is trying to seek the different key words between the *New York Times*, *Southern Metropolis Daily* and *Ming Pao*. This research uses WordArt to perform word frequency analysis on 120 samples. Figure 1 shows the word cloud of the *New York Times*. The *New York Times*' word frequency analysis showed that "China" is the number one meaningful word, reaching 216 times, with an average of 5.4 times per article. Its related terms also include

“Beijing”, “mainland China”, “government”, and “the United States”. Among the top 20 high-frequency words, another theme is democracy. The order of the frequency of related words is “support”, “democracy”, and “freedom”.

The *Southern Metropolis Daily* used a lot of negative vocabulary in its report on the 2019 Hong Kong legislative amendment. Among them, "violence" is the number one meaningful high-frequency vocabulary, reaching 104 times, with an average of 2.6 times per article. Among the top 20 high-frequency words related to violence are “mob”, “serious”, and “destruction”. The order from high to low is “society”, “law”, “citizens”, “economy”, “support”, “police”, “development”, and “stability”. The word cloud image generated according to word frequency is in Figure 2.

The researcher imported the 40 new published by *Ming Pao* into WordArt in chronological order. Then I used the software to generate the results of the word cloud (Figure 3). The word with the highest vocabulary frequency is “government”, with 165 words appearing, with an average of 4.1 times per report. *Ming Pao* focuses on presenting the positions, attitudes, and actions of administrative, legislative, and political groups related to the 2019 Hong Kong Protests. “Chief Executive”, “Carrie Lam”, “Amendment”, “Legislation”, “Bill”, “Political” and “Fugitive” are all words that appear frequently.

Table 1 Media Coverage Main Topic

| Topic | | | Organizations | | | Total |
|---|-----------------------|-----------------|-----------------|---------------------------|----------|-------|
| | | | New York Times | Southern Metropolis Daily | Ming Pao | |
| Hong Kong Legislation | Count | 1 _a | 1 _a | 0 _a | 2 | |
| | % within Organization | 2.5% | 2.5% | 0.0% | 1.7% | |
| Protests/ Demonstrations | Count | 18 _a | 3 _b | 25 _a | 46 | |
| | % within Organization | 45.0% | 7.5% | 62.5% | 38.3% | |
| Finance/ Economy | Count | 0 _a | 5 _a | 0 _a | 5 | |
| | % within Organization | 0.0% | 12.5% | 0.0% | 4.2% | |
| Crime | Count | 1 _a | 6 _a | 3 _a | 10 | |
| | % within Organization | 2.5% | 15.0% | 7.5% | 8.3% | |
| Chinese Government Response | Count | 0 _a | 16 _b | 2 _a | 18 | |
| | % within Organization | 0.0% | 40.0% | 5.0% | 15.0% | |
| Public Opinion | Count | 5 _a | 6 _a | 7 _a | 18 | |
| | % within Organization | 12.5% | 15.0% | 17.5% | 15.0% | |
| Historical of Review of Beijing-Hong Kong Relations | Count | 4 _a | 0 _a | 0 _a | 4 | |
| | % within Organization | 10.0% | 0.0% | 0.0% | 3.3% | |
| International Response | Count | 2 _a | 2 _a | 0 _a | 4 | |
| | % within Organization | 5.0% | 5.0% | 0.0% | 3.3% | |
| China's Democracy/ Human Rights Issues | Count | 5 _a | 1 _a | 0 _a | 6 | |
| | % within Organization | 12.5% | 2.5% | 0.0% | 5.0% | |
| Military Intervention | Count | 1 _a | 0 _a | 1 _a | 2 | |
| | % within Organization | 2.5% | 0.0% | 2.5% | 1.7% | |
| Others | Count | 3 _a | 0 _a | 2 _a | 5 | |
| | % within Organization | 7.5% | 0.0% | 5.0% | 4.2% | |
| Total | Count | 40 | 40 | 40 | 120 | |
| | % within Organization | 100.0% | 100.0% | 100.0% | 100.0% | |

Each subscript letter denotes a subset of Organization categories whose column proportions do not differ significantly from each other at the .05 level.

Table 2 Protests Chi-Square Tests

| | Value | df | Asymptotic Significance (2-sided) |
|------------------------------|---------------------|----|-----------------------------------|
| Pearson Chi-Square | 51.329 ^a | 6 | .000 |
| Likelihood Ratio | 59.417 | 6 | .000 |
| Linear-by-Linear Association | 11.291 | 1 | .001 |
| N of Valid Cases | 120 | | |

a. 0 cells (0.0%) have expected count less than 5. The minimum expected count is 6.67.

