The Effects of Technical and Imagery-based Instruction on Aspiring Performing Artists’ Acquisition of Learning Newly Composed Pieces and Improvisation and on Listeners’ Perceived Expressivity

José Valentino Ruiz-Resto
University of South Florida, jyflute@yahoo.com

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcommons.usf.edu/etd

Part of the Music Commons, Other Education Commons, and the Theatre and Performance Studies Commons

Scholar Commons Citation
Ruiz-Resto, José Valentino, "The Effects of Technical and Imagery-based Instruction on Aspiring Performing Artists’ Acquisition of Learning Newly Composed Pieces and Improvisation and on Listeners’ Perceived Expressivity" (2016). USF Tampa Graduate Theses and Dissertations. https://digitalcommons.usf.edu/etd/6373

This Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by the USF Graduate Theses and Dissertations at Digital Commons @ University of South Florida. It has been accepted for inclusion in USF Tampa Graduate Theses and Dissertations by an authorized administrator of Digital Commons @ University of South Florida. For more information, please contact digitalcommons@usf.edu.
The Effects of Technical and Imagery-based Instruction on Aspiring Performing Artists’ Acquisition of Learning Newly Composed Pieces and Improvisation and on Listeners’ Perceived Expressivity

by

José Valentino Ruiz-Resto

A dissertation submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Music with a concentration in Music Education School of Music College of The Arts University of South Florida

Major Professor: C. Victor Fung, Ph.D.
Jennifer Bugos, Ph.D.
Robert Dedrick, Ph.D.
Kim McCormick, D.M.A.
Matthew McCutchen, Ph.D.
David A.Williams, Ph.D.

Date of Approval:
March 11, 2016

Keywords: mental imagery, imagery instruction, expressivity, learning, quality of life

Copyright © 2016, José Valentino Ruiz-Resto
DEDICATION

This dissertation is dedicated to my abuelo and abuela, Dr. José Resto Velez and Alicia Diaz de Resto

I further dedicate this study to my family, friends, fiancée, teachers, mentors, educators, scholars, lovers of music, and Jesus Christ.
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

In my effort to prepare this document, there are a handful of people I would like to recognize for their continual love, prayers, support, and guidance. Their belief in me has given me the strength to complete this study. First and foremost, I am beyond grateful to my Committee Chair, C. Victor Fung for his tremendous wisdom and tireless support that made this dissertation the most exciting journey in my academic career. To the members of my research committee, David Williams, Jennifer Bugos, Matthew McCutchen, Robert Dedrick, and Kim McCormick, I thank you for your love and incredible efforts in refining me as a researcher, educator, and performer. To Jack Heller, God bless you always. To my father and mother, words cannot express how much I love you. You both are my inspirations. To Abuela, te amo con todo mi corazón (I love you with all of my heart). To my sister, Christina, I love you so much. To my aunts, uncles, and cousins, we did it! To Sarah-Anne, thank you for your guidance. To Jason Sivill…Cognitium. To Jason Bombaugh, thank you for coming through for me in the last minute. To Samson Lu, thank you for your help and friendship. To my great buddies—Bruno, Jesse, Todd Jr., Galo, Ricky, Gio, Sam, Elias, Adolfo, Hunter, Cienna, and Mina—this season has been incredible with you guys. To my fiancée and best friend, Cortney Meghan Wells, your belief in me has given me the strength to push through the finish line. I love you eternally my queen! And to my God—Jesus Christ—you are the greatest source of my inspiration.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF FIGURES .............................................................................................................. vi

ABSTRACT .......................................................................................................................... vii

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION .................................................................................... 1
   Higher Education for Aspiring Performing Artist ......................................................... 2
   Music in Transition ....................................................................................................... 3
   Contributors of Artistic Development ........................................................................ 5
      Pedagogy and Learning Styles .............................................................................. 5
   Applied Lessons ......................................................................................................... 6
   Body Language in Applied Lessons ........................................................................... 8
   Support Systems for Student Development ............................................................. 9
   Philosopically Constructing Identity .......................................................................... 10
   Imagery for Expressivity and Learning .................................................................... 12
   Imagery for Improvisation ....................................................................................... 14
   Technology and Imagery for Learning .................................................................... 15
   Imagery in Master Classes ....................................................................................... 16
   The Performer’s Use of Imagery .............................................................................. 17
   The Role of Imagery for Awareness ....................................................................... 20
   Imagery for Meaningful Learning ........................................................................... 21
   Technical and Imagery-Based Instruction ................................................................ 24
   Research Purpose ..................................................................................................... 26
   Research Questions ................................................................................................... 27
   Hypotheses ................................................................................................................ 27
   Operational Definitions ............................................................................................ 28
      Mental Imagery ...................................................................................................... 28
      Expressivity ........................................................................................................... 29
      Performing Artist ................................................................................................. 29
      Musical Technique ............................................................................................... 30
      Technical Instruction .......................................................................................... 30
   T-I Instruction ........................................................................................................... 30

CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW ......................................................................... 31
   The Value of Imagery ............................................................................................... 31
   Historical Perspectives of Imagery .......................................................................... 32
   Operational Definition of Imagery .......................................................................... 34
   Addressing the Construct of the Review .................................................................. 35
   Theories of Imagery ................................................................................................. 36
   What It’s Used For? Practical Application of Imagery ............................................ 41
CHAPTER THREE: METHODS ................................................................. 65
Research Design ........................................................................... 65
Phase One ...................................................................................... 66
   Aspiring Performing Artists ....................................................... 66
   Newly Composed Pieces .......................................................... 69
   Play-along Tracks for Improvisation ......................................... 70
   The Instructions ......................................................................... 70
   Procedures ................................................................................ 71
   Itinerary for Aspiring Performing Artists ................................... 73
      Itinerary for Margaret ........................................................... 74
      Itinerary for James ............................................................... 75
      Itinerary for Greg ............................................................... 75
      Itinerary for Dylan ............................................................... 75
   Data Collection .......................................................................... 76
   Data Analysis ............................................................................ 78
Phase Two ...................................................................................... 78
   Listeners .................................................................................. 78
   Stimulus Recordings .................................................................. 79
   Perceived Expressivity Questionnaire ...................................... 80
   Procedures ................................................................................. 82
   Data Collection .......................................................................... 83
   Data Analysis ............................................................................ 83

CHAPTER FOUR: RESULTS ................................................................. 85
Phase One ...................................................................................... 86
   Background of Students .......................................................... 86
      Margaret .............................................................................. 86
      James ................................................................................. 87
      Greg .................................................................................. 88
      Dylan ................................................................................. 89
   Analysis of Qualitative Statements .......................................... 90
Research Question I. a. ................................................................. 93
Learning ....................................................................................... 93
   Fostered Emotional Connection ............................................... 93
Frame of Reference ......................................................... 174
Non-Threatening Environment ........................................ 175
Intrinsic Motivation ...................................................... 175
Self-Efficacy ............................................................... 176
Expressivity ............................................................... 176
Enjoyment for Learning ................................................ 177
Technical Facility ......................................................... 177
Cognition for Improvisation ............................................ 177
Modern Music Technology ............................................. 178
Quality of Life .................................................................. 178
Life Satisfaction ............................................................ 178
Multi-Faceted Musicianship ............................................. 179
Redefining Performing Artist ......................................... 179
Research Question I.b ..................................................... 180
Preference for Improvisation-learning Aspiring Performing
Artists ............................................................................. 180
Variability for Instruction ............................................... 181
Additional Support for T-I Instruction ......................... 182
Answers To Phase-Two Research Questions ................. 182
Low Internal Consistency of Listeners’ Ratings .................. 183
Research Question II. a ................................................. 186
Research Question II. b .................................................. 186
Research Question II. c .................................................. 187
Research Question II. d .................................................. 187
Research Question II. e .................................................. 187
Gains From The Study ................................................... 188
Induces Benefits in Learning ......................................... 189
Enriches Quality of Life ............................................... 190
Strengthens Improvisation Skills ................................ 190
Improves Cognitive Skills ............................................ 192
Improves Performances of Newly Composed Pieces ........ 192
Perceived Expressivity .................................................. 193
Implications for Performers & Music Educators ............ 194
Implications for Phase-One Findings ......................... 195
Implications for Phase-Two Findings ......................... 202
Transferability of the Study ............................................ 203
Limitations ..................................................................... 204
Future Research ............................................................ 205
Personal Reflection ........................................................ 208

REFERENCES ..................................................................... 211

APPENDICES .................................................................... 226
Appendix A: Perceived Expressivity Questionnaire .......... 226
Appendix B: Post-Lesson Reflection Journal .................... 236
Appendix C: Student Weekly Reflection Journal ............... 238
Appendix D: Bi-Weekly Interview Questions for Aspiring Performing Artists .......................................................... 239
Appendix E: Pre-Lesson Questionnaire for Aspiring Performing Artists .............................................................. 240
Appendix F: IRB Expedited Approval for Initial Review .......................................................... 242
Appendix G: IRB Expedited Approval for Amendment .......................................................... 244
Appendix H: IRB Expedited Approval for Continuing Review .................................................. 246

BIOGRAPHY ............................................................................................................................................... 248
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 3.1 Design of Phase One Model ......................................................... 76

Figure 4.1: T-I Instruction’s Influence on Aspiring Performing Artists’ Acquisition of Learning Newly Composed Pieces or Improvisation .......... 92

Figure 4.2: T-I Aspiring Performing Artists’ Feelings of T-I Instruction versus Technical Instruction in Applied Lessons ................................................. 146

Figure 4.3: T-I Listeners’ Reasons for Their Ratings of Perceived Expressivity ........................................................................................................ 159

Figure 4.4: Themes from The PEQ’s Brief Essay Response .............................. 162
ABSTRACT

The purpose of this study was to explore the union of technical and imagery-based instruction (hereinafter, T-I instruction) in two phases. Phase one: The researcher (1) explored T-I instruction’s influences on aspiring performing artists’ acquisition of learning and performing newly composed pieces and improvisation, and; (2) observed aspiring performing artists’ feelings of learning with T-I instruction versus technical instruction. Phase two: The researcher investigated (1) listeners’ perceived expressivity of aspiring performing artists’ performances that were either influenced by T-I instruction or technical instruction; (2) listeners’ perceived expressivity of aspiring performing artists’ performances of newly composed pieces versus improvisations; (3) whether there was a statistical significant difference of T-I instructions’ influence on the progressive differences in the means of listeners’ perceived expressivity between the aspiring performing artists across the time frame of the study; (4) the explanations for their ratings, and; (5) information that helps listeners perceive music as expressive using the Perceived Expressivity Questionnaire (PEQ).

Results for Phase one: 60 sub-themes and 13 themes emerged from the data relating to two meta-themes: Learning and Quality of Life. Results for Phase two: Cronbach’s alpha statistical procedure revealed an unacceptably low internal consistency for listeners’ perceived expressivity of aspiring performing artists’ performances ($\alpha = .02$). Hence, no further statistical analysis was implemented to answer research questions one through three. Explanations for their ratings dealt primarily with aspiring performing
artists’ use of 11 musical components. The Brief Essay Responses from the *Perceived Expressivity Questionnaire* (PEQ) provided possible explanations for the low internal consistency and insight on what kind of information help listeners’ perceive music as expressive. Further discussion on the finding and implications for performing artists and educators’ use of T-I instruction are offered in this document.
CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION

The power that the arts have on humanity is one that has been clearly evident, highly respected, and treasured for as long as civilizations have existed. In modern times, the occupation of performing artists can serve many purposes: to portray beauties and realities of the human condition (Portanova, 1975); to remind humanity of historical events that have wrought our existence (Watson, 1991); to bring forth honor and glory to the deity of a religion (Best, 2003); to comfort and uplift the spirits of those who need hope and direction (Wooten, 2008); and to bring forth new, inspiring, and innovative ideas for propelling humanity beyond comprehension (Shand, 1996). Artists’ mediums of expression have been utilized to project meaningful messages to people of all ages, backgrounds, cultures, and belief systems throughout history (Britan, 1908; Sacks, 2006).

The desire to become a performing artist is admirable and should be encouraged and nurtured with delicate consideration. Many adolescents have aspirations for developing their skills and talents professionally to obtain a satisfying performance career (Kenneson, 1998). These aspirations may have spawned from personal experiences: listening to a compelling performance, meaningful involvements in an organized or vernacular musical setting, meeting an iconic performer, evocative moments while viewing a stellar performance, and so forth.
Aspirations may also have spawned from personal desires: to connect with audiences emotionally and psychologically, to explore artistic boundaries within the art form, and to project beliefs and messages through performance (Park, Guptill, & Sumsien, 2007). Within the field of music performance many students enroll in private instruction and academia in hopes of receiving wisdom and guidance for blossoming in their crafts. However, a great concern among many educators is that students who graduate with a performance degree enter the music industry without having developed artistry in a multi-faceted, well-rounded fashion suitable for success (Burnett, 1996).

**Higher Education for Aspiring Performing Artists**

Musical institutions around the world foster students’ artistic development. Higher education models aim to cultivate students’ musicianship and artistry by providing a comprehensive curriculum aimed at preparing students for professional work in their field (Clark, 1986; Mark, 1982). For instance, theoretical and historical classes provide knowledge and understanding for music’s functions in various genres and its chronological development. Large ensemble courses aim to educate students’ values of selected literature, collaboration, sectional blending, unity in the midst of diversity, and one’s function in a larger entity (Hanson, 2005). Chamber ensembles promote democratic music making, leadership, interpersonal skills, and student autonomy (Bergie & Demorest, 2003; Williams, 2011). Applied lessons provide students with the opportunity to refine many facets of their artistic development – stage presence, expressivity, nuance, technical facility, aural discrimination skills,
improvisation, composition, and more (Barry, 2007; Schmidt, 1989; Sogin & Vallentine, 1992).

While these curricula are available, many aspiring performing artists aren’t seeing the fruits of their labor—employment opportunities to teach, produce, and perform music—after graduation. They are introduced to a music industry that functions differently than the model in which they were educated (Williams, 2011). Especially in jazz education, there is a systematic and academic approach to learning improvisation that is contradictory to the informal traditions of jazz (Prouty, 2002). Students fall into awkward positions trying to balance the weights of formal classroom methods with settings that are free and independent.

**Music in Transition**

Many researchers have underlined the importance of curricular and instructional reformation in music programs to assure students of better chances at succeeding within the music industry currently in transition (Hracs, 2012). In his TED talk, Ken Robinson (2007) lectured on the subject of traditional educational paradigms and instructions being the cause for the “killing” of students’ creative thinking and doing. He suggested that teachers should engage their students in creative projects without dismissing their imaginative ideas; rather, explore and apply them. In doing so, teachers could build students’ self-efficacy and spawn uncovered ideas and innovation.

The way people experience music in the modern 21st century is much different from the past (Bernard, 2007; Peluso, 2012). Due to the advancements of technology and media, people of the *information age* are customarily experiencing music in a
multi-sensory fashion (Hultén, 2011). Publicized performances often contain lavish lighting, dancers, costumes, visual effects, cameras for varied-angle viewing, and so forth. One attribute that is generally present among famous performers is participatory music making (Kokotsaki & Hallam, 2007; Toynbee, 2003). Famous artists aspire to win the appeal of the audience. From a business perspective, they understand that to win the audience is to advance in the field. Artists’ connectivity with audiences often leads them to gain respect, honor, and unwavering careers (Passman, 2012). These performance standards set the bar high for aspiring performing artists.

Many scholars and organizations have stressed the importance of relevancy in higher education (Green, 2007, 2009; Mark & Madura, 2013; O’Flynn, 2006; Woody, 2007). Interdisciplinary music education can help students develop multi-faceted skills that are regularly demanded by music industry employers today. Often, aspiring performers are oblivious about the music business and its demands (Wiggins, 2011). Implementing music business and entrepreneurial courses can help students understand the nature of the music industry and steps to becoming marketable (Schultz, 2009). Multicultural and democratic music education can prepare students for cultural understanding, human connectivity, and flexibility as a musician (Campbell, 2002). In 2014, an excerpt from the College Music Society’s Task Force stated,

The creative and expressive dimensions of music have been progressing rapidly over the past several decades. Factors include an expanding, interconnected global society with its cross-cultural influences, crossover stylistic expressions, electronic as well as acoustic performance and production, advances in technology, access and transmission afforded by the internet and digital media, and growing creative impulses for many real-world
musicians in the form of improvisatory and compositional endeavors. (Campbell et al., 2014)

Consequently, students often graduate from college music programs with uncertainty of succeeding as a performing artist in today’s era.

**Contributors of Artistic Development**

There are many reasons why students’ artistic development and success as a performer may be aided or hindered. Some of these factors include pedagogy and learning styles, applied lesson experiences for students, body language, and support systems for student development. These factors along with a philosophical explanation for the cultivation of artistic identity are discussed as outlined in the literature.

**Pedagogy and Learning Styles**

A teacher’s pedagogical approach can have positive or negative effects on the way students learn (Korthagen et al., 2001; McClaren & Kincheleo, 2007). Teachers often cling to a preferred style of teaching, unintentionally dismissing students’ unmatched but preferred learning styles (Howard, 2003; Danielewicz, 2001). Sometimes a student is assigned to a teacher who is one-dimensional in approach (Hyson, 2001). For example, solely teaching with technical emphasis in music may hinder students’ conceptual understanding of the piece; they may learn to play the music flawlessly but lack expressivity (Wiggins, 2001). Potential consequences may include the audience perceiving the music to lack feeling and emotion, and thus, losing their attention and interest (Davidson, 2001). Contrarily, teaching from a multi-dimensional approach (e.g., translating technical aspects of music into imagery examples and vice versa) can assist students’ comprehension of a subject for
executing a task—such as playing a piece of music more expressively. Woody (2004) discovered that students commonly engage in cognitive translation processes to enrich their musical expressivity. Other students testified to frequently employ emotion-based strategies using ‘moods and feeling’ associations for the music they are practicing. Teachers may consider strengthening their instruction by implementing metaphoric language to cultivate students’ artistry while addressing their learning styles.

Concordantly, neglecting students’ learning styles (e.g. visual, aural, verbal, tactile, psychomotor, social, and solitary) can have negative consequences (Cassidy, 2004; Goldfinch & Hughes, 2007). Research has shown there are strong correlations between teachers not addressing students’ learning styles and students’ having low self-efficacy (Coutinho & Neuman, 2008) and low achievement (Vrugt & Oort, 2008). Addressing students’ learning styles can enhance the way they internally signify experiences, recollect information, and enjoy their lessons (Roebken, 2007). Furthermore, research shows different areas of the brain are activated for distinct learning styles, and that using more of the brain can eventually lead to meaningful learning experiences (Boström & Lassen, 2006; Kozhevnikov, 2007; Zull, 2004). For these reasons, students’ preferred learning styles should guide applied teachers’ pedagogical instruction.