Table 3 Protests * Organizations Crosstabulation

| | | Organizations | | | | |
|----------|-----------------------|-----------------------|-----------------|---------------------------|-----------------|-------|
| | | | New York Times | Southern Metropolis Daily | Ming Pao | Total |
| Protests | Positive | Count | 16 _a | 0 _b | 4 _b | 20 |
| | | Expected Count | 6.7 | 6.7 | 6.7 | 20.0 |
| | | % within Organization | 40.0% | 0.0% | 10.0% | 16.7% |
| | Neutral | Count | 14 _a | 1 _b | 14 _a | 29 |
| | | Expected Count | 9.7 | 9.7 | 9.7 | 29.0 |
| | | % within Organization | 35.0% | 2.5% | 35.0% | 24.2% |
| | Negative | Count | 7 _a | 29 _b | 14 _a | 50 |
| | | Expected Count | 16.7 | 16.7 | 16.7 | 50.0 |
| | | % within Organization | 17.5% | 72.5% | 35.0% | 41.7% |
| | Not applicable | Count | 3 _a | 10 _a | 8 _a | 21 |
| | | Expected Count | 7.0 | 7.0 | 7.0 | 21.0 |
| | | % within Organization | 7.5% | 25.0% | 20.0% | 17.5% |
| Total | Count | 40 | 40 | 40 | 120 | |
| | Expected Count | 40.0 | 40.0 | 40.0 | 120.0 | |
| | % within Organization | 100.0% | 100.0% | 100.0% | 100.0% | |

Each subscript letter denotes a subset of Organization categories whose column proportions do not differ significantly from each other at the .05 level.

Table 4 Protesters Chi-Square Tests

| | Value | df | Asymptotic Significance (2-sided) |
|------------------------------|---------------------|----|-----------------------------------|
| Pearson Chi-Square | 29.482 ^a | 6 | .000 |
| Likelihood Ratio | 37.479 | 6 | .000 |
| Linear-by-Linear Association | 2.864 | 1 | .091 |
| N of Valid Cases | 120 | | |

a. 3 cells (25.0%) have expected count less than 5. The minimum expected count is 4.67.

Table 5 Protesters * Organizations Crosstabulation

| | | Organizations | | | Total | |
|------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------|--------------------|-------|
| | | New York Times | Southern Metropolis Daily | Ming Pao | | |
| Protesters | Positive | Count | 13 _a | 0 _b | 9 _a | 22 |
| | | Expected Count | 7.3 | 7.3 | 7.3 | 22.0 |
| | | % within Organization | 32.5% | 0.0% | 22.5% | 18.3% |
| | Neutral | Count | 12 _a | 3 _b | 10 _{a, b} | 25 |
| | | Expected Count | 8.3 | 8.3 | 8.3 | 25.0 |
| | | % within Organization | 30.0% | 7.5% | 25.0% | 20.8% |
| | Negative | Count | 14 _a | 29 _b | 16 _a | 59 |
| | | Expected Count | 19.7 | 19.7 | 19.7 | 59.0 |
| | | % within Organization | 35.0% | 72.5% | 40.0% | 49.2% |
| | Not applicable | Count | 1 _a | 8 _b | 5 _{a, b} | 14 |
| | | Expected Count | 4.7 | 4.7 | 4.7 | 14.0 |
| | | % within Organization | 2.5% | 20.0% | 12.5% | 11.7% |
| Total | Count | 40 | 40 | 40 | 120 | |
| | Expected Count | 40.0 | 40.0 | 40.0 | 120.0 | |
| | % within Organization | 100.0% | 100.0% | 100.0% | 100.0% | |

Each subscript letter denotes a subset of Organization categories whose column proportions do not differ significantly from each other at the .05 level.

Table 6 Government Chi-Square Tests

| | Value | df | Asymptotic Significance (2-sided) |
|------------------------------|---------------------|----|-----------------------------------|
| Pearson Chi-Square | 82.318 ^a | 6 | .000 |
| Likelihood Ratio | 107.350 | 6 | .000 |
| Linear-by-Linear Association | .867 | 1 | .352 |
| N of Valid Cases | 120 | | |

a. 0 cells (0.0%) have expected count less than 5. The minimum expected count is 5.00.

Table 7 Government * Organizations Crosstabulation

| | | Organizations | | | Total | |
|------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------|-----------------|-------|
| | | New York Times | Southern Metropolis Daily | Ming Pao | | |
| Government | Positive | Count | 1 ^a | 28 ^b | 8 ^c | 37 |
| | | Expected Count | 12.3 | 12.3 | 12.3 | 37.0 |
| | | % within Organization | 2.5% | 70.0% | 20.0% | 30.8% |
| | Neutral | Count | 7 ^a | 0 ^b | 8 ^a | 15 |
| | | Expected Count | 5.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 15.0 |
| | | % within Organization | 17.5% | 0.0% | 20.0% | 12.5% |
| | Negative | Count | 32 ^a | 0 ^b | 18 ^c | 50 |
| | | Expected Count | 16.7 | 16.7 | 16.7 | 50.0 |
| | | % within Organization | 80.0% | 0.0% | 45.0% | 41.7% |
| | Not applicable | Count | 0 ^a | 12 ^b | 6 ^b | 18 |
| | | Expected Count | 6.0 | 6.0 | 6.0 | 18.0 |
| | | % within Organization | 0.0% | 30.0% | 15.0% | 15.0% |
| Total | Count | 40 | 40 | 40 | 120 | |
| | Expected Count | 40.0 | 40.0 | 40.0 | 120.0 | |
| | % within Organization | 100.0% | 100.0% | 100.0% | 100.0% | |

Each subscript letter denotes a subset of Organization categories whose column proportions do not differ significantly from each other at the .05 level.



Figure 1 Word cloud of keywords in the New York Times

Chapter Five: Discussion

The content analysis results showed that there were differences in the frames used in reporting the 2019 Hong Kong protests in the US media (*New York Times*), Mainland Chinese media (*Southern Metropolis Daily*), and Hong Kong media (*Ming Pao*).

Media coverage of the Hong Kong protests in 2019 involved multiple themes, the most popular of which were the theme of the protests (n=46, 38.3%), the Chinese government's response (n=18, 15%), and public opinion (n=18, 15%). Most newspapers still report on protests and conflicts.

Entman said, "a frame selects some aspects of a perceived reality and makes them more salient in a communicating text." (1993, p. 52; Sherwood, Donaldson, Dyson, Lowden, Marjoribanks, Shill, Bolam & Nicholson, 2020). What the framework highlights are the core theme. The analysis of the news media framework in this study is to summarize the core themes and secondary themes. Summarize the core themes in the three media organizations and compare the differences between them.

Differences in the protests framing

In *Southern Metropolis Daily*'s news on the protests, the core theme is to oppose violent protests that are harmful to "one country, two systems." Compared with the *New York Times* (17.5%) and *Ming Pao* (35%), *Southern Metropolis Daily* has the most negative reports about

protests (72.5%). The news has repeatedly pointed out that the violent protests were instigated by anti-China forces, which disrupted Hong Kong's social order through violent activities and affected Hong Kong's development. Journalists gathered a lot of space to discuss how protests disrupted Hong Kong's order and harmed Hong Kong's economy. They used a lot of strong verbs, like provoking, trampling, serious, shocking.

The protests theme of the *New York Times* is the movement for democracy. The *New York Times* has the most positive protests (40%), compared with *Southern Metropolis Daily* (0%) and *Ming Pao* (10%). The *New York Times* proposed that the protest was an activity to express the wishes of Hong Kong residents to the Chinese Communist Party. The protest was initially peaceful, and the protest was a necessary process for the democratic movement. As Ai Weiwei wrote in the news, the protests under the framework of the *New York Times* "this is a struggle about human values, freedom, justice, and dignity" (2019).

The core theme of *Ming Pao* is that protests affect social order. *Ming Pao's* proposed amendments caused social tears. Its protester's news tone includes positive (10%), neutral (35%), and negative (35%). The continued protests have seriously affected the economic situation of Hong Kong. Tourism, as an important proportion of Hong Kong's GPA (U, S.-C. & So, Y.-C., 2020), has been severely affected by the epidemic. The strikes called by the protesters have also led to poor performance in Hong Kong's retail and real estate industries. The wounded in the police-civil conflict, the young arrested and the Hong Kong citizens whose traffic was blocked are all victims of this protest.

Differences in the protesters framing

In the report on the protesters, the central theme of the *Southern Metropolis Daily* is to oppose the extreme behavior of radicals. The *Southern Metropolis Daily*'s protesters' news tone was mostly negative (72.5%). These irrational behaviors accounted for a lot of coverage. The protesters dropped the Chinese flag, held illegal and violent rallies at the airport, and attacked the legislative committee. Similar behaviors such as painting the national emblem to challenge the Chinese central government have also appeared many times.