**Applied Lessons**

Many objectives may be found in applied lessons. Part of the expectation for the teacher is to address *when, how, and why* to use musical components throughout selected works. One goal is to teach student how to make musically componential
decisions to enhance perceived musical expressivity of the audience (Fredrickson, 2007). In the words of Wolfgang Amadeus Mozart, “Music must never offend the ear, but must please the listener, or, in other words, must never cease to be music” (Kinderman, 2006, p. 6). Accordingly, author Hans Christian Anderson said, “Where words fail, music speaks” (Rees, 2005, p. 81). Jazz icon Miles Davis once said, “Don’t play what’s there, play what’s not there” (Newman, 2006, p. 512). Hence, it is vital to teach transcendent thinking beyond notation to develop musical expressivity. Research suggests that imagery instruction is a critical tool for the development of student’s expressivity (Woody, 2000). Not doing so can result in a tendency to play mechanically, under-development in musicianship, and inability to perform effectively (McDonald, Byrn, & Carlton, 2006).

Epidemically, students often become carbon copies of their favorite artists and teachers. For this reason, another goal of applied lessons is to inspire and guide students towards developing a unique musical voice (Green, 2011). With a plethora of recordings and video footage of performances available via Internet sources, students experience what is akin to an endless buffet of music genres and interpretations of standard repertoire (Castells, 2007; Kaplan & Haenlein, 2010). A potential downfall of absorbing too much information may result in cognitive overload, leaving students impaired in making conscious, creative decisions in the music that are essential for artistic development (Jackson et al., 2012). However, using technology in applied lessons can also inspire students’ motivation for learning, and provide opportunities for multi-perspective learning (Dammers, 2009; Gall & Breeze, 2005; Draper & Hitchcock, 2010). Teachers can play musical videos and recordings for their students,
analyze the performance, and conceptually discuss what is occurring simultaneously (Demski, 2010). With digital audio workstations (e.g., Pro Tools, Logic Pro, Garageband), students are able to view their performance as visual transcriptions on a computer screen. Teaching with visually aided technology can train students to think about expressive decisions using their mind to project visual representations of their performances. Subsequently, students may obtain a comprehensive understanding of the music, and progress in their artistic development (Kusek & Leonhard, 2005).

**Body Language in Applied Lessons**

In many instances, audiences attending recitals and concerts at music institutions watch musicians perform without concern of stage presence. Students often stare at their music stand with stiff posture, omit verbal communication with the audience, and sometimes display facial expressions of worry and fear (Gritten & King, 2006). Research suggests performers’ body language is of equal importance to the music according to concert attendees (Dahl & Friberg, 2004). Humans naturally relate what they hear to what they see before making a judgment (Berger, 1989). Research shows that facial expression is a conduit for perceived expressivity while listening to performances (Morisson et al., 2009; Price & Chang, 2005; Wöllner, 2008). Research also shows that audiences perceive higher musical expressivity when artists project stronger emphasis on body movement during their performance (Davidson, 2007). Along with technical development and musical expressivity, an emphasis on stage presence should be considered during applied lessons. Bauman (1984) stated, “The term performance has been used to convey a dual sense of artistic *action* - the doing of folklore - and artistic *event* - the performances
situation, involving the performer, art form, audience, and setting - both of which are basic to the developing performance approach” (p. 7). In applied lesson instruction, the teacher should give equal emphasis to the “artistic action” and “artistic event”, realizing that both are valuable entities during a performance. This could be a stepping-stone towards developing artistic identity.

**Support Systems for Student Development**

There are other factors that can affect students’ artistic development. Life circumstances bring forth extraneous variables that can function as motivators for students’ practice (Haggis, 2004; Schmidt, Zdzinski, & Ballard, 2006; Asmus, 1986; Asmus & Harrison, 1990). Students who have support systems (i.e., family, friends, colleagues, teachers, and so forth) generally tend to have greater self-concept and motivation to execute the task (Dennis, Phinney, & Chuateco, 2005; Schuller, 2004). Having strong support systems and guidance often inspires goal setting and instills newfound dreams within students (Baumeister & Leary, 1995). The enjoyment of a task is augmented if students are provided comforting environments for learning. Engaging in collaborative learning with peers can enthuse learning experiences and bring forth novel ideas, and, with positive reinforcement from the teacher, can become a platform for students to develop leadership and creative skills (Brown & Dillon, 2007; Daniels & Walker, 2001). On the other hand, if students do not have a strong support system, the effects can be halting and even detrimental to their development (Finn & Rock, 1997). Refraining from giving constructive feedback or discouraging their students in lessons can lower their self-concept and self-efficacy as performers (Gibson & Jefferson, 2006; Slicker & Palmer, 1993).
Moreover, student autonomy and peer encouragement can foster artistic development among students (Lebler, 2007). Research shows that students prefer to learn in peer-group environments where ideas are challenged, discussed, and refined as opposed to a large class setting where students’ voices are less prevalent (Green, 2009; Dexler, 2010; Jones, 2009). This type of environment can foster encouragement within students’ peer groups. Without moral support from peers, students are more prone to fall into the at-risk spectrum and to drop out of school (Pizzolato, 2003). In Ferrer’s (2014) study, students revealed a decrease in intrinsic motivation and self-efficacy for pursuing their dreams due to the lack of support among immediate family and peers. Students testified that their motivation for pursuing their goals might have increased if a stronger support system was in their lives. Evidently, the blossoming of relationships that manifests in peer-friendly environments can be remedial not only for completing school, but also for developing their creative thinking and artistic identity.

**Philosophically Constructing Identity**

For both musicians and non-expert musicians, their connection to music, whether it be performing, viewing, or listening to music, is essential for their identity construction. Music exists in cultural contexts that bring forth other constructs of their identity. For example, a person who identifies with rock music is likely to develop fashion tastes, belief systems, and vernacular language that align with that music (MacDonald, 2002). Taylor and Hallam (2008) suggested that there are different musical selves within a person’s identity—the composer, the improviser, the technician, the listener, the learner, the mentor, the artist, and so forth. If these selves
are left uncultivated, it may hinder students’ optimal potential for artistic development.

Artistry can be viewed as the ability to transcend beyond the technical aspects of an art form to communicate meaning with the audience. The foundationalism of artistry originates with the identity construction phase. Students’ personal identity are constructed alongside musical identity as they grow in feelings of capability to communicate through their art. Once students’ identity are established, their feelings of adequacy institute purpose for their music. Performing artists must know what to communicate for the audience to perceive meaning through their art. Students’ role in society as a performing artist are realized once they develop a reason why and to whom they desire to communicate.

Identity cultivation is an essential precedent for students to learn and express thoughts with intention and conviction. Without a determination to construct students’ identities, students will find it difficult to learn or express their thoughts with purpose. It is imperative that educators uphold the underlining mandate to construct students’ identity through their pedagogy. One pedagogical approach that has been used to help students learn and become more expressive, regardless of the skill, is teaching with imagery. Educators commonly utilize imagery in isolation and in conjunction with other instructional tools and approaches to enrich students’ learning experiences, and to produce expressive outcomes. In the following section, the author presents various implementations of imagery, as it relates to music education, for enhancing expressivity and learning: (1) imagery for expressivity and
learning; (2) imagery for improvisation; (3) imagery and technology for learning; (4) imagery in master classes; and, (5) the performer’s use of imagery.

**Imagery for Expressivity and Learning**

The ongoing conversation concerning the necessity of artistic development has led to further investigation of potential interventions that could assist various aspects of students’ artistry. Among many interventions, imagery has been observed for enriching expressivity and learning experiences (Woody, 2006). Imagery, coexisting with technology in an applied lesson setting, can be utilized for developing expressivity and conceptual understanding of the music. Additionally, acclaimed masters of music often provide their perspectives in music making using metaphorical language—imagery.

For many teachers and musicians, expressive playing takes precedence. Expressivity is regarded as one of the most important elements for artistic development (Gabrielsson & Juslin, 1996). The majority of listeners prefer expressive playing over a display of technical mastery (Lindstrom, Juslin, Bresin, & Williamson, 2003). The evidence can be seen in pop culture today where music containing simplistic harmonic movement, steady grooves, diatonic harmony, and expressive vocals prevails in popularity over art music containing technical and virtuosic emphasis. Often, artists testify to utilizing imagery for enhancing their performance tasks and self-efficacy, and for feeling more connected to the lyrics (Aleman, et al., 2000; Nielson, 1999). Strategic use of imagery such as meditating, or visualizing a performance can result in an output of increased expressivity in a student’s performance (Hargreaves, 1984).
Unfortunately, many teachers focus solely on teaching technique while dismissing the importance of expressive thinking and playing for later stages (Reimer, 2003). A possible thought among musicians may be pondered: why don’t many teachers simply integrate both concepts simultaneously? (Juslin, 2003). Wooten (2008) responded to this question in his book, The Music Lesson, by suggesting that focusing only on technical development would have long-term negative consequences on students’ abilities to express musical feeling. The lack of communicating conceptual ideas in a music lesson might cause students to ineffectively interpret musical meaning. He avowed the process in which teachers teach music is often taught in reverse order to the way individuals learn a language. It is like saying a person is not allowed to express his or her thoughts without having mastered the rules of the English language; it is absurd. For these reasons, professionals and researchers have taken interest in exploring interventions, such as imagery, for developing students’ musical expressivity during their early learning stages.

Regarding imagery for musical expressivity, unique methods for its cultivation in students have been explored. Writing descriptions of a piece of music while listening can allow students to understand their thought processes of the music. After journal reflection, students may transfer imagery-based descriptions through a cognitive translation process in their performances, resulting in enhanced expressivity (Barton, 1998; Woody, 2002). Teacher modeling is another contributor to expressivity. Music teachers who educate through imagery-based descriptors and live demonstrations can serve as exemplary models for emulation and imitation (Woody, 1999, 2000, 2006). Verbalization of emotional cues during lessons has been shown to
enhance listeners’ perception of performers’ expressivity and communication of emotional intention. If teachers ask their students to play an angry tone, students with enough technical facility may translate the emotion by adjusting their musculature to play components and motional aspects of music fittingly (Woody, 2004). Applying this technique during live performance has been shown to be effective in convincing listeners the expressivity and emotionality in the artists’ performance (Gabrielsson & Juslin, 1996). For artists, conveying emotionality to the audience during a performance is an integral goal worth pursuing (Woody, 2010). Many musical improvisers find value in employing creative thinking strategies for enhancing their expressivity, hoping to “communicate” perceived meaning to the listeners (Seddon, 2005).

**Imagery for Improvisation**

Many professional jazz artists utilize imagery in unique, phenomenological fashions for enhancing their expressivity during improvisation. John Coltrane (1926 – 1967) described visualizing his improvisation and pursued playing ‘sheets of sound.’ In many instances, he felt as though he was painting with sonic textures with his mind (Nisenson, 2009). Miles Davis claimed to have synesthetic tendencies – blots of colors and textures manifested as he played or listened to music. Several songs, including his acclaimed composition “Blue in Green”, were inspired by his cerebral condition. Dizzy Gillespie (1917 – 1993) was an advocate for teaching improvisation with imagery and the piano. Dizzy Gillespie claimed to visualize piano keys while he improvised on the trumpet. He stated that scales and chords would light up in his mind, indicating the appropriate notes to play, and thus, strengthened the harmonic
outline of his solos (Davis, 1990). Concordantly, some artists have claimed to visualize a manifested transcription of their foreseen solo before the improvisation occurs. During their improvisation, they can adjust and improve the transcription in a moment’s notice. Other artists have expressed their reliance on thinking about colors (and their association with moods) for enhancing their expressivity of the improvisation. Some artists perceive the act of improvisation as architectural; they visualize melodic contours and harmonic structures as shapes overlapping one another. This technique allows them to view the song from a far-sighted perspective, and make musical decisions for balancing the visual structure of the piece in their minds. Renowned Jazz artists (e.g., Timothy Higgins, Brian Lynch, and Jason Palmer) described these techniques as unique strategies that should be explored in pedagogy for developing conviction in student’s improvisation (White, 2011).

**Technology and Imagery for Learning**

The use of recording technology in applied lessons provide students access to re-visiting their performances and adjusting musical components accordingly. Habitually repeating this task can have ever-increasing effects of expressive playing (Kusek & Leonhard, 2005; Webster, 2007). The availability of recording devices, instrumental apps, and composition software provides opportune settings for students to develop their musicality (Herbert, 2010; Kratus, 2014; Randles, 2013). Many apps can translate students’ performances to audio-wave images that indicate students’ rhythmical tendencies in relation to a metronome and sound envelope. However, research is needed to discover whether engaging in these apps influence students’
ability to mentally display sound images during performance, and, if this process leads to enhancing their expressivity.

**Imagery in Master Classes**

In every field, there are individuals who demonstrate superiority, innovation, and exceptional creativity in a specific domain. These “masters,” often charismatic, can *influence* performance approaches, *inspire* professionals, and *impact* aspiring performers. Furthermore, their philosophy can inspire the expansion of a field and challenge the status quo. In music, masters are regularly invited to conduct master classes for educating aspiring artists with valuable insight (often not addressed in academia) on necessities for obtaining a successful career as a performing artist. During the master class, a master often utilizes conceptual descriptors to evoke creative thinking in music performance (Megginson, 2000). Many masters believe that connecting music passages to concepts, emotions, and scenes can influence performers’ technique and lead to the enhancement of musical expressivity (White, 2011). Keller (2012) suggested that imagery (i.e., working memory, action simulation, and internal models) supports the generation of anticipatory images that facilitate detailed action planning and movement execution that is characterized by efficiency, temporal precision, and biomechanical economy. Keller suggested that individual differences in anticipatory imagery could be a source of variance in expressive performance excellence. This idea pilasters the notions that performers find value in transcending beyond the written notation, and that employing imagery techniques for a performance can facilitate the enhancement of the performers’ expressivity.
Masters also discuss utilizing imagery before and during a performance as a therapeutic tool for reducing stress levels of the performer. Strategically meditating on calm scenery or reflecting on soothing words can induce healthier physical and psychological conditions for a smoother performance (Esplen et al., 1999). Evidently, populaces regularly incorporate imagery alongside other tools and settings as interventions for enhancing perceptions and production of expressivity. Imagery is an ancient creative thinking tool that has shown to be effective in enriching perception, enhancing performance, and strengthening learning throughout human existence (Finnegan, 2007).

**The Performer’s Use of Imagery**

Imagery’s perceptive and productive effects on performers’ expressivity have been subsumed for millennia. Great teachers and leaders throughout history have taught and encouraged individuals using various forms of imagery: oral traditions, parables, fables, metaphors, semiotics, lyrics, and so forth (Draaisma, 2000; Ryeken, et al., 2010). Historically, thespians have implemented imagery techniques to get into character; this technique is commonly known as ‘method acting’ – it is when actors utilize episodic memory or experiential knowledge of a subject to influence their exterior appearance. Award winning method actors (e.g., Robert DiNero, Al Pachino, Marlon Brando, and Johnny Depp) have received accolades for their convincing and highly expressive performances (Rokem, 2009). In African traditions, storytelling and parables often conjoined as dancers interpret the imagery through body movement and rhythm (Banks-Wallace, 2002; Goss & Barnes, 1989). Coaches regularly utilize imagery techniques to motivate their athletes. (Burton & Raedeke, 2008; Cox, 1998;
Paivio, 1985). Additionally, athletes often think of analogies to emulate qualities of a particular object. For example, a coach may say to a runner, “When you race, see yourself as the cheetah among gazelles. You are the fastest one in the race.” A coach may tell his athlete to dunk, “pound on the rim like the Hulk!”, to inspire attitude and motor changes in the athlete’s mind and body for executing the task (Letswaart, et al., 2011).

In the case for musicians, mental imagery has shown to be highly effective and beneficial (Keller, 2012). Teachers use representative metaphor to enhance their students’ expressivity of a passage (Persson, 2001; Woody, 2000). For example, a teacher may describe a section of the passage as a feeling of jubilee, nostalgia, or anger. This strategy aims to promote engagement and connectivity to the music. Students recollect past experiences and allow those experiences to influence their emotions (Eschrich, Münite, & Altenmüller, 2008). In turn, student can gain meaningful learning experiences.

Additionally, many composers have been known to utilize imagery as a basis for inspiration and motivation for creating music (Collins, 2012). Composers use imagery for rousing innovative ideas for their compositions (Agnus, 1922a, 1922b). Furthermore, applied teachers use imagery that resembles an object to enhance their expressivity by equating musical attributes to the qualities of an object (Betts, 1909). For example, the teacher may tell a drum student, “When you play the accents on the snare drum, attack it really hard to make it sound like gunshots.” A cognitive translation process occurs with the student as she considers the properties of the symbol and adapts it to musical contexts (Turino, 2008).
In hip-hop culture, hip-hop musicians engage in ‘rap battles.’ Rappers often say they want to battle the other person, meaning, they want to take turn improvising rhyming lyrics in rhythm. Additionally, they may use jargon like “I’m gonna bring the heat” or “I’m a spit and flow on the mic” preceding their performance. This metaphorical language, Ebonics, functions as intrinsic motivation for the rapper to freestyle lyrics smoothly during the battle. (Chang, 2007; Travis & Deepak, 2011). Although hip-hop education is not common yet in higher education, future research could look into the function of hip-hoppers’ metaphorical strategies for enhancing students’ self efficacy for performing other genres.

Additionally, many musicians describe timbre with metaphorical language and color. In the author’s experience, flutists often describe different timbres with the following words — warm, bright, lazar-like, velvety, thin, thick, and so forth. One flute manufacturing company in particular, Miyazawa Flutes Inc., recognized this common jargon among flutists, and thus, promotes its products by displaying pictures of its instruments alongside water painting or colorful images surrounding the instrument. Their famous Colors of Sound series’ slogan is “What color is your sound?”

Concordantly, many orchestral flute excerpts and pieces were written to portray characters and moods of a storyline. Arguably the most famous solo flute piece, Syrinx by Claude Debussy, was written to portray the Greek mythological story of Pan’s sorrow after discovering that he unintentionally murdered his platonic love, a nymph. Flute teachers may explain this story to a student learning the piece to prepare the state of mind. Often teachers will instruct students to (1) vary their vibrato in a
speed that resembles the speed of a person crying and (2) play wide dynamic contrasts to intensify the perceived emotional quality of the music. This is an example of where technical descriptors and imagery coincide to enhance the students’ expressivity and conscious awareness for performance.

The Role of Imagery for Awareness

The acclaimed bassist and music theorist, Anthony Wellington (2010), described four levels of awareness that musicians experience throughout their lives, of which two of them are blissful states of consciousness. The first level is Unconscious not Knowing. This is where a person is ignorant of what they’re doing musically; they are innocent minded and carefree, which is a blissful state. He described the second level as Conscious not Knowing. For example, beginner music students taking their first several lessons experience this stage. Beginner students are consciously aware of their lack of understanding in many areas of their craft, not knowing the required steps to accelerate musical progress. The third level is Conscious Knowing. This occurs when students are aware of their level of musicianship, aspire to develop it further, and know the steps to achieving it. However, it is not a blissful state because they have not advance to an artistic level.