The subject of the *New York Times* is liberal protesters fighting the Chinese government. The report had expressed the thoughts and actions of the protesters through interspersed interview records of the protesters many times. For example, it was mentioned in the news that several food shop owners delivered food to protesters, sold moon cakes with the words “fighting”, and provided free food to protesters. Their actions played up the atmosphere of the Hong Kong democracy movement in the news.

The core theme of *Ming Pao* is protesters who express their appeals reasonably. The news tone of *Ming Pao* protesters was positive (22.5%), neutral (25%), and negative (40%). *Ming Pao* stated that protests were acts of Hong Kong citizens to express their demands reasonably, but violence was violence. *Ming Pao* reflected that most Hong Kong people are peaceful, rational, and non-violent. It condemned another group of radical violent thugs. *Ming Pao* had been calling on young people to calm down and stop irrational behavior in the news, but also to the Hong Kong police.

Differences in the government framing

Regarding reports of protests against the Chinese government, the core theme of the framework of the *Southern Metropolis Daily* is that the Chinese mainland government supports all the work of the Hong Kong government and the Hong Kong police. The secondary theme is to oppose other countries' interference in China's internal affairs. Its news tone about the government is only positive (70%) and not applicable (30%). Reports from the Mainland Chinese media involved supporting the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region government to carry out FOAB, supporting the Hong Kong police to quickly stop the riots, and opposing other countries' interference in China's internal affairs. For example, after protesters attacked the Legislative Council, the government spokesperson affirmed the necessity of Hong Kong amending the FOAB at this stage. He strongly condemned the demonstrators for violently attacking the Legislative Council and said that they would be held accountable to the end. The “timely” stop put to the protest by the Hong Kong police was also highly praised and understood by him. Most stories solemnly stated that "China expresses its strong dissatisfaction and firm opposition to relevant countries' gross interference in Hong Kong affairs and China's internal affairs (Baimei He, 2019)." The Chinese media reported in the news that foreign politicians participated in the protests.

The theme of the *New York Times* is that the Chinese mainland government and the Hong Kong government are united. The *New York Times's* news tone for the Chinese government is positive (2.5%), neutral (17.5%), and negative (80%). The Chinese government's authoritarian

propaganda, the Hong Kong government's strong force to clear the field, Beijing's overwhelming regime, and the operation of the Chinese Communist Party under the shadow, these examples were all negative descriptions of the Chinese government in the *New York Times* news.

The core theme of *Ming Pao* is to criticize the Hong Kong government. The news tone of *Ming Pao*'s news about the Chinese government is positive (20%), neutral (20%), and negative (45%). *Ming Pao* had repeatedly questioned Carrie Lam's political actions, such as responding to the public's slowness, judging the sentiment of the Hong Kong citizen wrong, having some contradictory meanings in the responses, and avoiding responses many times. The response is difficult to justify, and he has repeatedly avoided the response. Some news reports even attributed the expansion of the protest to Carrie Lam's political ability. Many news criticized the government for condoning violence, caused by political reasons. Also, the decision to suspend the amendments caused the Hong Kong government to lose popular support.

Differences in vocabulary frequency

The results of the word cloud map have been considered among different topics in the news framework. The following is the overall situation.

The word cloud image of *Southern Metropolis Daily* showed that its top word is "violence" (Figure 2). At the same time, the vocabulary related to violence, "mob", "serious", and "destruction" were also at the forefront. This also showed the consequences of *Southern*

Metropolis Daily's preference for violent activities against the amendment. The report described violence disrupting Hong Kong's social and economic order.

The word cloud results of the *New York Times* showed that the most common word was "China" (Figure 1). The word cloud image of the New York Times stated two topics. One was the discussion of the national social systems of China and the United States. It could be seen from the keywords "Beijing", "mainland China", "government", and "the United States". The second theme was democracy, including "support", "democracy", and "freedom".

In the results of the word cloud, the first two keywords of *Ming Pao* were "government" and "police" (Figure 3). *Ming Pao's* news mostly explained related politics, opinions, the content of the amendments, and public attitudes. "Chief Executive", "Carrie Lam", "Amendment", "Legislation", "Bill", "Political" and "Fugitive" are all words that appear frequently. The Hong Kong community has started to discuss the amendments since the Hong Kong government proposed to amend FOAB on May 30, 2019. "Amendments" appeared 115 times in *Ming Pao* in this research. *Ming Pao's* news mostly explained the relevant politics, opinions, content, and public attitudes regarding the amendment.