Wellingtons proposed that for musicians to reach the fourth level, Unconscious Knowing, the incorporation of multi-dimensional learning in their practice regiment is imperative. Multi-dimensional learning is when a person learns a subject from various formats simultaneously (Linnenbrink, 2007). In Wellington’s case, he insinuated that musicians should learn music technically, intellectually, sonically and visually. Technical understanding should be the foundation since it
facilitates clarity in performance. He described intellectual understanding as knowing the theoretical and historical constructs of the music. Sonic understanding occurs when students are able to hear what they sound like. Recording devices can facilitate this type of learning. Lastly, Wellington described visual understanding, not as external, but internal visualization. He suggested this process is obtained when students are taught conceptual understanding of the music; what it represents or portrays. Only then can musicians transcend to a level of artistry, which is a blissful state of consciousness. It is important when teaching musical expressivity that the student learns music from these four perspectives simultaneously. Doing so enables the student to grasp musical content better. In summary, Wellington proposed that imagery conjoined with other thought processes play a vital role for learning to become more musically aware, and to perform more expressively.

**Imagery for Meaningful Learning**

Teaching with imagery is conducive to meaningful learning experiences (Dansereau, et al., 1979). For meaningful learning to occur, relevant knowledge structures must be organized in the lesson. Then, the teacher must have emotional commitment to integrate new and existing knowledge (Novak, 2002). Conceptual descriptors must be clear to the student for acquisition of information to occur. Concepts may be characterized as avowed uniformities or configurations in occurrences or entities, or annals of occurrences of items elected by a word or description (Ausubel, 1960). Most words in languages are concept labels, and sometime transcontinental words have a slightly different meaning, since it evolved in a different setting. When concepts are linked together, they form propositions, which
describe proceedings of items. Over time, concepts and propositions are assimilated which gives them meaning. Cognitive structures—mental processes individuals engage to make sense of information, such as imagery—of our brains are organized in the assimilation process. Note that cognitive structures are distinctive for each person, hence, cognitive structures take on different meanings. This is why the teacher’s role is imperative: wholesome educational practices allot opportunities for relational connections during the learning, and for the augmentation of students’ sagacity to occur (Novak, 1984, 1990; Heinze-Fry & Novak, 1990). The importance for mental imagery in music education, specifically applied lessons, is that it can assist students’ comprehension of a concept or subject. In turn, understanding the subject serves as a foundation for creative thinking, which transfers into creative actions such as musicing (DeNora, 2005; Elliott, 2005).

Based on Leonard Meyer’s research (2008), meaningful learning can be summed in three types, two of which are addressed through imagery. The first type, not addressed by imagery, is environmental/general. This form of learning deals with the notion that the environment and milieus in which a student ascertains have a contributing effect on their erudition (Gülpinar & Yegen, 2005). For example, learning under hot temperature conditions could cause the student to feel uncomfortable, uneasy, and distracted by the heat of the room. On the other hand, if the student feels comfortable with the temperature of the room, it becomes a contributing factor to his or her ability to focus, retain information, and foster an experience that is meaningful.
The second type is associative learning. Associative learning combines two elements that are not directly linked for the sake of enrichment or enhancement (Jonassen, & Strobel, 2006; Karpicke, & Blunt, 2011). Charles Pierce’s theory of semiotics describes this process as the phenomenon of grouping an object to another object (Barley, 1983; Chandler, 2007). This is commonly done in society as individuals stereotype one another based on their attire, accent, physique, and so forth. Music listeners often compartmentalize an unfamiliar song to a specified genre because it resembles other songs they know. For example, the sound of busy sax player, a walking bass line, and prominent ride cymbal can indicate to the listener that the song belongs to the jazz idiom. In an applied lesson, teachers use both iconic and indexical symbols to enhance expressivity. By telling the student to mimic the sound of a particular object, the teacher provides an iconic sign. Equating music to a particular scene is an example of an indexical sign (Turino, 2008). In this type of learning, the composer’s intent is unknown; hence the transference of intended communication is not present. However, students are still able to gain a meaningful experience.

The third type of meaningful learning is representational learning. Representational learning is when the object has literal meaning related to something specific and meaningful (Mayer et al., 1995). Composers often provide autobiographies, letters, and journals to inform the intent of the piece (Agnew, 1922). The composer, Mark Camphouse’s composition, A Movement for Rosa, contains a recurring motive of five notes, which he says represents the five syllables to the phrase “We shall overcome” (Gould, 2012). In applied lessons, teachers can inform
the intention of a composer (assuming sources exist) to the student, which may allow the student to make a connection with the piece. Furthermore, using indexical descriptors regularly may foster creative thinking and expressive playing.

Meaningful learning is central to human constructivism (Jonassen, 1995). Novak (2011) stated that in meaningful learning, knowledge was conceptual; that it was formed by concepts, which were linked to form propositions that have meaning. Meaningful knowledge is organized in cognitive structures that lead to human empowerment (Walls & Jickling, 2002). It is this human constructivism and assimilation theory that forms the theoretical framework for this study. Assimilation is a cognitive process that describes how humans absorb new knowledge and integrates new knowledge into existing knowledge (Piaget, 2013; Schneider & Curl, 2014). Additionally, this theory serves as an explanation for why ‘rote learning’ is an inhibitor of creativity and ‘meaningful learning’ facilitates creativity (Robinson, 2010).

**Technical and Imagery-Based Instruction**

Many would agree that technique is the initial foundation for learning any art form (Donovan, 1994; Reid, 2001). Without technique, professional athletes would miss three pointers and dancers would sprain their ankles regularly. Swanwick (2001) describes the value of teaching technique, stating that technical facility enable musicians to play music clearly and communicate with audiences (what is external) their desired performance (what is internal). Here is the author’s understanding of how teaching technique functions in applied lessons: technique is addressed through pedagogy, realized in practice, and applied to performance. Ideologically, teaching
technique is beneficial for students’ ability to efficiently play musical ideas. As students’ technical facility fortifies, teachers may consider employing more imagery in their lessons. Imagery may function as the connecter of humanistic qualities that is necessary in music; it could bring forth inspiration for students to learn and relate with the music, and provide deeper understanding for the music’s existence.

Though music is not a universal language (universal phenomenon is more appropriate), music can be analogous to language for understanding the role of technique and imagery (Nettl, 2005, 2014; Mithens, 2005). Music can parallel language since it can communicate meaning to listeners (Swanwick, 2011). If music is like a language, the different styles of music (genres) are similar to dialects of the language. Wooten (2010) said that in Western traditions, music utilizes the same 12 notes. Similarly, all of the English language uses the same 26 letters of the alphabet. What cause English to sound different in various parts of the United States are variances in prosodies, diction, and vocal inflections (Curzan & Adams, 2014). This can be similar to musical components (e.g., articulation, space, dynamics, pitch, and so forth) that vary within each style of music. In Jazz, the eighth notes have an underlined triplet-feel. In marches, eighth notes have a straight feel. Hence, if instructors teach technique, they are merely teaching students how to express an idea. The incorporation of imagery can teach students what to express. From the author’s experience, learning and teaching music technically and conceptually have been fruitful and equally beneficial to his students’ learning experience and expressivity. There exists research on the utilization of imagery for enhancing expressivity and musical comprehension. However, research in understanding the conjunction of
technical and imagery-based instruction’s (T-I instruction) effects on aspiring performers’ acquisition of learning newly composed pieces, improvisation, and expressivity in applied lessons is needed. Furthermore, how do listeners perceive aspiring performing artists’ expressivity when learning newly composed pieces with T-I instruction? This study may result in useful knowledge for applied lesson pedagogues: (1) To understand T-I instruction’s role for aspiring performing artists’ acquisition of learning newly composed pieces and improvisation; (2) To understand T-I instruction’s effects on aspiring performing artists’ expressivity; (3) To understand T-I instruction’s function when teaching notated verses improvisational music, and; (4) To understand if T-I instruction has a causal effect on listeners’ perception of expressivity.

**Research Purpose**

The purpose of this study was to explore the union of technical and imagery-based instruction (hereinafter, T-I instruction) in two phases. Phase one: The researcher (1) explored T-I instruction’s influences on aspiring performing artists’ acquisition of learning and performing newly composed pieces or improvisation, and (2) observed aspiring performing artists’ feelings of learning with T-I instruction versus technical instruction. Phase two: The researcher investigated (1) listeners’ perceived expressivity of aspiring performing artists’ performances that were either influenced by T-I instruction or technical instruction; (2) listeners’ perceived expressivity of aspiring performing artists’ performances of newly composed pieces versus improvisations; (3) whether there was a statistical significant difference of T-I instructions’ influence on the progressive differences in the means of listeners’
perceived expressivity between the aspiring performing artists across the time frame of the study; (4) the explanations for their ratings; and (5) information that helps listeners perceive music as expressive

**Research Questions**

For phase one of this study, the researcher sought to answer two research questions:

I.a. What is T-I instruction’s influence on aspiring performing artists’ development of expressivity while learning newly composed pieces or improvisation?

I.b. What are the aspiring performing artists’ feelings of T-I instruction versus technical instruction in applied lessons?

For phase two of this study, the researcher sought to answer five research questions:

II.a. Does T-I instruction have a statistical significant influence on listeners’ perceived expressivity of aspiring performing artists’ performances of newly composed pieces and improvisations?

II.b. What is the degree of listeners’ perceived expressivity of aspiring performing artists’ reading versus improvised performances when influenced by either T-I instruction or technical instruction?

II.c. Is there a statistical significant difference of T-I instructions’ influence on the progressive differences in the means of listeners’ perceived expressivity between the aspiring performing artists across the time frame of the study?

II.d. What are listeners’ reasons for their ratings of perceived expressivity?

II.e. What kind of information helps listeners perceive music as expressive?

**Hypothesis**

For phase one, the researcher hypothesizes that aspiring performing artists will enjoy the lessons with T-I instruction more than the comparison condition, technical instruction. Themes like emotional connection, frame of reference, self-efficacy for performance, improved technical facility, improved cognition for
improvisation, and enhanced expressivity may arise. Aspiring performing artists learning notated compositions and students learning improvisation will mutually appreciate both forms of instruction and describe the benefits of both. For phase two, The researcher hypothesizes that (1) there will be a statistically significant difference on listeners’ perceived expressivity of aspiring performing artists’ performances of newly composed pieces and improvisations; (2) listeners’ perceived expressivity will be greater for of aspiring performing artists’ improvised performances than reading performances; (3) there will be a statistical significant difference between listeners’ perceived expressivity of aspiring performing artists’ performance influenced by T-I instruction or technical instruction; (4) progressive differences of aspiring performing artists’ perceived expressivity increase more for students whose expressivity is initially lower. For questions II.d and II.e, the researcher hopes to openly identify themes from the qualitative data.

**Operational Definitions**

**Mental Imagery**

One of the components of T-I instruction is imagery. In this study, imagery is hypothetical inner representations of any sort (conceptual descriptors, verbal descriptors, directional descriptors, metaphors, icons, indexes, etc.) that influence a quasi-perceptual experience (Thomas, 2014; Turino, 2008). Musicians generate mental experiences of auditory features of musical sounds, and/or visual, proprioceptive, kinesthetic, and tactile properties of music-related movements, that are not (or not yet) necessarily present in the physical world. Such mental images
may be generated through either deliberate thought or automatic responses to endogenous and exogenous cues (Keller, 2012, p. 206).

**Expressivity**

Expressivity is the translation of musical meaning, intention, or feeling through the use of variations in timing, intensity, dynamics, timbre, and pitch. The author’s pilot study, *The Effects of Mental Imagery with Technical Descriptions on Audiences’ Perception of Expressivity while Listening to Original Compositions*, served as inspiration for this definition (Ruiz & Temple, 2015 - unpublished). The study found that audiences became more aware of technical aspects in the music after receiving imagery descriptions. Qualitative responses indicated that students’ perceive music as more expressive when musicians play musical components with wide contrasts.

Additionally, expressivity is when technique serves to express, utter, or *represent*; effectively conveying *meaning, intention, or feeling*; “an *expressive silence*;” *Showing* emotions and feelings clearly and openly (Webster’s Dictionary). Notice that this definition suggests that both technique and imagery are required for expressivity to occur. To “effectively convey meaning, intention, or feeling” requires a strong technical foundation to communicate ideas. “Meaning, intention, or feelings” are conceptual terminologies; imagery descriptions can be used to convey these ideas.

**Performing Artist**

In this study, the student participants in phase one are aspiring performing artists. According to Bauman (1984), “The term performance has been used to convey a dual sense of artistic *action* - the doing of folklore - and artistic *event* - the
performances situation, involving the performer, art form, audience, and setting - both of which are basic to the developing performance approach” (p. 7). Hence, the author refers to a performing artist as someone who can think, and communicate his or her ‘ideas’ and ‘approaches’ to an audience and one who challenges the status quo in a given area of study.

**Musical Technique**

Musical technique is the ability to employ control of the instrument to harvest anticipated musical effects. The improvement of technique is achieved by effectively practicing exercises that improve the physical components of the performer (coordination, agility, dexterity, kinetic control) (Kivy, 1993). Technique functions as one of the factors for enhancing the overall musicality of the performer (Ruiz, 2014).

**Technical Instruction**

Technical instruction is the teaching of musculature manipulation and proper physical characters for the performer to employ control of the instrument.

**T-I Instruction**

Technical and Imagery-based instruction is defined as instruction that synchronizes technical descriptors with *mental imagery.*
CHAPTER TWO

LITERATURE REVIEW

This chapter is a synthesis of research that (1) discusses values, historical perspectives, definitions, and the construct of the review; (2) discusses theories, and practical applications of imagery, perceptive and productive effects of imagery instruction in non-musical settings (i.e., sports, martial arts, dance, and acting) and its relationship to musical settings (i.e., music education, music therapy, music performance), and; (3) synthesizes imagery-based research in music education (i.e., imagery in music teaching, imagery for young musicians, imagery for musical expressivity). Implications for music educators and researchers are provided as suggested by the literature.

The Value of Imagery

One of the most amazing phenomenon in which human beings engage is employing the power of the imagination to affect their lives on a daily basis (Galton, 1880; Betts, 1909; MacInnis & Price, 1987; Marks, 1972, 1999). For millennia, cultures around the world have had traditions of telling histories, parables, and fables, which are meant to inspire, teach, and warn individuals of the human conditions. Stories across cultures are transmitted by means of oral tradition, listening to lyrics of songs, and attending movies and performing arts presentations. Often, the audience processes these stories imaginatively by putting themselves in the shoes of the
characters within the story. On many occasions, the result of this cerebral engagement leads people to walk away feeling spiritually uplifted, emotionally understood, and practically wiser. The mind is what controls our body, and if we can learn how to harness our mind in effective ways, then we can have control of how our physical body and external surroundings are affected.

Albert Einstein once said, "Imagination is more important than knowledge" (Calaprice, 2000). Concordantly, author J. K. Rowling stated in her 2008 Harvard commencement address, “We do not need magic to change the world. We carry all the power we need inside ourselves already: we have the power to imagine better.” For these reasons, the mind’s power and potential is a theme of great interest for researchers in virtually all fields of scholarship. Within this field of research, the researcher is interested in specifically exploring imagery as a pedagogical tool for enhancing the mind and body.

**Historical Perspectives of Imagery**

For centuries scholars have been on a quest to understand more about the phenomenon of mental imagery. The writings of renowned Greek philosophers Plato and Aristotle have had tremendous influence on how cognition and imagery as a whole are conceptualized within the Western cultural tradition (*De Memoria* 450a 1; cf. *De Anima* 431a 15–20 & 432a 8–12). Plato (427 BC – 347 BC) provided the earliest accounts as he cautiously insinuated that memory might be akin to a block of wax which is imprinted with our perceptions and thoughts, creating “memory images” (*Theatetus* 191c,d). The evidence of this analogy can be seen throughout history, as cultures utilized oral traditions (i.e., singing of songs, telling of parables,
metaphors) to pass down history from one generation to the next; in this context, imagery is a tool to induce memory retention. These were some of the methods implemented before written language existed in these civilizations. One example is the ancient Jewish culture (c. 1800 BC to 1 BC) - rabbi, families, and friends sung highly-descriptive lyrics to their children with the intention of preserving their history and customs found in the Oral Torah, translated Oral Law (Magnus, 2003; Schwartz, 2004; Danby, 2012).

Furthermore, Aristotle provided the first systematic account for how imagery functions in cognitive psychology. In Aristotelian psychological theory, images play much the same role that the rather wider notion of mental representation plays in modern cognitive science. He apprehended that mental images are significant contributors to both memory and thought. Aristotle believed that memory is the recollection of images of previous proceedings towards the mind; thus, it is virtually unmanageable to think deprived of an image (De Memoria 450a 1; cf. De Anima 431a 15-20 & 432a 8-12). He also apprehended that images strengthen and offer meaning for language as a whole. (De Interpretatione 16a 5-9; De Anima 420b 29-32; Modrak, 2001).

Great teachers and leaders throughout history understood the power of imagery. The acclaimed Chinese philosophic legend, Laozi (b. ca. 570 BC), professed life-application proverbs in a metaphorical manner. Among his illustrious proverbs is one that he describes the process of reaching goals and destiny - “The journey of a thousand miles begins with a single step: (Laozi 64 (千里之行，始於足下。). Similarly, renowned Greek philosopher Plato described music in the following way –
“Music is a moral law. It gives soul to the universe, wings to the mind, flight to the imagination, and charm and gaiety to life and everything.” The following is a famous metaphor quoted by Jesus Christ concerning his relationship with humanity – “I am the vine; you are the branches. If a man remains in me and I in him, he will bear much fruit” (NIV Bible, John 15:1-11, 2015). Finally, former President Abraham Lincoln (1809 – 1965) analogized the concept of human character by saying – “Character is like a tree and reputation is like a shadow. The shadow is what we think of it; the tree is the real thing.” It is evident that the combination of wisdom and metaphorical descriptors are utilized to convey a deeper meaning to the person’s understanding of a subject. These words of wisdom are supported by recent research in music instruction, which suggests that metaphoric-based language in applied lessons facilitates better understanding of musical meaning or intentionality of composer as opposed to receiving solely technical-based instruction (Woody, 2002, 2006).

**Operational Definition of Imagery**

Due to the complexity and obscurity of the expression “imagery”, a clear understanding of the term must be established. Imagery, or mental imagery, which is sometimes colloquially referred to as “visualizing,” “seeing in the mind's eye,” “hearing in the head,” “imagining the feel of,” and so forth, is a *quasi-perceptual experience*. This means that it resembles perceptual experience, but occurs in the absence of the appropriate external stimuli. It is also generally understood to bear *intentionality* (i.e., mental images are always images *of* something or other), and thereby to function as a form of mental representation. Scholars and practitioners
commonly embrace the term’s meaning as hypothetical inner representations of any sort (conceptual descriptors, verbal descriptors, directional descriptors, metaphors, icons, indexes, etc.) that influence a quasi-perceptual experience (Thomas, 2014; Turino, 2008). Imagery can also be defined as:

an experience that mimics real experience. We can be aware of ‘seeing’ an image, feeling movements as an image, or experiencing an image of smells, tastes or sounds without actually experiencing the real thing” (White & Hardy 1998, p. 389).

cognitive or imaginary rehearsal of a physical skill without overt muscular movement. The basic idea is that the senses – predominantly aural, visual, and kinesthetic for the musician – should be used to create or recreate an experience that is similar to a given physical event. (Connolly & Williamon 2004, p. 224).

Various subsets of mental imagery exist. *Motor imagery* is the inner facsimile of a particular motor action devoid of blatant motor output. *Mental practice* is the process of utilizing motor imagery for enhancing external output (Mulder et al., 2003, 2007) An important note to consider is that mental imagery is not identical to visual perception. *Visual perception* is the cataloguing of present stimuli, where as mental imagery is the registration of stimuli influenced by past experiences and can attribute to the visualization of future expectations (Kosslyn et. al, 2006).

**Addressing the Construct of the Review**

Now that a historical perspective and a definition of imagery have been presented, the rest of this chapter presents a variety of topics that are vital for understanding mental imagery’s perceptive and productive effects. Firstly, several theoretical frameworks, which provide clearer understanding of the cognitive functions and practical applications of mental imagery, are addressed. Then, practical applications for imagery are discussed in the selected non-music fields (*sports, dance,*
drama, martial arts, and military) with the applications for imagery in three music fields (music education, music therapy, music performance). Thirdly, a synthesis of recent studies in the music education literature that implemented imagery-based instruction for observing its perceptual and productive effects is discussed. Finally, the researcher provides implications from the literature review and suggestions for future research to inform the reader how the literature shaped the methodology for the study.

**Theories of Imagery**

For almost a century scientists have debated whether mental images play a functional role in cognition (Kosslyn et.al, 2001). The author summarizes Stephen Kosslyn’s theory of mental imagery’s processes theory for the reader’s comprehension. Then, a few other theories (i.e., symbolic learning theory, psychoneuromuscular theory, regulatory focus theory, Pierce’s theory of semiotics, Langer’s theory of discursive versus presentational symbols, and neuropsychological explanation of how perceptions are influenced by cognitive mechanisms are discussed due to their relevancy in effecting musicians’ performance and perceptions.

A fundamental understanding of mental imagery is that it functions much like depictive representations used in information processing, and showed how these representations arose from neural processes (Cooper, 1975; Kosslyn, 1996). Mental imagery consists of a collection of distinct functions, each of which was responsible for a different aspect of imagery. Kosslyn (2006), a prolific scholar in the subject of mental imagery, proposed four sets of processes: generating the image (i.e., activating information stored in long-term memory and constructing a representation in short-
term memory); examining the object in the image (i.e., by reinterpreting it); preserving the image over time; and altering the image (i.e., by rotating it, adding or deleting parts, or changing the color).

Another prominent theory within the realm of cognitive psychology was the *symbolic learning theory* (Bowes, 2009). The theory stated that mental imagery works by practicing their actions in advance. Motor sequence, task goals, and alternative solutions are considered cognitively before a physical response is necessitated. Pavio (1985) suggested that people form a representational symbol that assists erudition, recollection, and performance, assisting automaticity of an activity. Examples of this process could be the following: (1) a flutist who wants to play the flute recalls a scene of himself playing the flute in an earlier occasion; the posture and position of every musculature then adjusted accordingly; (2) a student who wants to play in an aggressive style may recall a memory of a performance of a drummer who plays aggressively, then, postures and recalls herself like the recalled-drummer to achieve the desired performance.

One theory that served as an explanation for imagery facilitating physical performance and learning was the *psychoneuromuscular theory* (Mulder et al., 2004). The theory postulated that imagery resulted in subliminal neuromuscular patterns that were indistinguishable from the patterns utilized throughout actual movement. Though the imagined event did not cause an explicit undertaking of the musculature, subliminal efferent commands were directed from the brain to the muscles. Thus the neuromuscular system was provided the opportunity to "practice" a movement pattern without moving a muscle (Lavallee, 2004). Musicians commonly engage this process
when they desire to practice or memorize their assigned part while their instrument is not physically present.

Another theory that serves as an explanation for how imagery fuels motivation for performance achievement is regulatory focus theory. This theory postulates that a person’s decision-making process is based on positive or negative influences. ‘Promotion focused’ musicians may imagine their future achievements, thus, are motivated to practice. Whereas ‘prevention focused’ musicians imagine potential scenarios of failure for practice motivation (McAuley, 2011). It would be interesting for music education researchers to test this theory on various music student groups and observe what kinds of promotion or prevention mental images influence students’ to practice their music.

The theory of semiotics, founded by Charles Pierce (1834-1914) is the study of signs and meaning. Peirce discussed how we learn through three types of signs for communication in all aspects of our lives. He described a sign to be anything that is perceived by a bystander which stands or calls to mind something else, and by doing so, creates an effect on the bystander (Mick, 1988). These three signs are iconic, indexical, and symbolic. Iconic signs insinuate meaning by way of resemblance. For instance, in notated music composers might indicate the performer to bang on the low register of a piano to mimic the sound of thunder. Indexical signs communicate meaning through conceptual representation. For example, many composers write programmatic music – music that represents a mood, a scene, an emotion, a storyline, and so forth. Contrary to the previous two, symbolic signs have no relation to mental imagery because they are a form of external visual imagery. For instance, a signpost
with an image of people walking across the street informs drivers to be cautious with pedestrians. Hence, icons and indexes are generally the two appropriated with mental imagery since they deal with internal representations.

Contrarily, *Symbolic Form Theory*, founded by Susanne Langer (1895 – 1985) takes on a unique position on symbolism and meaning in music. Langer proposed in her book, *Feeling and Form: A Theory of Art developed from Philosophy in a New Key* (1953), that music highly articulates forms of expression symbolizing direct or intuitive knowledge (i.e. feelings, motions, and emotions), knowledge that language is incapable of conveying. In her stance, symbolic signs (e.g. image of a pedestrian sign) do elicit mental images and recall definitive experiences, and thus, can provide meaning to the percipient. In her work, *Philosophy in a New Key* (1957), Langer discards notions of music being a provocation to sentiment or a manifestation of emotions; rather, music is symbolic manifestation of desired emotions created by the musician:

Music is not self-expression, but formulation and representation of emotions, mood, mental tensions and resolutions—a ‘logical picture’ of sentient, responsive life,” and therefore, like all symbolic presentations, a source of insight and understanding, albeit by means other than language. For “the limits of language are not the last limits of experience, and things inaccessible to language may have their own forms of conception, that is to say, their own symbolic devices.” Music may be said, with certain reservations, to be “about” feeling; and the recognition that such non-discursive forms may be “charged with logical possibilities of meaning . . . broadens our epistemology to the point of including not only the semantics of science, but a serious philosophy of art.

(http://www.huthsteiner.org/Knauth/Susanne_Knath_Langer_Bio_DLBO pdf)

In symbolic form theory, music, above all other art forms, is the tonal analogue of emotive life. The uniqueness of music is that it functions as symbolic
expression of the forms of sentience as the composer comprehends them.

Furthermore, music is not a sign that represents or resembles, rather, it expresses the composer’s knowledge of spiritual life, a kind of knowledge that cannot be well expressed using mere words. Langer made a distinction between discursive and presentational symbols. She proposes that discursive symbolization arranges elements with stable and context invariant meanings into a new meaning. Autonomously, presentational symbolization of elements provides percipients fixed and unwavering understanding; it must be understood as a whole, not progressively. For instance, notes in a musical arrangement unwieldy do not have fixed meaning except in the milieu of the complete presentation. Many blues musicians apply this theory when performing; they may describe their action of performing as playing their feelings, playing their thought, expressing their heart, and expressing who they are through the music. Thus, music provides opportunity for infinite possibilities of meaning based on the percipients’ life experiences; it is not context specific, rather interpretive (Lachmann, 1997).

Neuropsychological research has suggested that neuronal apparatuses akin to perceptive processes may arbitrate the imagery processes. Zatorre and colleagues (1996) examined this notion and explored the neural basis for song imagery by scanning 12 participants with the water bolus method to measure cerebral blood flow (CBF) during the performance of three tasks. Results indicated that to perform the imagery task correctly an internal auditory representation must be accessed. Paired-image deduction of the ensuing configuration of CBF, together with complemented MRI for anatomical localization, showed that both perceptual and imagery tasks
produced similar patterns of CBF changes, as compared to the control condition, in keeping with the hypothesis.

More specifically, both perceiving and imagining songs are associated with bilateral neuronal activity in the secondary auditory cortices, suggesting that processes within these regions trigger the phenomenological impression of imagined sounds. Other CBF foci provoked in both tasks incorporate areas in the left and right frontal lobes and in the left parietal lobe, as well as the supplementary motor area. This latter region implicates covert vocalization as one component of musical imagery. Direct comparison of imagery and perceptual tasks revealed CBF increases in the inferior frontal polar cortex and right thalamus. Zatorre and colleagues (1996) speculated that this network of regions may be specifically associated with retrieval and/or generation of auditory information from memory.

**What it’s used for? Practical application of Imagery**

Much research suggests that imagery plays an integral role in the improvement of perception, production, and pedagogy. People commonly utilize mental imagery as a device for enhancing the cognitive perceptions of the mind and improving the physical capabilities of the human body (Galton, 1880; Betts, 1909; Doob, 1972; Marks, 1972, 1999). Teachers use mental imagery as a tool to bring forth inspiration and a clearer understanding of what is being taught (Weldon & Ankerberg, 2011).

In many cases, imagery experiences are comprehended by their subjects as echoes, copies, or reconstructions of actual perceptual experiences from their past; at other times they may seem to anticipate possible, often desired or feared, future
experiences. Thus, imagery has often been believed to play a large, even pivotal, role in memory (Yates, 1985; Paivio, 1986) and motivation (McMahon, 1973). Imagery is also used to enhance motor performance tasks, as it is believed to be a form of memory representation. Research have contended that the use of abstract mental structures are essentially conceptual and propositional, rather than sensory or pictorial, in nature (Pylyshyn, 1973). Such representations are more accurately referred to as symbolic descriptions than as images in the usual sense.

Imagery for Meaningful Learning

Furthermore, scholars have asserted imagery’s essentiality for inducing meaningful learning (Novak, 2002). Stemming from the cognitivist view, meaningful learning is the process in which the learner consciously integrates newfangled knowledge to knowledge that has been concretionalized (Novak, 2002). Imagery’s function in meaningful learning can be preponderated in two types of learning, associative and representational (Meyer, 2008; Jonassen & Strobel, 2006). Associative learning is the process of combining two elements that are not directly linked for the sake of enrichment or enhancement, of which iconic and indexical descriptors are utilized. For instance, a music teacher may use an iconic description, “Play this musical phrase like a feather,” to enrich the student’s understanding of how to properly play the phrase. The student may then employ the characteristics of a feather (e.g., light, soft, with a taper) to the melodic phrase, both dynamically and articulately, improving their performance through a cognitive translation process. Illustrations of indexical descriptors (in music education) may sound like the following: “Play this passage with a feeling of nostalgia” or “This movement portrays
a scenery of a rain forest with serene landscapes and luscious vegetation.” These types of descriptors are analogies created by the teacher that serve to clarify technical objects and motivate the student to play more expressively, thus, allowing the learning experience to become meaningful.

The second type of learning associated with mental imagery is representational learning, which is essentially the synchronization of two elements that are directly linked for the sake of enrichment or enhancement (Mayer et al., 1996). In a musical context, the music has literal meaning of something specific, according to the composer. The student’s imagery plays an indexical role as the teacher informs them the intent of the composer, which is discovered via autobiographies, letters, interviews, and so forth. For example, each movement of Wolfgang Amadeus Mozart’s *The Requiem Mass in D minor* (K. 626) was inspired and purposefully depictive of biblical stories found in the canonical gospels and the Book of Revelation (Cormican, 1991; Keefe, 2012). This is clearly understood through the lyrics sung by the choir. It seems that the most common way of uncovering the literal intentions of composers is through the lyricism accompanying the music. Perhaps this is why music that contains lyrics and vocals are the most popular forms of music listening that people engage in. Lyrics provide direct meaning to the listener’s cognition, allowing them to understand and relate with the message (Edgerton, 1990).

Renowned psychologist, David Ausubel (1918-2008) described how imagery played an important role in causing a meaningful learning experience:

“... a clearly articulated and precisely differentiated conscious experience that emerges when potentially meaningful signs, symbols, concepts, or
propositions are interconnected to and incorporated within a given individual's cognitive structure." (Takač, 2008, p. 26).

In this statement, Ausubel described imagery being the mediator that produces clearer understanding of a subject. The process occurs when the learner retains the information into the hippocampus region of the medial temporal lobe in the brain; this is where long-term memory is stored (Halpern et al., 1999).

A learner’s understanding of a subject (i.e., music piece, musical concept, and musical approach) requires much more than having the capacity to retain and spew out information; which is an action of rote learning. True understanding can be comprehended as the application of wisdom at the appropriate time; to perceive the intended meaning of a subject. In an article in Bass Magazine (2008), the renowned music clinician, theorist, and performer, Anthony Wellington, shared his view on the importance of learning music from various perspectives – mental imagery was among those. He asserts that the utilization of imagery coaxes conceptual understanding of the music, thus, leads the learner to a “blissful state of consciousness” where freedom of expression occurs. Wellington proposes four levels of awareness, which is based around an idea that every musical concept you know, be it a song, a solo or a lick, you need to know it equally four ways: physically, visually – not with your eyes but with your mind – sonically and intellectually (Wooten, 2008). Without approaching music learning from these four facets simultaneously, Wellington believes it is virtually impossible for music making to become second nature, causing the disenabling of idyllic consciousness. Accordingly, imagery can be a vital perpect for augmenting musicality and attributor for experiencing blissful states of musical awareness.
Research suggests that meaningful learning underlies the constructive integration of thinking, feeling, and acting leading to empowerment and commitment for responsibility (Novack, 2011). Research also suggests imagery’s impact on student’s acquisition may be greater in the applied lesson setting as opposed to large-group contexts. In this setting, students benefit from teacher modeling and learning with vocabulary that includes metaphors, and analogies. The effect of this language can elicit musical expression (Tait, 1992). Through his research, Novak (2002) suggested that learning concepts might be most effective during intrapersonal interactions. He avers that learning processes are to some extent idiosyncratic for every individual; therefore, concepts and propositions have slightly variant meanings for each individual.

Through his research, Kosslyn (1995) proposes that imagery’s function in spatial reasoning, abstract reasoning, skill learning, and even language comprehension is imperative. With mental imagery affecting so many areas of our cognitive and learning processing, no wonder why so many coaches, directors, producers, and teachers implement this utilization of imagery across various disciplines (sports, military, dance, theater-drama, martial arts, and music) to induce optimal mental and physical performance. In this review of the literature, I chose these specified fields due to the similar nature of imagery implementation that is utilized in music fields.
Imagery in Sports and Music

Sports psychologist, Dr. Jim Taylor, described the power of imagery as a tool for transforming doubt to confidence, distraction to focus, anxiety to intensity, timidity to aggressiveness, and inconsistency to consistency. As an athletic trainer, he witnesses the transformational effects of mental imagery on athletes from producing mediocre to outstanding results (Taylor, 1997; Taylor & Shaw, 2002). In an online journal, Psychology Today, Taylor suggests that virtually all great athletes and research implement imagery. Imagery combined with actual practice, strengthens performance more than practice alone. Taylor believes that imagery should not be understood as merely a mental experience that occurs in your head, but rather impacts you in every way: psychologically, emotionally, physically, technically, and tactically. He compares the practice of mental imagery as weight lifting for the mind. (Taylor, 2014). Mental imagery is extensively used as preparatory tool for performance. Sports psychology research suggests that the modality of imagery implemented (e.g. arousal regulation, skill rehearsal) is determined by the athlete’s activity. Research suggests that athletes’ practice of imagery before a performance can positively impact their efficacious and technical outcome (Gregg & Clark, 2007).

Research has testified of important factors that are attributable predictors to the duration of recovery for athletes, which include goal setting, positive self-talk, and the usage of healing imagery, also known as guided affective imagery (Cressman & Dawson, 2011; Evans et al., 2006; Ievleva & Orlick, 1991). Guided affective imagery (GAI) is a common tool that is utilized in the field of psychotherapy and music therapy (Bonny, 2002; Burns, 2001). It is a therapeutic technique in which a
facilitator (e.g., music teacher, coach, or teacher) uses illustrative analogies, often incorporating the senses, to influence the cognizance of the auditor (e.g., athlete, musician, actor, etc.). The aggregation of the patient’s imagination and the dialogue that occurs between the patient and facilitator are significant variables that contribute to the outcome of the patient’s recovery. Investigations in music therapy methods have found the application of GAI in clinical practice convalesced the anxiety level, psyche, and life quality among hospitalized patients (Nolan, 1983; Hammer, 1996; Burns, 2001; Bonny, 2002).

Coaches manage large doses of imagery by way of experiential verbal descriptors to stimulate and provoke the athlete’s mind to perform beyond their expected task. *Experiential imagery* can be understood as imagery that is generated through the influence of past experiences. These descriptors are employed on the athletes during both training season and live competitions. Athletes stimulate their minds and bodies in an attempt to achieve greatness and overcome obstacles, especially when they feel they are in the midst of pressure. Coaches repeatedly address to athletes that the majority of their achievement is psychological (Martin & Hall, 1995). In music, applied lesson instructors may ask their students to recall past achievements, and sometimes failures, as a motivator for practicing.

The cause and effect of mental imagery and intrinsic motivation has been studied as well. Martin and Hall (1995) correlated athletes’ devoted time to practicing golf and the levels of self-efficacy among them. Thirty-nine beginner golfers were divided evenly to three groups: performance plus outcome imagery, performance imagery, or control group with no imagery training. Within three sessions, the first
two groups were taught how to hit golf balls. One group (outcome imagery group) practiced in an imagery training session designed for a specific golf skill. As a result, subjects in both imagery groups had more realistic self-expectation, set higher goals to achieve, and adhered more to their training programs outside the experimental setting. Similarly, Smith and Holmes (2004) found a rise in intrinsic motivation among athletes (golfers and hockey jocks) using various modalities of imagery. Often musicians exercise *goal imaging* during their practice. An example would be a student practicing with a vision of playing at the prestigious Carnegie Hall in New York City.

Taylor (2012) shares that in order for imagery to have optimal influence on the athlete, the athlete must reproduce the actual sport experience from a multi-sensory angle in their head. It involves imagining all of the sights, sounds, physical sensations, thoughts, and emotions that would pertain to the actual event. He believes athletes will produce better results as they practice generating imagery as close to the real-life scenario as possible. Likewise, Ferrington (1993) has advocated the importance of experiencing music as a multi-sensory experience. He suggests that multi-sensory experience is the means in which people today want to experience during musical activities. Evidence of this is seen in the majority of pop concerts today from “A-list” musical celebrities; these concerts utilize lyrics, dancers of sorts, costume and stage design, video, and lighting to captivate audiences.