Overall, in the *Southern Metropolis Daily*, the news framing is more inclined to report the country's response information (43%), such as official responses, press conferences, and responses from the Ministry of Foreign Affairs. This frequently-recurring theme news content reflects the media framing of *Southern Metropolis Daily*. It is not difficult to see that, as the content of various government responses is very large, the content of the news is mainly carried

out from the perspective of the Chinese government. The word cloud map of *Southern Metropolis Daily* also shows that its first core theme is “violence” (Figure 2). In a word, the *Southern Metropolis Daily* described the 2019 Hong Kong protests as a political movement harmful to the principle, ‘one country, two systems’. The most interesting thing is that in the random sample selected by the researchers, there was almost zero negative information about the government and zero positive information about protesters. Some reports do not even mention relevant information, however, the above content will never appear. This is because of the media censorship mechanism in Mainland China.

In *the New York Times*, journalists prefer to focus on the framing of the conflict between police and protesters (45%). *The New York Times* mainly focused on reporting on the hegemony of the Chinese government, the self-reporting of democrats, China's censorship system, and the chaos caused by protests. The word cloud results show that the most frequently occurring words are “Hong Kong” and “China”. In short, the core theme of *the New York Times* news is to advocate democratic voices, for example, the voices of protesters, the future of Hong Kong, and Beijing's attitude toward Hong Kong.

In the *Ming Pao*, the media mainly report on protests (63%), and the media mainly report on public opinion surveys (18%). In the results of the word cloud, the first two keywords of *Ming Pao* were government and police. *Ming Pao*'s news has a more comprehensive description and explanation of the 2019 Hong Kong protests, legislation, and public opinion. Hong Kong media's reports during the protests focused on the political analysis of the Hong Kong

government and chief executive, regarding the opinions of various aspects of the amendment, and protests scenes. For example, after FOAB was initially launched, Ming Pao took a public opinion poll on this news and told the story before and after the amendment and the cause of the protests. The core theme of *Ming Pao's* reports is to reflect and criticize the actions of the participants and the government in the 2019 Hong Kong protests.

Political Reasons for Different Frameworks

There is a question, why are their framings so different?

According to the arguments drawn by Hibbert, Pearson, and Schram, the media always has the shape and color of the social and political structure to which it belongs (1963). We learned that the most fundamental reason for the different media frameworks of these three news organizations was their different social and political structures.

Hong Kong and Mainland China adopt the principle of one country, two systems in politics so that the two can coexist amicably. However, from an international perspective, these three news organizations have different reporting frames because they have different social systems. The Chinese mainland media under the socialist system, and the Hong Kong media and the American media under the capitalist system. For instance, the data of *Southern Metropolis Daily* is indeed statistically different from the other two news organizations, from this research.

In the study of "Why is the media what it is now?", some scholars proposed four media theories based on the relationship between social systems and media, including Soviet Communist theory, Authoritarian theory, Social Responsibility, and Libertarian theory (Siebert,

Peterson & Schramm, 1963). This section explored the reasons for the differences in the three media frameworks based on the theories they put forward.

Based on the understanding of the content of the book, we knew that the author came to the theory that China adopted the principle of authoritarianism, that was, a country that fully controlled the media, based on data in 1953 (Siebert, Peterson & Schramm, 1963). In modern times, some scholars also think so (Wu, 2020; Changdong, 2017; Stockmann & Gallagher, 2011).

In the news system of mainland China, the media is an organization that participates in political construction, the mouthpiece of the Chinese Communist Party, and the machine of the state. The media reports under the restrictions of the Chinese Communist Party, but it can also determine their service level and function level within a limited range (Siebert, Peterson & Schramm, 1963). News censorship in mainland China comes from strict self-censorship within the media and external state supervision (Hassid, J., 2020). Although *Southern Metropolis Daily* is a relatively neutral media in mainland China (Yuli W., 2017), it also needs to abide by China's censorship system. It must abide by the principles of the Chinese Communist Party as well as be subject to market orientation. Therefore, *Southern Metropolis Daily's* reports are all under the censorship system of the Chinese Communist Party. All media content should support national policies and contribute to the Chinese overall goals.

Hong Kong belongs to the Special Administrative Region of China, and China adopts the "one country, two systems" system. They also use different news systems. Since Hong Kong has

experienced British colonial rule, the media and political system have been deeply influenced by Britain. The United Kingdom set up a large number of laws to restrict the freedom of the press in Hong Kong. However, in the actual implementation process, Hong Kong enjoys a high degree of press freedom under the management of British civil servants (Cheng, 1997; Bereuter, 1997; Frisch, Belair-Gagnon & Agur, 2018). Hong Kong's current news media organizations have developed into a modern enterprise with independent legal personality through marketization (Lee, 2018). At present, no news union in Hong Kong has the power to manage all news media and journalists. Therefore, Hong Kong does not have the power of state review. In general, the characteristics of the Hong Kong media conform to the Libertarian theory, the "free market of views" and the "self-correction process". However, as the influence of mainland China has deepened, the self-discipline of Hong Kong media continues to deepen, but it will not surpass that of mainland China. For example, a news report in *Ming Pao* mentioned that Hong Kong movie stars' voices against protests may affect their chance of work in mainland China. Therefore, *Ming Pao* is a collection of information. It lists both positive and negative information, and then allows the audience to accept it which they want.

The American media was libertarian in the early years until the 20th century began to develop Social Responsibility (Siebert, Peterson & Schramm, 1963). The American media is controlled by media groups, in other words, the American media is in the hands of a few power classes (Siebert, Peterson & Schramm, 1963). The democratic government of the United States ensures that the country wants freedom of the press. This belief has existed for more than 230

years (Tichenor & Harris, 2010). This means that the censorship of the media in the United States is in a very free industry state (Mccallum, 2017). Some scholars believed that the power of the media and their near-monopoly status will entrust them with the obligation to assume social responsibility. This is also the current state of the American media (Siebert, Peterson & Schramm, 1963; McDaniel, Lown, & Malone, 2018; White & Boatwright, 2020). Therefore, many contents of the *New York Times* have debates of opinions.

To sum up, the four theories of media dialectically explain the relationship between the media and social systems of the three media in this research. As a result, the media presentation framework for the Hong Kong protests in 2019 is completely different.

Future directions and Limitations

This study uses a quantitative method, content analysis, to explore the differences in the reporting frameworks of the same event among the three media. It fills up the regret that most studies on the framework in the existing literature lack data support. The three newspapers located in mainland China, Hong Kong, and the United States, respectively, and the research discussed the differences in politics and media ideologies in the three regions. Future research directions can explore the influence of different regional economies on the media framework. Social media also played a considerable role in this event, which is also a future direction worthy of the research.

There is a limitation to this study. The sample size can also be expanded according to the characteristics of the Hong Kong protests in 2019. The study investigated the period time during

which the protests had a greater impact, but the protests continued. The protests may last longer.

Future research can also be based on different protest relations.

Chapter Six: Conclusion

This research analyzed the news reports of the 2019 Hong Kong protests through content analysis. The analysis results of the three news media organizations revealed different news framing. The research results indicated the different reporting directions, news topics, and news tone of the media. This article used the different analysis frameworks of news content in the three directions of protest, protester, and government. The research summarized the positive, neutral, and negative tone of news content through chi-square test and pairwise analysis. This research found that there are differences in the reporting frameworks of the three media, which are inseparable from their different social systems and different news systems.

References

- Ai Weiwei (2019). Can Hong Kong's struggle be won? *The New York Times*.
- Bereuter D (eds) (1997) Hong Kong's Reversion to the People's Republic of China: Hearing before the Committee on International Relations, *U.S. House of Representatives*. Washington, DC: Diane Publishing.
- Bosco, J. (2016). The sacred in urban political protests in Hong Kong. *International Sociology*, 31(4), 375–395.
- Boykoff, J. (2006). Framing dissent: Mass media coverage of the global justice movement. *New Political Science*, 28, 201–228.
- Chan Kin-wa. (2019, July 30). Hong Kong's elite athletes add voice to protests, pressing Carrie Lam to respond to the "demands of people." *South China Morning Post: Web Edition Articles*. Hong Kong.
- Chan, J. M., & Lee, C. C. (1984). The journalistic paradigm on civil protests: A case study of Hong Kong. In A. Arno & W. Dissanayake (Eds.), *The news media in national and international conflict* (pp. 183–202). Boulder, CO: Westview Press.
- Chan, M. M.-L. (2020). Remixing Chineseness: Censorship, disembodiment and the voice in Hong Kong digital media. *Journal of Chinese Cinemas*, 14(1), 1–15.