Furthermore, Taylor believes mental imagery should cause the athlete to have a ‘feeling’ sensation in their body. For instance, if an athlete is overly excited before the competition, they should imagine getting overly excited, then, take necessary
measures to practice self-control. Often you will see Olympian athletes performing and moving their bodies with their eyes closed right before the competition to prepare themselves mentally for the activity. For musicians, this is a common practice called audiation, which Edwin Gordon (2003) describes in his book, A Music Learning Theory for New Born and Young Children, as the cognitive process by which the mind contributes meaning to musical sounds. It occurs when the sound is not physically present; rather, it is imagined in the head. Many musicians habitually practice audiating their performances for sorting ideas (i.e., imagining performing written notation, playing “by ear,” improvising, composing, or transcribing music), and strengthening their memory of a piece of music for a future performance. Kratus (1994) examined the relationships between audiation, the processes of composition, and the musical characteristics of songs composed by 9-year-olds. Participants (N = 40) were given the Intermediate Measures of Music Audiation and were asked to compose a song on a synthesizer during a 10-minute period. Two independent judges observed recordings of the composition periods to determine the amount of time subjects engaged in exploration, development, repetition, and silence. Another pair of judges analyzed the music composed by the subjects for cohesiveness (tonal and metric), pattern use (melodic and rhythmic, repeated and developed), and extensiveness (length and pitch range). Audiation was found to be positively correlated ($p < .05$) with the compositional processes of development ($r = .83$) and silence ($r = .95$) and was negatively correlated with exploration ($r = -.34$). Additionally, audiation was positively correlated with the songs' tonal and metric cohesiveness and developed rhythmic patterns, and negatively correlated with the
songs' pitch range.

Another attribute of effective sports imagery is speed adjustments of the imagery to improve various aspects of athletic performance. Variances in the motions can help athletes perfect their technique and reaction time. For example, athletes may repeatedly practice swinging a bat with the ball approaching at slow motion so they can visually see their batting tendencies and make corrections if needed. Then they are able to increase the speed of the imagery (both mentally and physically) until they can perform it in real-time (Taylor, 2014). Similarly, in a solo or ensemble setting, teachers encourage students to practice arduous passages of their performance in slow motion for the purpose of focusing on the technical and physical aspects of their playing. Not only does slow motion practicing improve better results in technical proficiency, it can serve to eliminate physical problems that arise from mal-practice (i.e., a pianist consistently playing with tense wrists may develop tendonitis.). Sakai (2006) found physical improvements with pianists that were diagnosed with focal hand dystonia by allotting them a slow-motion practice regiment with music of the participant’s choice.

Finally, an integral form of athletic imagery is a process called creative visualization that refers to the practice of desiring to affect the outer world by transforming feelings and expectancies. The foundation for technique is positive thinking and is frequently used by athletes to enhance their performance (Weinberg, 2008). Often, musicians will verbalize positive descriptors to encourage themselves and calm the stress before a performance. From a music therapy perspective, Esplen and Hodnett (1999) found that guided imagery also contributed to a significant
decrease in anxiety levels. Ninety-five percent of student musicians testified that guided imagery made a difference in their performances, instilling a reasonably high level of contentment with the performance. Research has shown that practicing imagery after engaging in relaxation techniques can have a positive effect on graduate students’ self-efficacy for music performance, can regulate anxiety levels, improve concentration, and enhance memory of learned music (Sisterhen, 2005).

**Imagery in Martial Arts and Music**

Like sports, martial arts are activities that engage people in higher-order thinking with the assistance of imagery. The same forms of imagery discussed in the *Imagery in Sports and Music* section also apply to martial artists; the use of imagery in martial arts has shown to be beneficial in several ways. Many martial artists engage in regulatory focus imagery for inducing an increase of adrenaline and motivation for fighting (Smith et al., 1998). According to Cox (1993), martial arts principles, philosophy, and techniques (i.e. the conjunction of physical with imagery techniques) have been effectively functional in clinical scenarios to convalesce the physical comfort of physically challenged individuals. Research suggests that teaching at-risk teenagers and adults a synchrony of martial arts with imagery can modify their behavior and emotions (Glanz, 2004). Research also suggests that instructors utilizing imagery in martial arts instruction can function as a psychological intervention stratagem to augment performance for beginning students (Woodward, 2009).

Imagery-methods in ancient Chinese martial arts have been customary for the development of many maneuvering styles that strongly focus on the harmonization of physical and mental aspects through meditation, and visualizing the *qi* (氣). The
The literal translation of qi is "life force", or "energy flow" (Frantzis, 2008). Qi is a didactic concept, abstract and hypothetical in nature, and is the central underlying principle in traditional Chinese martial arts. Practitioners exercise various patterns of movement with their arms and legs for visualizing their manipulation of the qi (Gallagher, 2003). For some practitioner, Qi is viewed as the deity that is the sole provider and sustainer of life. Other practitioners perceive Qi as a flowing energy, which is visualized mentally, then extracted and borrowed through meditacional and kinetic practices, and finally directed to specific regions of the body that need altering. Shaolin monks, some of the most respected martial arts and practitioners of ancient Chinese traditions, may focus the Qi to their backs, abdominal areas, or heads, cause them to be strong as "iron" (Frantzis, 1997). To test their proficiency in manipulating the Qi, Shaolin monks go through rigorous circumstances such as hanging their bodies to a rope by the heads, and breaking of bricks and rods on the Qi-focused areas of their bodies.

Many maneuvering styles are developed through animal imitation which requires fighters to translate animal characteristics to their posture, stance, offensive, and defensive techniques. These imitations serve for executing moves that would not normally be thought of by humans. Examples of these maneuvering styles are tiger, monkey, snake, and crane (McCarthy, 1999). Musicians in applied practice settings employ a similar method called cognitive translation in which a musician reflects on the characteristic properties of an image (e.g., a woodpecker) and transfer the information to technique. One example would be a musician playing the repeated notes fast, staccato, and forte; akin to the way a woodpecker pecks on a tree trunk.
Imagery in Dance and Music

Similar to sports and martial arts, dance utilizes various forms of dance imagery for building self-confidence (goal imaging), and technical refinement (slow motion imagery). Dancers exercise imagery techniques aimed at inquiring inspiration for aesthetically pleasing and imitative movements (Taylor, 1995) that can convey ‘a story’ to the audience. Many dancers view the art itself as a form of communication (Hanna, 1987). Methods of conveying feelings and emotions to the audience are fundamental topics that are addressed in the field of dance (Rodgers, 1979).

Curiously interested in *when*, *how* and *why* dancer utilize imagery in their practice and performance, Hanrahan (2001) conducted a qualitative study where dancers inscribed their implementation of imagery. Results indicated that dancers employ different types of imagery depending on their current needs throughout the day; many dancers see imagery as a life-style, not limited to rehearsal or performance use. Dancers use imagery to evoke inspiration, to harness atmospheric movements, and to enhance specific movement for routines.

In many cultures around the world, music and dance are not separated, but rather, inseparable by definition (Wade, 2004). As far back as recorded history, music and dance have been utilized to emphasize meaningful stories and to capture the attention of the audience (Baulch, 2008). This is one of the strategic devices human beings have employed for passing on important events that have occurred through history, before written language existed; people did so by utilizing mental imagery (e.g., sound produced by instruments, lyrics, speech) and external imagery descriptors (e.g., dance, drumming) to communicate stories (Hagen, 2003).
Imagery in Acting and Music

If there is one discipline that thrives on the application of mental imagery over any other discipline, it is in the theatrical arts. Though all previously discussed disciplines implement imagery, it is always in conjunction with other variables. However, the art of acting solely operates imagery to its maximum capacity. Some of the operational terms used in acting pedagogy are synonymous to term ‘imagery’: *role play* (refers to the altering of one's comportment to undertake a function, either insentiently to satisfy a communal role, or deliberately to act out an adopted role), *method acting* (the practice of relating to a character by recalling on personal sentiments and memoirs, generally achieved through a set of methods and practices including *sense memory* and *affected memory*) (Alden, 2000).

The chain of event in which imagery effects occur is first, perceptual. Actors train themselves to believe in the world, which they create in their minds. Much of the training requires them to thoroughly study the setting, language dialect, and trends of a particular occasion before engaging in the imagery-induction. Secondly, actors employ imagery-based techniques, which results in a productive effect. With practices such as facing the mirror, recording video footage of themselves, and in many cases role playing twenty four hours a day, the product of imagery-induction techniques manifests itself externally, effecting (convincing) the perception of the actor and the audience as well.

The great acting teacher, Lee Strasberg (1901 – 1982) developed various techniques for influencing the perception of the actor. One of his famous techniques he taught with is called *sense memory*, which refers to the recollection of physical
sensations encompassing emotional events (Strasberg & Schechner, 1996). Another technique he used is called emotional recall, which is the act of recalling a past emotion to cognitively stimulate the actor, and then simulate the character’s particular emotion on to the scene. Constantin Stanislavski (1863-1968) who is considered by many the father of acting pedagogy and theater theory, developed a technique called affective memory; recalling on past memories, then projecting it through the character to harvest a more sincere performance (Whyman, 2007). Similarly, many musicians recollect memories and emotions from past experience for inspiration for composition and performance (Webster, 2002). In some instances, musicians may envision themselves as a particular musical icon or being present in a certain time period raising their level of self-efficacy for the performance (Smith et al., 1976).

A commonality between music and acting is that both art forms utilize improvisation in their practices and performances. In acting, actors generally improvise for refining and recalling of a specific character (Mackay, 2001). In the field of music, musicians may engage in improvisation as a way to bring forth new ideas, which then are refined and retained by way of composition (Kratus, 1995). Additionally, studio musicians are commonly asked by producers to personify emotions and characters to capture the mood of the piece. In Hollywood, many film score recordings displaying the scenes of a film while they are recording. Musicians are not only attentive to the composer, but are peripherally attentive to the movie scenes as well (Cohen, 2011). This is yet another example of imagery used to effect musician’s musical output.
Imagery in Music

Now that theoretical frameworks, practical applications, and comparisons of imagery use in non-music fields and musical settings have been discussed, the researcher synthesizes recent studies in the music education literature that implemented imagery-based instruction for observing its perceptual and productive effects. Finally, the researcher identifies apertures in the literature, suggests potential topics for future research, and discusses how the literature shaped the methodological section of my study.

Imagery in Music Teaching

In the world of artistic development, applied teachers understand more and more the value of mental imagery for developing artistic performance skills, concentration, and theoretical comprehension of the music (Bowes, 2009). Though it is a fairly recent area of research, more scholars are exploring imagery as a pedagogical tool for performance enhancement, and perceptual enrichment. With numerous publications on the practicality of imagery-based instruction, applied music teachers now have the opportunity to implement propitiously tested methodologies in their pedagogy. Teachers are providing their students (e.g., emerging musical artists) with audition techniques and performance simulations (i.e., imagining playing in the actual concert, speaking to the audience, or motivational self-talk) for cultivating higher levels of confidence and self-efficacious feelings toward the actual experiences of performance.

Rosenthal (2004) used a “think-aloud” strategy in a comparative study on the expression-centered practice sessions of professional musicians versus college music
majors. Among all participants, statements using conventional music terminology
(e.g., related to tempo, dynamics) were made three times more often than imaginative
(metaphorical) terminology. This result suggests that musicians recognize that the
ultimate success of their expressive performance hinges on their emotional intentions
being manifested as perceptible sound properties.

Günter (1992) mentioned in the National Association of Teachers of Singing
journal that no satisfactory results could be attained without mental concepts,
exclusive of preparing mental awareness, without training the ear, and without
training the capacity of the imagination. Bowes (2009) suggested that teachers could
assist students in ways to deal with negative self-criticism and use imagery to
strengthen their self-image, thoughts, and feelings that facilitate optimal
performances early in their training. Various forms of imagery-based instructions
have shown to positively affect young musician’s learning and expressivity.

**Imagery for Young Musicians**

From an early age, infants and toddlers often use mental imagery to
manipulate their minds in perceiving the natural world as a place where supernatural
wonders and possibilities occur (Gordon, 1999). For example, children may play
around a game using a household object (e.g., a broom) to represent a medieval
weapon used for conquering an imaginary dragon. Unlike many adults who develop a
fear of self-exploitation hindering their imaginative-creative spirit, children seem to
radiate high levels of self-efficacy for engaging in imagery-based activities such as
playing, singing, dancing, drawing, acting, and so forth (Barrett, 1997).
However, there is a concern that as children grow older, their creative identity is chronically decreasing. One study found that students’ self-efficacy for improvising and composing has decreased as they age (Randles, 2010). Robinson (2007) contended that primary and secondary educational environments demise adolescents’ creative thinking due to the environmental settings students engage in and instructional methods teachers employ (Robinson, 2007). As educators, it is important that we seek out ways to stimulate student’s creative thinking and induce creative action among students; relating descriptive analogies to a subject can be beneficial for witnessing these creative outputs.

*Invented notation*, established by Margaret Barrett, is a term that deals with a method in which children perceive music; they listen to music and notate in drawing-form based on what they imagine. Invented notation is one of many ways in which teachers can understand the imaginative thoughts of young children. Children use idiosyncratic symbols to encode their compositional experiences in music. Barrett proposes that these symbols may be viewed as vehicles for transmitting meaning and are precursors to the development of the culturally agreed symbol systems of the adult literate world (Barrett, 1997). One potential outcome that can spring from utilizing invented notion is the fostering of creativity, self-esteem, and self-efficacy among children.

Creativity is prevalent among young minds; many children do not carry a fear when engaged in music (Barrett, 2004). Often music education begins in a child’s home. Many drummers share similar testimonies of when their initial evidence for their musical enthusiasm occurred. In a conversation with award-winning
percussionist, Johnathan Hulett (Ruiz, October 2nd, 2012), he said his parents observed when him as a toddler banging on pots and pans imagining he was playing a drum set backing up his favorite musical ensembles, like Miles Davis’s Quintet and Tito Puente Latin Jazz All-Stars. While listening attentively to recordings, Hulett began to create external associations with the music he was hearing. Engaging in mental imagery and invented notation made Hulett’s listening experience more enjoyable because he was creating conceptual themes for the music. Hulett said:

It’s exciting to envision what the music is about- what is the scenery, the people involved, and the storyline which the music is portraying. For me, the acts of painting and music-making go hand in hand. I see the music’s colors and textures, so I paint them. Similarly, I enjoy translating stories in my head through musical improvisation, experimenting with ideas, as apposed to listening to music without thematic reference (transcription of interview on September 29th, 2014).

Soon after, Hulett’s use of invented notation influenced a practice regiment for incorporating thematic descriptors to the exercises for conceptualizing the technical exercises at the aesthetic level. The thematic descriptors ranged from moods, sound resemblance, and to invented-short stories. It is an evident and a natural phenomenon to use our imagination for influencing our level of enjoyment of any activity (e.g., playing music or listening to music) at early stages of life.

**Imagery for Musical Expressivity**

Implementing an effective methodology for teaching students expressive performance has been an important theme in musical pedagogy. Some questions commonly contemplated by applied-music teachers include the following: Should instructors teach expressivity solely from a technical description standpoint? If the student needs to understand the conceptual meaning of the music to play
expressively, should teachers teach music using solely imagery-based instruction? Should teachers employ both technical and imagery-based descriptors in lessons for optimum output of expressiveness from the student’s performance? If a teacher desires to start incorporating imagery in applied lessons, it may be wise to use small doses of imagery at first; deep metaphorical language can leave students puzzled and discouraged (Persson, 1996).

The teacher-student relationship within applied lesson settings is a determinant for the success of imagery implementation (Reid, 2001; Siebenaler, 1997). Considering that people learn from various learning styles;aurally, visually, kinesthetic, and any combination of the three (Gordon, 1999), there are students who prefer visual imagery and emotion-based metaphorical language instead of technical instruction directed at concrete musical properties when working on expressiveness. An example of technical instruction: “Widen the vibrato and strengthen the attack, release the air on beat two” (Barten, 1998; Davidson, 1989; Laukka, 2004; Sheldon, 2004).

The very characteristic of imagery-based instruction conveys typical moods humans experience in life (e.g., jubilee, nostalgia, anger, relaxation, and boredom). Other times the music’s motion is interpreted and depicted by the instructor’s jargon and body language. Students can employ these methods, subsequently; it provides them a deeper understanding of the piece they are working on (Woody, 2002). Imagery-based instruction allows for the musician to experience the *humanness* within the music and the *meaning* beyond the notation, thus perform more expressively. This approach may reflect credence that musicians should create
personal expressive renditions based on felt emotion (Laukka, 2004; Lindstrom et al., 2003), as opposed to mimicking expressivity (e.g., emulating human-voice tendencies) through perspicuous preparation of musical properties (Woody, 2000).

Additional research has shown a connection between imagery cues simultaneously influencing the musicians’ expressivity and listeners’ ability to recognize musicians’ intended expression (Gabrielsson & Juslin, 1997). Juslin (2000) utilized three professional guitarists to communicate anger, sadness, happiness, and fear to listeners with three short melodies. Performances were analyzed with respect to five acoustic cues and judged by 30 listeners on adjective scales. Juslin discovered that performers were successful at communicating emotions to listeners, performers' cue utilization was well matched to listeners' cue utilization, and cue utilization was more consistent across different melodies than across different performers.

Woody (2006) also researched the cognitive processes of musicians using imagery to improve expressive performance. He was interested in discovering the extent to which musicians translate imagery into unambiguous plans for the sound properties of music. Subjects ($N = 84$) were given a research packet containing three melodies, each accompanied by an imagery example presented as a teacher's instructions for performing more expressively. Subjects considered the imagery-based instruction, practiced the melodies, and gave a final performance. Additionally, subjects wrote down their thoughts during the process. Results indicated that some musicians used a cognitive translation process, but others chose to create individualized imagery for inspiration.
For many performing artists, the vitality of their performances hinges on conveying emotionality to audiences and as a listener, to perceive the expression of the performer (Woody, 2010). Research has shown that musicians commonly utilize imagery-based methods, such as writing descriptions of the music they are listening to, as a means for understanding the context of the music. After contextualizing the music, musicians may use that information at a designated moment to perform selected musical expressions (Barton, 1998; Woody, 2002). Further research has shown that teachers who educate through imagery-based descriptors and live demonstrations can serve as exemplary models for emulation and imitation (Woody, 1999, 2000, 2006). Verbalizing emotional cues during lessons has been shown to enhance listeners’ perception of performers’ expressivity and communication of emotional intention. If teachers ask their students to play a melancholic tone, students with an adequate amount of technical facility may translate the emotion by adjusting their musculature to play components and motional aspects of music fittingly (Woody, 2004).

**Implications From The Literature Review**

Imagery is affective and effective for performance-based activities. The implications of this review support the notion that implementing imagery in instructional settings can facilitate perception and performance growth with students. It seems to be a principal means through which student musicians learn expressive performance skills (Woody, 2000, 2003). Hence, teachers and students utilizing imagery could be a stepping towards developing musical technicians to become performing artists. Scholars have asserted that the creative thinking processes that
occur cerebrally ultimately manifest exteriorly. However, to the researcher’s knowledge, there is no existing study that has observed technical and imagery-based instruction’s (hereinafter, T-I instruction) facilitation of expressivity among aspiring performing artists’ and if/how their expressivity is communicated to listeners. This is the impetus for the study: to see if T-I instruction can have a positive-domino effect on aspiring performing artists and listeners; in using the term ‘domino effect’, the researcher means that he wishes to observe if/how other outcomes spawn for aspiring performing arts and listeners as they both receive T-I instruction.