- Changdong Zhang. (2017). A Fiscal Sociological Theory of Authoritarian Resilience: *Developing Theory through China Case Studies. Sociological Theory*, 35(1), 39.
- Chen Yu-Han. (2019). The Controversy of the Amendment of Anti-Extradition in Hong Kong- Threat to the people of Hong Kong. *Holistica*, 10(3), 133–142.
- Cheng J (1997) *The Other Hong Kong Report. Hong Kong: Chinese University Press.*
- Dai, J., & Hyun, K. (2010). Global risk, domestic framing: Coverage of the North Korean nuclear test by US, Chinese, and South Korean news agencies. *Asian Journal of Communication*, 20, 299–317.
- Du, Q., & Han, Z. (2020). The framing of nuclear energy in Chinese media discourse: A comparison between national and local newspapers. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 245.
- Elizabeth Ho. (2020). Temporal Rifts in Hong Kong: The Slow Arts of Protest. 4(3), 619–644.
- Entman, R. M. (1993). Framing: Toward clarification of a fractured paradigm. *Journal of Communication*, 43, 51–58.
- Frisch, N., Belair-Gagnon, V., & Agur, C. (2018). Media capture with Chinese characteristics: Changing patterns in Hong Kong’s news media system. *Journalism*, 19(8), 1165.
- Fuchs, H., Aghajanzadeh, A., & Therkelsen, P. (2020). Identification of drivers, benefits, and challenges of ISO 50001 through case study content analysis. *Energy Policy*, 142.
- Gueorguiev, D. D., & Malesky, E. J. (2019). Consultation and selective censorship in China. *The Journal of Politics*, 81(4), 1539–1545.

- Hassid, J. (2020). Censorship, the Media, and the Market in China. *Journal of Chinese Political Science*, 25(2), 285.
- Jin, J. (2019). Political News Discourse Analysis Based on an Attitudinal Perspective of the Appraisal Theory--Taking the New York Times' Report China-DPRK Relations as an Example. *Theory and Practice in Language Studies*, 10, 1357.
- Jingyi Zhao. (2017). Hong Kong protests: A quantitative and bottom-up account of resistance against Chinese social media (sina weibo) censorship. *MedieKultur: Journal of Media and Communication Research*, 62.
- Katz, A. (2018). FROM THE EDITOR. Censorship, Then and Now. *Oncology Nursing Forum*, 45(2), 139–140.
- LEE FRANCIS L. F. (2018). Changing Political Economy of the Hong Kong Media. *China Perspectives*, 3 (114), 9.
- Lee, F. L. F., & Lin, A. M. Y. (2006). Newspaper editorial discourse and the politics of self-censorship in Hong Kong. *Discourse & Society*, 17(3), 331.
- Lee, F. L. F., Chen, H.-T., & Chan, M. (2017). Social media use and university students' participation in a large-scale protest campaign: The case of Hong Kong's Umbrella Movement. *Telematics and Informatics*, 34(2), 457–469.
- Lee, F.L.F., Chan, J.M., and So, C.Y.K. (2004, May) 'Politics of Objective Journalism in China's Hong Kong'. *International Communication Association Annual Convention*, New Orleans, USA.

- Lombard, H., Snyder-Duch, C., Bracken, C. (2002). Content analysis in mass communication: assessment and reporting of intercoder reliability. *Hum. Commun. Res.*, 28 (4), pp. 587-604,
- Lypka, A., & Werder, K. P. (2011). Framing 10/12 and 3/11 in American and European News. *University of South Florida.*
- MCCALLUM, J. (2017). U.S. Censorship, Violence, and Moral Judgement in a Wartime Democracy, 1941-1945. *Diplomatic History*, 41(3), 543–566.
- McDaniel, P. A., Lown, E. A., & Malone, R. E. (2018). US Media Coverage of Tobacco Industry Corporate Social Responsibility Initiatives. *Journal of Community Health*, 43(1), 117–127.
- McLeod, D. M., & Hertog, J. K. (1999). Social control, social change and the mass media's role in the regulation of protest groups. In D. Demers & K. Viswanath (Eds.), *Mass media, social control, and social change* (pp. 305–330). Ames: Iowa State University Press.
- Normile, D. (2019). Hong Kong protests hit universities: Clashes have had little impact on research, but long-term effects on schools are unclear. *Science*, 366(6468), 935.
- Nurhaliza, H., & Tanto, T. (2019). Representation of Indonesia's Judiciary of Ahok's Blasphemy Verdict in The New York Times Article "Rot at the Core": Blasphemy Verdict in Indonesia Dismays Legal Experts". *K@ta*, 21(2), 68–74.
- Scheufele, D. A. (1999). Framing as a theory of media effects. *Journal of Communication*, 49(1), 103–122.
- Schneider, C. J. (2011). Culture, Rap Music, "Bitch," and the Development of the Censorship Frame. *AMERICAN BEHAVIORAL SCIENTIST*, 1, 36.