So far there are several implications that can be made as suggested by the literature. Teachers often complement their verbal instruction with aural demonstration; this method has been shown to be efficacious (Davidson, 1989; Lindstrom et al., 2003; Rosenthal, 1984). Novel imagery-based research methods are being implemented, due to various studies that have shown its positive productive effects in music and non-music fields. According to studies (Romé, 2014; Schellenberg, et al., 2007), cognitive translation activities for musicians can be beneficial for their musical development. Research (Barten, 1992; Flowers, 1990; Woody, 2002) has shown that undergraduate music students enjoyed more when the combination of imagery and technical descriptors were combined. Students’ individual practice sessions are a starting ground for cultivating motor production skills; these skills are needed across vast disciplines, and are realized using goal imaging techniques. Research suggests that musicians consider their development of expressive, creative thinking, and creative actions to be largely influenced by the utilization of imagery-based instruction (Kostka, 2002; Lindstrom et al., 2003;
Woody, 2000).

Suggestions for Future Research

Conclusively, more research on student’s imagery processes during their practice regiment and performance would be of great value for understanding thoroughly this phenomenon. It would be interesting to see how imagery-based instruction in applied lessons affects aspiring performing artists’ cognitive skills of expressive performance when learning original compositions, or standard notated compositions versus improvisational pieces. Research that investigates imagery’s effects during and after various musical mediums would be desirable. Questions that need further investigation include: (1) What are the effects of the performer’s mental imagery on audience’s perception of expressivity while listening to audio recordings? (2) What are the effects of imagery on aspiring performing artists’ self-efficacy for improvisation? (3) How does exercising conceptual thinking and writing affect aspiring performing artists’ systematic and creative processes? These questions would be advantageous for researching through various research methods (quantitative, qualitative, and mix methods) to understand this phenomenon better. Further gaps in the literature fuel the researcher’s desire to investigate specific questions for this two-phase study, which are discussed in Chapter Three, *Methods*. 
CHAPTER THREE

METHODS

The purpose of this study was to explore the union of technical and imagery-based instruction (hereinafter, T-I instruction) in two phases. Phase one: The researcher (1) explored T-I instruction’s influences on aspiring performing artists’ acquisition of learning and performing newly composed pieces or improvisation, and (2) observed aspiring performing artists’ feelings of learning with T-I instruction versus technical instruction. Phase two: The researcher assessed (1) listeners’ perceived expressivity of aspiring performing artists’ performances that were either influenced by T-I instruction or technical instruction; (2) listeners’ perceived expressivity of aspiring performing artists’ performances of newly composed pieces versus improvisations; (3) whether there was a statistical significant difference of T-I instructions’ influence on the progressive differences in the means of listeners’ perceived expressivity between the aspiring performing artists across the time frame of the study; (4) the explanations for their ratings; and (5) information that helps listeners perceive music as expressive.

Research Design

The design of this study was inspired by ATI experiment—aptitude treatment interaction experiment. ATI experiments are designed to determine whether instructional methods or other interventions have different effects for different types
of individuals (Gall, Gall, & Borg, 1997). ATI experiments are commonly used for quantitative studies. However, the researcher chose to adopt the concept to phase one of the study, which is qualitative in nature. The impact of applying the concept of an ATI experiment to qualitative data is to gain a better understand on the: (1) causes and effects of instructional methods on four unique student cases; (2) deductive and inductive results on aspiring performing artists’ learning and performances; and (3) aspiring performing artists’ opinion of and preferences for two instructional methods (i.e., T-I instruction and technical instruction), ultimately, to gain a better understanding for how, when, and why to implement T-I instruction or technical instruction when teaching aspiring performing artists in applied lessons.

**Phase One**

**Aspiring Performing Artists**

The researcher chose to do intensity sampling, which can be characterized as sampling of a small number of rich cases that provide in depth information and knowledge of a phenomenon of interest. The phenomenon of interests is the effect of T-I instruction versus technical instruction when teaching aspiring performing artists who have chosen to pursue a career as a solo performing artist of interest during applied lessons; also known as *aspiring performing artists*. It was during the researcher’s experience in teaching applied lessons to aspiring performing artists, that he developed an interest in uncovering less-conventional strategies for improving aspiring performing artists’ learning and performance ability such as T-I instruction. Collectively, the literature and a pilot study contributed to the researcher’s unit of analysis and instructional intervention for this study. Four aspiring performing artists
participated in a multiple-case study. All aspiring performing artists hold a Bachelor’s degree in music performance. During the time of the study, three of the aspiring performing artists were graduate students currently pursuing a Master of Music degree in Flute Performance. Aspiring performing artists’ age range was 24-25 years. Aspiring performing artists included three males and one female. Aspiring performing artists’ ethnicity included two Caucasians, one Asian, and one Hispanic. All aspiring performing artists were identified as aspiring performing artists through a pre-screening interview process. In this study, aspiring performing artists are students with an interest of becoming professional musicians in the area of music performance. Only flute players were selected to participate in this phase of the study to control for variations in timbre preference in the following phase. The researcher chose flute players because the flute is his primary instrument.

Each aspiring performing artist was a unit of analysis in phase one of the study. The researcher adapted Nestor Torres’ idea of a performing artist: “An artist is someone who has surpassed the technical aspects of the music and can focus on touching the hearts of the audience” (Nestor Torres, master class at the Frost School of Music, University of Miami, October 29th, 2010). The researcher added to the concept of a performing artist as someone who can think, and communicate their own “ideas” and “approach” to an audience and one who challenges the status quo in a given area of study (Ruiz, 2014).

For phase one, the researcher engaged in participant immersion and fieldwork by being the instructor for the applied lessons to gain a thorough understanding of the nature of the phenomenon that is being explored. Some of his credentials include his
professional background in applied-lesson pedagogy, international-touring clinician experience for a major flute manufacturing company, several albums of flute music, and active career in live performance.

Additionally, an expert in applied lesson pedagogy was recruited to provide accountability for the researcher’s capacity to properly implement the two forms of instruction given to the aspiring performing artists—T-I instruction and technical instruction. The applied lesson expert is a nationally renowned flutist with several albums, and an associate professor of music at a top-tier research university located in the southeastern region of the United States. The applied lesson expert thoroughly reviewed the researcher’s interpretation of the collected data for accountability. The researcher discussed the following with the applied lesson expert: (1) the chronological structure; (2) two forms of instruction utilized in this study; and (3) types of verbal descriptions to be used when discussing various sections within each compositions or improvisation. The researcher rehearsed and memorized the descriptions and script for sake of confidence, consistency, and preparedness as the instructor. The applied lesson expert also reviewed newly composed pieces and play-along tracks to make sure the compositions were similar in style, length, and technical difficulty. This was done to reduce variances within the compositions to assure they were characteristically and technically similar.

The researcher recruited three additional experts for their professional insight and inter-judge reliability after analyzing the qualitative statements individually first and then collectively as a group. Expert #1 is a qualitative researcher in education who has published in top-tier research journals and received a congressional award
for her research; Expert #2 is a professional performing artist who has an extensive trajectory as a higher education professor, clinician, cross-genre performer, and recording artist, and; Expert #3 is a professional jazz musician who has received international awards, tours professionally as a clinician, performing artist, and serves as ambassador for jazz music.

**Newly Composed Pieces**

The types of compositions used for the lessons were *newly composed pieces*—compositions that are not considered standard repertoire in Western art music, have not been premiered previously, and that were composed within a year of the study’s commencement. All compositions were co-composed by the researcher and the applied lesson expert. There were two compositions total. The compositions are written for ‘solo flute’ to control for consistency across the participating aspiring artists. The average time of both newly composed pieces was 53 seconds. Both pieces were composed in a Baroque-Classical style. The techniques involved for playing the pieces included appropriate use of articulation, dynamics, vibrato, space, phrasing, and fluidity when playing scales and arpeggios. The tempo for both compositions were to be played between quarter note = 90 and 110 (see Appendix A). Newly composed pieces were utilized to control for pre-conceived interpretations of standard repertoire. For example, if a participant worked on a J.S. Bach sonata for flute, the recollection of historical and stylistic information from past lessons would become an extraneous variable that attributed to their expressivity. The compositions did not credit the composer or the title of the piece.
Play-along Tracks for Improvisation

Two play-along tracks were composed and produced by the researcher using MIDI instruments in a digital audio workstation. The play-along tracks were accompaniment of the Blues harmonic structure for three choruses with a Latin-jazz rhythmical foundation. The blues style is a genre commonly taught in higher education to Jazz/Contemporary music majors as the foundation for a majority of American improvisatory and popular music. Due to its respect and popularity among many musicians around the world, the researcher saw it as an appropriate genre when teaching new improvisators. The Latin jazz feel exists to introduce additional concepts for consideration when improvising the blues in another rhythmic feels; these days, many styles of improvisatory music intersect. A valuable objective for aspiring performing artists learning improvisation is to improve their improvisational skills across multiple musical genres.

Overall, the purpose of these compositions and play-along tracks was to provide a platform for analyzing T-I instruction on aspiring performing artists’ acquisition of learning newly composed pieces and improvisation. Notated and improvisation-based pieces were used in this study due to the researcher’s speculation that learning newly composed pieces may be internalized differently than improvisational-based compositions.

The Instructions

There were two types of instruction aspiring performing artists received: T-I instruction and technical instruction. The term technical instruction, functioning as the baseline variable, is defined as instruction that focuses on the participant’s ability
to employ control of the instrument to achieve anticipated musical effects by effectively practicing exercises that improve the physical aspects of the performer (e.g., coordination, agility, dexterity, kinetic control) (Kivy, 1993). Here is an example of technical instruction: “Articulate the dotted-sixteenth notes in a staccato fashion, widen the vibrato as you play the whole note fortissimo, and decrescendo moderately as you taper on the whole note to pianissimo.”

The main instruction of interest is T-I instruction, which is defined as instruction that synchronizes technical instruction with *imagery* (e.g., hypothetical inner representations of any sort, such as conceptual descriptors, verbal descriptors, directional descriptors, metaphors, icons, indexes, etc.) that influenced a quasi-perceptual experience (Thomas, 2014; Turino, 2008). Here is an example of T-I instruction: “Approach this passage with a feeling of remorse. With the notes that are legato and pianissimo, play them smooth like velvet cloth. Then widen the vibrato broadly like the flapping of an eagle.”

**Procedure**

Phase-one of this study was a multiple case study where each student received four applied lessons, one lesson each week for four weeks. Each lesson was in a one-on-one setting for ecological validity and to avoid possible extraneous variables. The instructor scheduled the applied lessons at mutually convenient times with the aspiring performing artists. Aspiring performing artists were given a consent form as well as a photography/video release form to be signed and returned prior to participation in this study. Afterwards, a short researcher-devised questionnaire, *Pre-Lesson Questionnaire* (hereinafter, PLQ), was provided to the aspiring performing
artists. The PLQ (see Appendix E) informed the researcher of aspiring performing artists’ involvement with imagery. A few questions (1, 4, 7) functioned as distracters to hide the study’s objectives from the aspiring performing artists.

When the aspiring performing artists arrived to their first lesson, they were greeted by the researcher and asked to turn in their PLQ. Afterwards, the lesson commenced. The nature of applied lessons purpose varied for each student. The type of lessons aspiring performing artists partook were applied lessons, which is defined as private instruction (one-on-one setting) that focuses on the student’s development of essential skills for future application. In this study, applied lessons were geared to strengthen their musical expressivity, using T-I instruction or technical instruction. The impetus for these lessons was to cultivate the aspiring performing artists in becoming performing artists.

The lessons lasted an average of 20 minutes each, which served well for external validity. The compositions are not extended works; the total length of each piece was approximately one minute in length. The rationale for the length of applied lessons was that professional performing artists are often expected to learn and perform music quickly at a high level. Professional performing artists are expected to perform music with excellence in a short time frame. Thus, the allotted time for the lessons is satisfactory for teaching the short compositions to aspiring performing artists. Each lesson was held in either the music education room or instructor’s office at the school of music, without any disturbance. The instructor gave aspiring performing artists the option of not participating without penalty. Aspiring performing artists were allowed to opt out of the study at any moment.
The first two aspiring performing artists, Margaret and James (pseudo-names), were provided two newly composed pieces that did not entail any improvisation. These pieces were akin to compositions that are studied by many classical performance majors. It is common for aspiring performing artists to perform new pieces that are premiered by composers in a university setting. The remaining aspiring performing artists, Greg and Dylan (pseudo-names), were provided two play-along tracks in a Latin jazz feel with chord progressions in the Blues tradition. After each lesson, the instructor and aspiring performing artists took an average of 15 minutes to complete the *post-lesson reflection journal*, hereinafter, PLRJ (see Appendix B). After the PLRJ was completed, aspiring performing artists were dismissed. Two semi-structured bi-weekly interviews (see Appendix D) were conducted with each student upon completing the PLRJ; interviews were held on weeks 2 and 4. All aspiring performing artists agreed to practice their newly composed pieces or improvisation with the play-along tracks throughout the week, and to turn in a *weekly-reflection journal* (hereinafter, WRJ) to the instructor at the beginning of the following lesson (see Appendix C).

**Itinerary for Aspiring Performing Artists**

The nature of applied lessons varied for each student. Margaret and James were paired with the same newly composed pieces. Greg and Dylan were provided the same play-along tracks to accompany their improvisations. James and Dylan served as the baseline and received only technical instruction for the first two weeks as they worked on their first compositions. At this time, Margaret and Greg received technical instruction on the first week and T-I instruction on the second week. During
the third and fourth week, lessons were given in reverse order of instruction to counter the potential order effect. In the two earlier chapters, the researcher presented his case for technique being the foundation for learning music. Hence, the first lesson for each newly composed piece and play-along tracks for improvisation was taught with technical instruction.

**Itinerary for Margaret**

Week 1 – (a) Margaret turned in her PLQ and recorded a sight-read performance of the newly composed piece no. 1. (b) Margaret received technical instruction throughout the lesson. (c) After the lesson, the instructor recorded Margaret’s performance of the composition as an outcome of the technical instruction. (d) Both instructor and Margaret wrote on the PLRJ, which was utilized for qualitative data collection.

Week 2 – (a) Margaret turned in her WRJ #1 and received T-I instruction throughout the lesson. (b) After the lesson, the instructor recorded Margaret’s performance of the newly composed piece no. 1 as an outcome of the T-I instruction. (c) Both instructor and Margaret wrote on the PLRJ, which was utilized for qualitative data collection. (d) A semi-structured interview was conducted.

Week 3 – (a) Margaret turned in her WRJ #2 and recorded her sight-read performance of the newly composed piece no. 2. (b) Margaret received technical instruction throughout the lesson. (c) After the lesson was complete, the instructor recorded Margaret’s performance of the composition as an outcome of the technical instruction. (d) Both instructor and Margaret wrote on the PLRJ, which was utilized for qualitative data collection.
Week 4 – (a) Margaret turned in her WRJ #3 and received technical instruction throughout the lesson. (b) After the lesson, the instructor recorded Margaret’s performance of the composition as an outcome of the technical instruction. (c) Both instructor and Margaret wrote on the PLRJ, which was utilized for qualitative data collection. (d) A semi-structured interview was conducted. (e) Margaret turned in her WRJ #4 the following week to the instructor.

**Itinerary for James**

James received the reverse order of instruction of Margaret to counter the potential order effect. Week 1 was technical instruction, Week 2 was technical instruction, Week 3 was technical instruction, and Week 4 was T-I instruction. All other steps during the lesson remained the same.

**Itinerary for Greg**

Greg’s itinerary was identical to Margaret, except that he focused on learning improvisation. The play-along track no.1 was used for weeks 1 and 2. The play-along track no.2 was used for weeks 3 and 4.

**Itinerary for Dylan**

Dylan received the reverse order of instruction of Greg to counter the potential order effect. Week 1 was technical instruction, Week 2 was technical instruction, Week 3 was technical instruction, and Week 4 was T-I instruction. All other steps during the lesson remained the same.

Six performances were recorded for each aspiring artist performer: a sight-reading performance and two post-lesson performances of each piece. With two pieces for each of the four aspiring artists, a total of 24 recordings were available for
the audience in Phase Two of the study. Figure 3.1 presents a visual diagram of each aspiring performing artist’s itinerary.

**Figure 3.1. Design of Phase One Model**

**Data Collection**

The researcher collected data through multiple methods—video recordings, audio recordings, journaling, interviewing, and field observation—to triangulate findings. Regarding video recording, two video cameras were positioned in different locations of the room where the lessons took place. One camera was angled slightly to the aspiring artists’ side. Another camera was angled slightly to the instructor’s side. Two cameras were utilized for data security purposes (i.e., a back up camera was ‘on’ in case one camera experienced complications). The videos were used to code the body language of aspiring performing artists and instructor to see how the
two forms of instructions affected their learning, performance, and demeanor.

Concordantly, all lessons were audio recorded as a secondary source for transcription purposes, in case the dialogue between the instructor and student is not clearly audible. For capturing optimal clarity of sound, the microphone was a condenser microphone (Audio Technica AT4033/CL). The digital audio workstation used to capture the audio was Garageband, an application compatible with Apple products.

Moreover, the researcher requested the aspiring performing artists to journal their practices throughout the week in the WRJ. A pilot study was done to assure responses made sense to the participants; data indicated that the questions were clearly understood. After all the lessons were complete, the researcher collected the aspiring performing artists’ journals for the coding process to uncover thematic content.

After each segment (bi-weekly), the researcher conducted interviews with each student. The interview questions were the following:

- What did you enjoy most about these lessons?
- Was there any information provided during the lessons that helped you play more expressively? Understand the music better?
- Can you describe anything that was helpful for your musical comprehension during your practice sessions?
- Was there anything the instructor did or said that helped you musically, non-musically?
- Can you describe anything that did not help play the music more expressively? Did not help you get engaged with the music? If so, please explain.

A pilot study was conducted to test aspiring performing artists’ responses to make sure there was no ambiguity with the questions and that responses were fitting
for research analysis. The pilot study indicated that the questions were clear enough for the participants’ comprehension and were answered in great detail and suitable for encoding thematic content.

Data Analysis

The researcher transcribed the audio recordings of the lessons and reviewed the dialogue multiple times for accuracy. Afterwards, the transcriptions were given to the three experts to make sure the transcriptions were accurate in interpretation. The researcher assessed the body language of each student and the instructor from the video to observe how the two forms of instructions affected their behaviors, learning, teaching, and performance. Then, the three experts independently rated the statements and then reviewed the researcher’s statements for inter-judge reliability. Changes of the report were made after consulting concerns with the experts.