- Shek, D. T. L. (2020). Protests in Hong Kong (2019–2020): A Perspective Based on Quality of Life and Well-Being. *Applied Research in Quality of Life*, 15(3), 619.
- Sherwood, M., Donaldson, A., Dyson, S., Lowden, D., Marjoribanks, T., Shill, J., Bolam, B., & Nicholson, M. (2020). Football, Media, and Homophobia: Public Framing of the First Pride Game in the Australian Football League. *Communication & Sport*, 8(4/5), 545–565.
- Shoemaker, P. J., & Reese S. D. (1996). Mediating the message (2nd ed.). *White Plains, NY: Longman*.
- Shuyong, L. (2011). A Brief History of Hongkong. *China Social Sciences Academic Press*.
- Siebert, F., Peterson, T., & Schramm, W. (1963). Four Theories of the Press: The Authoritarian, Libertarian, Social Responsibility, and Soviet Communist Concepts of What the Press Should Be and Do. *University of Illinois Press*.
- Stockmann, D., & Gallagher, M. E. (2011). Remote Control: How the Media Sustain Authoritarian Rule in China. *Comparative Political Studies*, 44(4), 436–467.
- Tewksbury, D., & Scheufele, D. A. (2007). Special Issue on Framing, Agenda Setting & Priming. *Journal of Communication*, 57(1), 1–181.
- Tichenor, D. J., & Harris, R. A. (2010). A History of the U.S. Political System: Ideas, Interests, and Institutions. *ABC-CLIO*.
- Tsang, S. Y.-S. (2004). A modern history of Hong Kong. *I.B. Tauris*.
- Tuchman, G. (1978). Making news: A study in the construction of reality. *New York: The Free Press*.

- U, S.-C., & So, Y.-C. (2020). The impacts of financial and non-financial crises on tourism: Evidence from Macao and Hong Kong. *Tourism Management Perspectives*, 33.
- Uberoi, P. (2018). Special Issue on 'Hong Kong: Identity, Intellectual History and Culture.'. *China Report*, 54(1), 1–14.
- Veneti, A., Karadimitriou, A., & Poulakidakos, S. (2016). Media Ecology and the Politics of Dissent: Representations of the Hong Kong Protests in The Guardian and China Daily. *Social Media + Society*, 2(3), 1.
- White, C. L., & Boatwright, B. (2020). Social media ethics in the data economy: Issues of social responsibility for using Facebook for public relations. *Public Relations Review*, 46(5).
- Wu, S., & Mai, B. (2019). Talking About and Beyond Censorship: Mapping Topic Clusters in the Chinese Twitter Sphere. *International Journal of Communication (Online)*, 5057.
- Wu, Y. (2020). Dynamics of policy change in authoritarian countries: a multiple-case study on China. *Journal of Public Policy*, 40(2), 236.
- Yu, M., & Liu, S. S. (2015). Framing Occupy Central: a content analysis of Hong Kong, American and British newspaper coverage. *University of South Florida*.
- Yu, M., & Liu, S. S. (2015). Framing Occupy Central: a content analysis of Hong Kong, American and British newspaper coverage. *University of South Florida*.
- Yuli W. (2017). 中國新聞傳媒的組織場域、領導風格與文化：以《南方周末》與《南方都市報》為例 / The Organizational Field, Leadership Style and Culture of the News Media

in China: The Southern Weekly and Southern Metropolis Daily Cases. *傳播研究與實踐*, 207.

Zhang, T., Khalitova, L., Myslik, B., Mohr, T. L., Kim, J. Y., & Kioussis, S. (2018). Comparing Chinese state-sponsored media's agenda-building influence on Taiwan and Singapore media during the 2014 Hong Kong Protest. *Chinese Journal of Communication*, 11(1), 66–87.

Zhang, T., Kim, J. Y., Mohr, T. L., Myslik, B. A., Khalitova, L., Golan, G. J., & Kioussis, S. (2017). Agenda-Building role of state-owned media around the world: 2014 Hong Kong protest case. *Journal of Public Relations Research*, 29(5), 238–254.

Zhu, Z. (2018). The Politics of China--Hong Kong Relations: Living with Distant Masters. *International Social Science Review*, 1, 1.