Afterwards, the researcher coded the transcriptions of the lessons, interviews, and the participants’ journals. During the coding process, the researcher and expert reviewed the data to collectively agree on uncovered categories and themes in which those categories were under. The researcher was interested in disclosing categories and themes from the implementation of T-I instruction. Afterwards, the researcher did the analysis to address each of the research questions. Graphs were included as visual aid in chapter four, Results.

Phase Two

Listeners

The second phase of the study involved a mixed-methods (QUANT-qual) data collection of the listeners’ rating of perceived expressivity of the participants’
recordings (Giddings & Grant, 2006). The listeners \( N = 60 \) in the study consisted of the following: music-majors \( n = 30 \)—aspiring performing artists enrolled in music courses pursuing a professional music degree at a university, conservatory, college, or community college, and non-music majors \( n = 30 \). Music-majors and non-music majors were selected to see if there were statistical differences of perceived expressivity between the two groups. The researcher valued the opinion of listeners’ perceived expressivity. It is important for performers to understand their audience; hence, the researcher was interested in comparing listeners’ responses to the stimuli and the instructional-affected performances.

The researcher aspired to have demographic diversity for the audience. An eclectic range of ethnicities was included: Caucasian, Hispanics, Asians, African Americans, and Native Americans. Age range of listeners ranged between 18 to 65 years old. Listeners’ academic level ranged from freshman to graduate students. An advantage of the demographic information is that the results may imply college students’ perceived expressivity of musical performances. However, listeners were selected as a convenient sample, and thus, do not represent the overall population of the university and beyond. The ethnic diversity among listeners did strengthen the external validity of listeners attending music performances, as ethnicity may vary broadly in real-world contexts.

**Stimulus recordings**

The stimuli were recordings of performances of aspiring performing artists. Identities of the aspiring performing artists were not disclosed to the listeners. Performances were collected at various stages of each lesson in the previous phase. A
total of 24 recordings were provided for the listeners (six recordings per aspiring artist performer). The recordings were high quality AIFF-files to provide the audience with optimal sonic output during their listening. Recordings played through high-quality headphones. Listeners listened to the stimuli individually with the research present in the room standing away from listener’s peripheral vision. Each recording was approximately one minute in length. The recordings wereuntampered live recordings; the researcher did not mix or edit the recording. Stimuli were presented to listeners in three different sets of random orders to counter the potential order effect. Three versions of the stimuli were provided to three groups of listeners through three versions of the PEQ for a balanced design. Listeners 1 through 20 received version A, listeners 21 through 40 received version B, and listeners 41 through 60 received version C.

Perceived Expressivity Questionnaire

Part of this study aimed at investigating listener’s perceived *expressivity* while listening to the performances of newly composed pieces from phase-one. Expressivity has been defined as “serving to express, utter, or represent [emphasis added]; effectively conveying meaning, intention [emphasis added], or feeling; ‘an expressive [emphasis added] silence;’ *Showing* emotions and feelings clearly and openly” (Webster’s Dictionary, 2014). From a musical standpoint, Palmer (1997) defined it as the variations in timing, intensity, dynamics, timbre, and pitch that differentiate it from another performance of the same music. In music, the term *expressivity* can have varied meaning depending on the context. For this study, the term *expressivity* was defined as translating music meaning, intention, or feeling through use of
variations in timing, intensity, dynamics, timbre, and pitch (Ruiz & Temple, 2014).

To determine listeners’ perceived expressivity, the researcher utilized a researcher-designed questionnaire entitled *Perceived Expressivity Questionnaire* (PEQ) (see Appendix A). Two pilot studies were conducted to test out the readability, content validity, and internal consistency of listeners’ responses. The instructions for answering the questionnaire were modified to a simpler language due to several listeners expressing confusion when reading the instructions. To make sure listeners’ understood the instructions and the definition of expressivity, the researcher recited the instructions and the operational definition of expressivity, and provided several examples of the term. The test commenced only after listeners understood the instructions for the PEQ.

To assure validity, the researcher included an opportunity for listeners to explain their reasons for their ratings. In the previous two pilot studies, listeners’ statements were consistent with each rating and with the provided definition of expressivity. Thus, the listeners’ responses indicated that PEQ was a suitable instrument for collecting data on listeners’ perceived expressivity. In the first pilot study, the stimuli included performances of six genres with different musical instruments.

Regarding the internal consistency of the PEQ, results from the first pilot study were shown to be less consistent for eastern hemisphere-based instruments (i.e., kalimba) and musical genres that were less familiar to the listeners (i.e., West African drumming, and Latin jazz); the overall internal consistency of listeners’ responses was $\alpha = .68$. For the second pilot study, several modifications were made: Only
instruments that are common to the Western art music and American popular music were utilized. Only three genres were included in the stimuli (i.e., Western art, American popular music, and Jazz) as opposed to six genres. The overall consistency of listeners’ responses was $\alpha = .73$.

The questionnaire consisted of 24 items. Each item consisted of a seven-point scale that rated the degree of expressivity of each stimulus. Anchors one through seven on the scale measuring perceived expressivity were: 1 – minimum, 2 – low, 3 – moderately low, 4 – moderate, 5 – moderately high, 6 – high, 7 – maximum. Below the Likert-type scale was an open-ended section where listeners explained their reasons for their ratings. The final section of the PEQ included (1) a Brief Essay Response where listeners were asked to list any information that helps them to perceive music as expressive, and (2) demographic questions (see Appendix E). The three experts from phase one of the study also assisted the researcher in analyzing the qualitative data from the Perceived Expressivity Questionnaire (hereinafter, PEQ) for phase two of the study.

**Procedures**

The second stage of this study was to administer the PEQ to the listeners. The battery was administered to listeners individually. The researchers explained the battery to each listener with the following statement: “You are going to rate the expressivity of a collective recorded performances from various performers.” Tests were conducted in an isolated room with one listener at a time. The researcher gave them the option of not participating without penalty, if they desired not to. Listeners were allowed to opt out of the test at any moment.
After reciting the instructions and operational definition of expressivity, providing examples of the term, and confirming that listeners understood the objective the study, the researcher played the stimuli to the listeners. Listeners were directed to rate the performances separately. The timing in which the stimulus was played was dependent on the completion of the previous responses. After the battery was administered, the researcher stationed himself away from the listeners to avoid influencing their answers with body language or dialogue. An assistant stayed in the room to monitor the productivity of the listeners taking the PEQ while the researcher controlled the stimuli.

**Data Collection**

Phase-two of this study was to assess listeners’ perceived expressivity of aspiring performing artists’ performances influenced either by T-I instruction or technical instruction. Considering the operational definition of *performing artist* provided earlier, and the unit of analysis (i.e., aspiring performing artists), the researcher found it valuable and appropriate to determine listeners’ perception of aspiring performing artists’ expressivity. Quantitative data were collected for comparing the progressive differences of perceived expressivity with the PEQ. Qualitative data were also collected with the PEQ to uncover themes that could suggest listeners’ reasons for their ratings and information that helps listeners perceive music as expressive.

**Data Analysis**

To determine the progressive differences of listeners’ perceived expressivity, and stratified means of demographic data, mixed-effects ANOVA was to be applied
using the statistical analysis software (SPSS). However, the Cronbach’s alpha statistic was implemented to establish the internal consistency of the data, to see if it was beneficial to proceed with further statistics to analyze as a whole. After statistical measures were applied, the researcher reviewed all the listeners’ rationales for their ratings. The researcher coded responses thoroughly and collectively, discussed findings with the three experts, and agreed on titles for recurring themes that were uncovered.

Now that the methodology for both phases of the study has been discussed, the researcher will discuss the outcomes of the study in chapter four, *Results.*
CHAPTER FOUR

RESULTS

The purpose of this study was to explore the union of technical and imagery-based instruction (hereinafter, T-I instruction) in two phases. Phase one: The researcher (1) explored T-I instruction’s influences on aspiring performing artists’ acquisition of learning and performing newly composed pieces or improvisation, and (2) observed aspiring performing artists’ feelings of learning with T-I instruction versus technical instruction. Phase two: The researcher investigated (1) listeners’ perceived expressivity of aspiring performing artists’ performances that were either influenced by T-I instruction or technical instruction; (2) listeners’ perceived expressivity of aspiring performing artists’ performances of newly composed pieces versus improvisations; (3) whether there was a statistical significant difference of T-I instructions’ influence on the progressive differences in the means of listeners’ perceived expressivity between the aspiring performing artists across the time frame of the study; (4) the explanations for their ratings; and (5) information that helps listeners perceive music as expressive.

This chapter begins with some background information of each aspiring performing artist in phase one. Then, the researcher presents an analysis of qualitative data. Consecutively, the researcher addresses the data analysis for phase two, discusses the unacceptable internal consistency of listeners’ perceived expressivity and provides a summarization of the findings from the study.
Phase One

Background of Students

To better understand the uniqueness of each aspiring performing artist, background information was collected through the PLQ, participant immersion, post-lesson journals, and bi-weekly interviews. By seeing their backgrounds, readers may resonate with their own teaching context. The results are meant to provide an in-depth look at how the two forms of instruction—T-I instruction and technical instruction—affect each students’ learning, performance, sociality, behavior, emotions, and so forth. It is the researcher’s goal to address the benefits and consequences for utilizing the two forms of instruction when teaching newly composed pieces and improvisation to students with unique backgrounds. Hopefully, readers may gain a deeper insight and implications for the phenomenon of teaching T-I instruction to students who have aspirations of becoming performing artists.

Margaret

Sassy and outgoing in personality, Margaret is passionate about her family, performing music, fashion, and socializing with her friends; especially going out for Starbucks. She has over a decade of experience playing the flute. She is open-minded when it comes to learning new music and loves to attend concerts. Her musical background primarily consists of performing in wind ensembles, orchestras, and flute choirs. She considers herself to be an inefficient sight-reader but a diligent practitioner of pieces, hence, prefers to take time learning pieces before performing them in front of an audience. Margaret is timid when asked to perform on the spot. She is most comfortable performing with other musicians after she has socialized
with them in a non-musical context. Auditions are nerve-racking for her. To cope with nerves, she uses breathing techniques, repetitive positive phrases, and imagery of serene settings. For Margaret, music is deeply connected with emotions. The utilization of imagery plays a large role in her ability to learn and perform pieces. She enjoys giving applied lessons to high school students when she can, however, struggles to find time to teach since she juggles her life between having to work and pursuing her career in music performance and education. Margaret is not sure how she could attain a professional career in performance, nevertheless, believes that the right opportunities will fall into place in the right time.

James

If ever there was a person who is extremely talented in two art mediums (i.e., music and fine arts), it is James. James began playing the flute in middle school concert bands, competed and won in regional and state large ensemble competitions, and currently performs in a professional wind ensemble. His painting career began when he was a toddler. James’s talent reached a professional level in high school, which allotted opportunities to receive many commissions from people across the country. James has competed and ranked in numerous national fine art competitions. Having performed in state and national conferences, including Carnegie Hall, James’s music career is equally impressive. As a flutist, James is drawn to Western art music, especially symphonic works and flute repertoire. He possesses great technique on the flute and is quick at learning new repertoire. When listening to music, James stated that he formulates meaning and invents storylines in his mind for music that he listens to. This activity gets him excited to learn music and helps set a goal for playing
expressively. James stated that his preferred form of instruction is technical instruction since his technique generally needs the most refinement when learning a piece. Deemed by many flutists, James is natural in exuding expressivity on the flute. At times, his flute timbre is fair and interpretation of Western art music is not appropriate to the style; hence, consistency is his paramount goal to attain as a flutist. He has a high level of self-efficacy for playing the flute and aspires to expand his career as a professional painter and performing artist.

Greg

A native of Puerto Rico, Greg is a student who absolutely loves to perform and entertain in front of audiences. The three experts and researcher would consider Greg to be the most well rounded flutist of the four aspiring performing artists. He has fabulous technique on the flute, interprets classical repertoire with a high level of expressivity, performs difficult flute repertoire by memory, arranges popular tunes for small ensembles, and improvises fluidly in Latin jazz and American popular music. His music career synchronizes his passion for modeling and advertisement; he has appeared in numerous commercials and billboards in Puerto Rico. Two of Greg’s latest achievements are his endorsement deal with an internationally recognized flute manufacturing company and becoming Latin-Grammy nominated. Greg is eager to expand his ability to improvise in other genres of music. He doesn’t feel competent improvising over the Blues or be-bop; yet, he has a high level of confidence and willingness to learn. Greg stated that he always utilizes imagery to help him perform; it is his preferred method for learning music. To perform memorized repertoire, Greg imagines the score to the music and reads the shape of the melodic structures. Greg
also employs acting techniques to enhance his stage presence. His main goal as a performer is to transcend the music and communicate his heart to the audience.

**Dylan**

A native of Vietnam, Dylan, an accomplished flutist who has won a national flute performance competition, has performed in several professional large ensembles and has given weekly-applied lessons to many middle school and high school students in the community. Additionally, he was awarded a teaching assistantship to a premiere music school in the northeast region of the United States. The three experts and researcher agree that this student possessed the most refined timbre and technique for Western art flute repertoire. Dylan concentrates passionately on timbre and vibrato when practicing his flute. He feels very competent in sight-reading, performing scales and arpeggios, and performing Western art flute repertoire in front of a live audience. Dylan loves to witness lavish improvisations by other flutists but had felt incapable of learning to improvise with poise before partaking in the study. He was very enthused to work on improvisation in this study and hoped to gain some insight for becoming a better improviser. Dylan’s main goal is to tour as a multi-faceted solo flute artist and music educator providing students with wisdom for becoming effective technicians, sight-readers, interpreters of Western art music, and competent improvisers.

Each of the four aspiring performing artists are unique in their musical upbringing and experience, degree of expressivity, skill set, strengths and weakness, self-concept, and aspirations. The commonality is their aspirations to obtain an
established career as a performing artist. The researcher now turns to the processes for analyzing the data and then reports the results for phase one of the study.

Analysis of Qualitative Statements

Qualitative statements were collected from the aspiring performing artists through several means: (1) pre-lesson questionnaire, post-lesson journals, weekly reflection journals, and bi-weekly interviews, (2) transcriptions from applied lessons, (3) instructor’s post-lesson journals, and (4) experts’ observational journals. Codes were determined and organized in conceptually clustered groups several times, then discussed between the researcher and experts until there was agreement for the organization of sub-themes, themes, and meta-themes (Strauss, 1987; Saldana, 2008).

Transcriptions were reviewed independently and then collectively over a period of two weeks, two meetings each week. The researcher color-coded all the data; pre-determined colors were assigned to deductive themes and assigned other colors as inductive themes emerged from the data. The experts assisted the researcher in (1) attentively journaling their observations of the video footage and audio recordings, (2) coding the transcriptions of the pre-lesson questionnaire, post-lesson journals, weekly reflection journals, and bi-weekly interviews, and (3) discussing and agreeing on the emerging categories and themes discovered in the study.

Two research questions are thoroughly discussed and supported with qualitative statements in this chapter:

I.a. What is T-I instruction’s influence on aspiring performing artists’ development of expressivity while learning newly composed pieces or improvisation?

I.b. What are the aspiring performing artists’ feelings of T-I instruction versus technical instruction in applied lessons?
For phase-one, the researcher’s and three experts’ joint descriptive coding yielded a total of 60 sub-themes, 16 common themes, and 2 meta-themes. For the first research question, the researcher tested six deductive themes: emotional connection, frame of reference, self-efficacy for performance, improved technical facility, improved cognition for improvisation, and enhanced expressivity as inspired by the literature (Woody, 2006, 2008; White, 2011). Seven inductive themes emerged: non-threatening environment for learning, intrinsic motivation for practice, enjoyment for learning, modern music technology, life satisfaction, multi-faceted musicianship, and redefining performing artist. Two meta-themes were formulated from the 13 themes that appeared for the first research question: learning and quality of life. For the second research question, three inductive themes emerged: preference for improvisation-learning students, variability for instruction, and additional support for T-I instruction. A synthesis of the emerged findings for each question is provided. Qualitative statements are included to support the emerged findings. Figure 4.1 presents a diagram that represents the structure of these themes.
Figure 4.1. T-I Instruction’s Influence on Aspiring Performing Artists’ Acquisition of Learning Newly Composed Pieces or Improvisation
Research Question I. a.

Learning

Under the meta-theme of learning, the researcher will describe the 10 themes in the sequence as indicated on Figure 4.1.

Fostered Emotional Connection

The first theme that emerged was emotional connection. Aspiring performing artists expressed that T-I instruction helped them feel more connected to the newly composed pieces and their improvisations. Four sub-themes appeared under emotional connection. The first sub-theme was concentration. By concentrating on episodic imagery or emotional indexes (i.e., imagery portraying an emotion or mood) and associating the imagery to their pieces or improvisations, aspiring performing artists stated it became easier to bring out the emotionality of their performances. Additionally, aspiring performing artists were elated to partake in instruction that allowed them to focus on emotional aspects of the music as opposed to focusing on solely technical aspects. The second sub-theme was personalization. Aspiring performing artists expressed that T-I instruction helped them become more personal with the music. Often they feel disconnected when learning newly composed pieces since (1) they are not the composers, and (2) don’t always know the significance of the piece or how to relate with the composer. By associating representational imagery to the piece, aspiring performing artists felt they were able to personalize the music, and thus, interpret and convey their emotionality during performance. Train of thought was another aspect of emotional connection that appeared. Aspiring performing artists expressed that T-I instruction helped change their train of thought
for becoming more emotional performing artists and to perform music in a heartfelt way; this was important goal for them to achieve. When asked what are the impetuses for becoming a performing artist, one common response each individual expressed was a desire to communicate their emotionality to audiences. The fourth sub-theme was translating image to emotion. When learning improvisation, Greg and Dylan stated they enjoyed translating different emotions through improvisation by analyzing the characteristic of the emotion (i.e., thinking of how the physical body is affected when experiencing that emotion and then cognitively transferring those properties into their technique to emulate the desired emotion). For example, Greg thought about how a person tenses his or her muscles and breathes heavily when experiencing anger. In turn, he tensed up his embouchure and blew the flute with a heavier airstream to manipulate the timbre to sounding angry.

In essence, statements within the pre-lesson questionnaires and post-lesson journals suggest that one of the central goals for the aspiring performing artists was a desire to develop an emotional connection with the music and project emotionality and expressivity to the audience. Often the issues they experience are finding time-efficient and quality-efficient tactics during their practice regimen to develop personal connections with the music and produce expressive performances. Margaret and Greg admitted to having a technical-thought process during their practice and accredit that inclination to the influence of former teachers’ pedagogical approaches. The application of imagery and conceptual thinking when learning music was a tactic utilized by all aspiring performing artists to facilitate emotional connectedness with the music prior to this study. After receiving T-I instruction, each of them were
reminded of many benefits that spawn from learning with imagery and felt encouraged to continue to apply the synchronization of technical and imagery-based instruction during learning and performance to facilitate emotional connectedness with the music. In her post-lesson journal, Margaret expressed her belief of the importance of thinking about and receiving music as an emotional force. Notice the numerous times the word ‘emotion’ was stated in the aspiring performing artists’ testimonies. They stressed the importance of having a solid technical foundation, not to display, rather, for allowing them to express their feelings. Each of them view music as a communicative tool:

As an artist, I want to relate with whoever I am playing for. People attend concerts to partake in the inexplicable power of music and to experience the manifestation of human expressions. When I think about what it is I desire to gain when listening to an instrumental performance, my hope is to understand what the performer is trying to convey; their emotions, their heart, their musicality, and their thoughts. So, when I perform for an audience, I want to make sure that all the technical aspects of my playing are solid. That way I can focus on the emotionality of the music. I want people to feel the emotions I project through my instrument. The big struggle for me has always been balancing out my focus on the technical and artistic aspects of the music – the meaning, what it represents, the visual aspects, the feelings, the colors; this can be tedious, and time consuming. I feel like the way the teacher taught the second lesson opened my eyes to a new approach for training myself to become more a musical, emotional, and expressive player. (Margaret, post-lesson journal #2)

…sometimes I have difficulty in becoming a more expressive performer. Today’s lesson helped me learn the music at a much quicker pace and in a more expressive way. I finally started to understand the feelings and emotions of the piece. Using imagery and concepts reminded me to be conscious of the emotion, mood, colors, and feelings I am conveying to an audience. What’s the story I want to communicate to the audience? I was reminded today that an artistic approach (thinking creatively and imaginatively) would translate in the execution of my performance in becoming more emotional. (James, Post-lesson journal # 4)

I think a great performer has the ability to express whatever they desire to express; whether it be an emotion, a scenery, a mood, colors, or the deepest
secrets within their heart. That’s what I want to do. That’s the main goal I aspire to achieve and why I practice so hard. It is definitely easier said than done. I learned from the instructor that if I practice thinking about music, the way it feels, the way it sounds, the mood it creates, what it smells or tastes like, that could help my playing come across as more expressive to whoever I play for. Music definitely is an emotional expression and I think I’m getting better at conveying it through my instrument. (Greg, post-lesson journal #2)

It has been really fun applying what I’ve learned today this week in my practice. The way the teacher related the notes I select when I improvise to an image helped me develop more emotional solos. Now when I improvise, I will think more conceptually rather than stressing out over all the theory and scales. I just need to play from my heart. Whatever I feel or think, I should let it out.” (Dylan, post-lesson journal #4)

It is also interesting that the aspiring performing artists expressed their appreciation for receiving imagery during the applied lessons more so than technical instruction for bringing out the emotionality in their playing. Teaching with T-I instruction expedited their technical development and allowed them to practice the aesthetic aspects of the music.

A commonality existing within each quote is the aspiring performing artists’ desire to project emotionality through their music to the audience. They achieve this by mustering up images of moods, colors, and feelings as the source of inspiration for humanizing their music, and making their performance sound less technical. It appears that T-I instruction can be a useful method of instruction for establishing an emotional connection with music, which is a central goal for the aspiring performing artists.
Provided Frame of Reference

The second theme that emerged was frame of reference. Aspiring performing artists expressed that T-I instruction provided a foundational understanding and direction for learning the music. Without having a frame of reference for playing a piece of music, feelings of insecurity and a lack of desire to practice music would manifest within the aspiring performing artists, ultimately, leading to them wondering their purpose for learning music; especially for newly composed pieces and improvisation. Hence, there were three sub-themes that appeared under frame of reference: newly composed pieces, improvisation, and purpose. Aspiring performing artists communicated that T-I instruction was a useful tool for providing a frame of reference for learning what to convey when performing newly composed pieces. In turn, having a frame of reference facilitated their ability to perform music with more expressivity. According to the aspiring performing artists’ weekly-reflection journals, normal procedures when learning a new piece commenced with researching background information about the composer and the piece. The goal for this process was to see if they could relate with any information discovered about the composer and to understand why the piece was created. Second, they listened and watch performances of the piece, and created conceptual descriptors (e.g., imagery that relates to the piece) to humanize the music, discovered the piece’s mood, color, meaning, and so forth. This activity was viewed as one of the first creative processes aspiring performing artists underwent, and they preferred to commence this stage before learning the technical information for playing the piece. Since the aspiring performing artists were not given background information or conceptual descriptors
during the first lessons of each newly composed piece or improvisational piece, they felt the extent of their expressivity was limited to technical proficiency. Upon receiving T-I instruction, the instructor and aspiring performing artists were able to address technical, emotional, historical, and expressive concerns simultaneously during the applied lesson. The instructor provided opportunities for aspiring performing artists to formulate their conceptual ideas for each piece as well, which they utilized to enhance their performance. Allotting them to formulate their own imagery as opposed to having the instructor suggest imagery also showed to an effective method for fostering students with autonomy, creative thinking, and solidifying frames of references much like an imprint in their minds.

Frames of references for improvisation were also an emergent concept that showed to be beneficial when teaching with a synchrony of technical and imagery based examples in lessons. Aspiring performing artists learning improvisation felt that T-I instruction helped them approach improvisation with more fluidity by cognitively responding to the imagery formulated in their minds. Greg stated that when desiring to improvise melodies based of a motive, he envisioned the over-arching motion of the melody and constructed his improvisation in an architectural manner by foreseeing the shapes and angles of which the melody resembled. For James, associating imagery to selected passages of the newly composed pieces was a fun and creative way of thinking about the music. Considering he is a visual learner, T-I instruction showed to be a promising method of establishing references for what the music could resemble, and thus, directed his technical practice towards portraying the established image. It seems that incorporating aesthetic qualities, symbolism, and
meaning helped aspiring performing artists establish a sense of purpose for their performances.

During the first lesson, Margaret and James indicated they had difficulty in understanding the purpose for learning newly composed pieces with technical instruction. Upon receiving T-I instruction, they gained a better understanding of the purpose for playing the music. By applying T-I instruction in their practice, Margaret and James were able to perform purposefully so that the music can transcend beyond the notes on the page. Their facial expressions showed greater enthusiasm when discussing symbolisms associated with the pieces and their bodies had more movement when performing significantly more than when receiving solely technical instruction. Greg’s and Dylan’s improvisations became more organic and less mechanical over time. In the initial stages of learning improvisation, their approach was very scalar and did not deter away from eighth notes. By introducing imagery into the lessons, Greg and Dylan became less concerned with theoretical information and focused on their emulating pre-determined images. Hence, their solos had greater variety of nuances that were unique to each individual; their solos resembled the human voice. During the first bi-weekly interview, they both expressed a desire to perform music with objectives related to their performances’ affects – in other words, aspiring performing artists’ performances became contextual-oriented or mission-oriented. Greg felt the T-I instruction helped him understand the meaning, representation, feeling and colors that the music exudes. Dylan stated that through the application of T-I instruction over the course of the study, he developed a purpose for becoming an improviser – to uplift and inspire his listeners. The selected quotes
below indicate that aspiring performing artists are eager to learn background information of the piece. Each of them aspire to learn the significances of a piece:

I would say that one of the things I gained out of this lesson is a better understanding of the music and what it is about. When I was first learning this piece, I wasn’t sure what to make of it. I’ve never heard of the piece before so I didn’t have a frame of reference for playing it – How do I interpret the music? How do I make it come to life? What is the significance of the piece? Who was the composer? These are all questions that popped in my head (like with any song I learn). When the teacher taught with imagery descriptions, I started understanding it better. I finally had a frame of reference. (Margaret, post-lesson journal #2)

This week has been really exciting for me and my practice sessions. For the longest time, I’ve had difficulty knowing how or where to begin when learning a new piece, especially this one. Since, I don’t know who exactly is the composer and have never heard the piece, I’ve been incorporating imaginative thinking to help create context for the music. Relating the music to a feeling or a story (based on what it sounds like to me) has been a way for me to establish a foundation for tackling various aspects of this piece during the learning process. (James, weekly reflection journal #4)

Today was really interesting because the approach the teacher used during the lesson reminded me of the way people teach in my culture. Where I come from people use all kinds of parables and metaphors to have a greater impact on student’s learning of a subject. It was really nice to experience that again during the lesson. It worked for me while learning to improvise over the Blues because it gave me direction and motive for improvising. As a student, I learn and play best when I have some type of foundation. Using imagery and storylines this week helped establish the basis for everything I practiced.” (Greg, weekly reflection journal #2)

…and when the instructor used image descriptions during the lesson, that really helped serve as a reference for how to improvise over the music.” (Dylan, post-lesson journal #4)

To provide a frame of reference, the instructor chose to utilize various types of imagery examples depending on the learning context (i.e. compositions or improvisations). Since the instructor did not reveal information of the composer to control for subjectivity, he asked Margaret and James to formulate a hypothetical
storyline or emotion for them to cognitively transfer characteristic of the image(s) to their performance. For Greg and Dylan, representational descriptor (i.e. parables and metaphors) showed to be an effective way of providing direction for organizing their ideas for improvisation.

**Provided Non-Threatening Environment for Learning**

The third theme that emerged was non-threatening environment. Students expressed that T-I instruction provided a learning environment that mediated their ability to learn, communicate, and enjoy during the applied lessons. Learning improvisation, stress, and relaxed were three concepts that appeared within non-threatening environment for learning. Both Greg and Dylan expressed that T-I instruction facilitated a non-threatening environment for learning improvisation. Since they were new Blues improvisers, both felt nervous about being negatively judged by the instructor. This feeling was debunked during their first lessons while receiving technical instruction. Upon receiving T-I instruction, Greg and Dylan expressed exuberant amount of comfort for learning and performing improvisations. Their shoulder became less tense, particularly when the instructor insinuated a humorous image for the aspiring performing artists to reproduce through improvisation. The instructor also demonstrated on his flute how he would interpret images provided by the aspiring performing artists, which not only made the environment stress-free, but also enjoyable.

*Stress* was another concept that emerged for Margaret and James. While learning newly composed pieces with T-I instruction, both of them expressed they felt less tense when the instructor utilized metaphors describing the motives within the
music, and were “comfortable learning the music.” In Margaret’s case, she often feels a sense of insecurity when it comes to practicing and playing notated music in front of peers due to the social environment being highly competitive and fairly judgmental. Furthermore, Margaret stated she has experienced moments when she cannot function cognitively or perform optimally during rehearsals and lessons if instructors are overly technical in their instruction; she agitates when instructors become sticklers for flawless technical performances, yet fail to address other aspects necessary for music-making. Upon receiving T-I instruction, Margaret expressed more joy in her body language while performing notated music. She did not hesitate to ask questions, make jokes, or play what the instructor requested.

Finally, feeling relaxed was another sub-theme the appeared within the aspiring performing artists’ testimonies. Each individual felt that the instructor was able to create a playful atmosphere by implementing T-I instruction during applied lessons, which made it an enjoyable learning experience for learning music. All aspiring performing artists expressed they enjoyed the humor exuded in the imagery examples, and thus, T-I instruction influenced their learning environments and their moods to become more relaxed; contrary to how they felt when partaking in a technical instruction-based applied lesson. Overall, aspiring performing artists felt relaxed, comfortable, and at ease to experiment with new ideas when performing in front of the instructor. Notice how the aspiring performing artists describe the dynamic of the applied lessons with T-I instruction as being fun, comforting, relaxed, and therapeutic:
The teacher addressed my issues in a fun way; he helped me get all the technical stuff out of the way and made connection with imagery. That was fun and comforting. (Margaret, Post-lesson journal #4)

Today didn’t feel like the typical lesson I experience every week. We had tons of fun. I felt like I could be myself and relaxed, and yet, learn. I felt much more relaxed than I did during the first week of lessons. The way the instructor presented the music to me today made it really fun to study the music. In general, I enjoyed his descriptive approach. So much of the time, I focus on the technicalities of the music that I sometimes forget that music should tell a story to the listener. Today my imagination was provoked in a positive way. I felt like a kid who could use his imagination to play; in this case, play around with the music. (James, Post-lesson journal #4)

…and it was really nice to feel ‘at home’ during the lesson. The teacher’s way of communicating symbolism and meaning to music got me in a playful and creative mood; improvisation didn’t feel like a task. It was enjoyable. (Greg, Post-lesson journal #2)

One of the surprising things I noticed today was how comfortable I felt. I think I am becoming more enthused and concentrated when improvising. The lesson was really therapeutic in a way; the teacher presented the music in a way that I could relate to. (Dylan, Post lesson journal #4)

These statements indicate that teaching with T-I instruction creates a comforting environment for learning, which is vital for aspiring performing artists if they are to experiment and explore new boundaries within the music. Engaging in creative musical task can be daunting, especially if the aspiring performing artist is unfamiliar with the music. To ensure their emotional safety, the instructor demonstrated that creative thinking was a welcomed action in the applied lessons by implementing T-I instruction.

**Enhanced Intrinsic Motivation**

The fourth theme that emerged was *intrinsic motivation*. Aspiring performing artists expressed in one way or another that T-I instruction renewed their desire to practice more frequently; an essential quality necessitated for experiencing success as
performing artists. It is not uncommon for performers to experience *roadblocks* during their practice sessions. Often, music students may reach a ceiling that prevents them from progressing in their craft, and then become unmotivated to practice. All aspiring performing artists indicated they have experienced moments or seasons in their musical careers of difficulty attaining motivation for personal practice. The lack of desire to practice is often attributed to their low self-concept as creative thinkers and performers. Margaret and Greg stated they sometimes reach roadblocks that hinder their ability to play with expressivity, conviction, and authority. Furthermore, Dylan asserted he has had difficulty in translating what he audiates into physical sound. These roadblocks can be constituted as the lack of understanding for (1) *why* the music was composed, (2) *why* they are playing the music, (3) *what* the music represents, resembles, or symbolizes, and (4) *how* to play the piece with technical appropriateness. Upon receiving T-I instruction, aspiring performing artists felt they were receiving a form of instruction that was well rounded, and that ameliorated roadblocks they may encounter when learning a piece.

By doing away with roadblocks, aspiring performing artists became inspired to learn and continued learning by *practicing at home*. Aspiring performing artists expressed that T-I instruction created an artistic perspective for learning that was very enjoyable during applied lessons and multi-sensory; a learning experience they were not costumed to receiving in applied lessons, hence, they became inspired to continue their learning at their homes and experiment with an assortment of imagery for musical inspiration. Initially, Greg stated that he has viewed practicing at home as a chore since he is isolated from an environment was music and practice is present.
constantly. However, he later expressed enthusiasm for implementing T-I instruction when learning improvisation and notated compositions during his weekly practice at home; a feeling he had not experienced before and “aspires to implement T-I instruction in his future home-based practicing.”

For Margaret, the notion of practicing fundamentals was something she has detested because they were boring and non-engaging. However, she after experiencing T-I instruction during the applied lesson, she became inspired for the first time to practice fundamental exercises (i.e. long tones, scales, arpeggios, excerpts) with imagery for maintaining technical facility on her instrument. Over the course of four weeks, she testified that she had “never felt so excited to practice her fundamentals” and aspired to continue her personal practice sessions with T-I instruction.

A similar outcome occurred with James regarding challenging repertoire. James stated that he had lost his motivation to practice unlearned-repertoire that was challenging due to the rigorous technical demand that is expected of the performer but felt energized to practice again by incorporating imagery into his learning processes:

It’s been a long time since I feel the urge to practice. What I gained most from partaking in this study is that creativity is not in the technical execution of the music alone, rather, it is the creative thinking that must be mustered and then translated through our technical execution. Okay, now it’s time to practice! (James, weekly reflection journal #4)

In his weekly-reflection journal # 4, James expressed he enjoyed receiving T-I instruction during his applied lesson, and felt inspired to learn more challenging
pieces during his personal practice to further his musicianship as a performing artist.

As for Greg, he too was elated to incorporate imagery for practicing improvisation:

I really want to try these ideas that were talked about during today’s lesson when I practice at home today. I feel motivated to refine my improvisation. It was cool to realize that the teacher thinks of improvisation in a very visual way. I think this approach helped me. Looking forward to mastering the art of what I think and feel through my improvisations. I got a lot to practice and I can’t wait! (Greg, post-lesson journal #2)

By mentioning the instructor, Greg illuminated the importance instructors have as role models for their students. It seems that part of his inspiration for implanting T-I instruction in his personal practice stems from the instructor’s use of the instruction as well. As for Dylan, he has many pieces to learn and expressed that T-I instruction may be a method for increasing his motivation for practicing and keeping him focused throughout his learning:

While I’m learning this piece (which is interesting), I’m wanting to comprehend what the piece is about. The way I have been doing so is by relating the piece to a mood. For example, the beginning of the piece sounds like a joyful adventure. This train of thought keeps is applied with all the pieces I’m learning; it keeps me going during my practice, especially when I have a ton of pieces and excerpts to learn. Hopefully my practice will make some sense for the next lesson. (Dylan, weekly-reflection journal #1)

A valuable observation to consider is that T-I instruction may mediate different variables that contribute to aspiring performing artists’ lack of desire for practice. Whatever their reasons may be for neglecting practice, it seems that T-I instruction was helpful in counteracting the feeling and stimulating their intrinsic motivation for practice.
**Strengthened Self-Efficacy**

Along with increased intrinsic motivation for practice, aspiring performing artists experienced an increase in *self-efficacy*. Each individual testified that T-I instruction strengthened their belief in their ability to learn and perform newly composed pieces and Blues improvisations; two musical activities that were rather new for them. One of the aspects of self-efficacy that seemed to show importance was *well-rounded musician*. All aspiring performing artists expressed that by utilizing T-I instruction when learning newly composed pieces, improvisation, and standard repertoire, they were able learn at a quicker pace, and thus, felt greater esteem to learn a broader range of musical genres. Learning different styles of music were difficult tasks to do for Greg and Dylan, though it has been an endeavor of theirs for many years.

One of the interesting statements Greg said was that in attempting to become more fluid in other genres, he applied the same pedagogical principles for Western art music to other styles of music, however, neglected to listen or view performances of other genres. Thus, Greg experienced low levels of self-efficacy for becoming a multi-faceted musician since he did not see any improvement in his musical diversity. During his second lesson, the instructor utilized T-I instruction—specifically, to imagine a rhythm section performing along with him while he practices improvisation, and to be sensitive to how the imaginary performers interacted with one another. Greg’s improvisations showed much improvement akin to a musical dialogue with other musicians. The instructor later asked him to apply these concepts for other genres he wished to improvise; to effectively apply this
imagery, Greg was encouraged to take time to listen to many recordings of genres he was interested in learning so that he could later envision and audiate performances in his mind while practicing improvisation. Over the following weeks, Greg showed an increase of self-efficacy for becoming well-rounded performing artists.

In addition to becoming a well-round musician, sight-reading seemed to be another issue that addressed through T-I instruction. When learning newly composed pieces, Margaret and James experienced low levels of self-confidence for sight-reading and could not find solutions to develop their sight-reading skills during their practice session. Upon receiving T-I instruction on the second lesson, Margaret applied imagery of relaxing sceneries influenced a relaxed mindset that would make sight-reading newly composed pieces less stressful. She stated she felt “more confident in engaging in sight-reading and would practice sight-reading more often.” Hence, her self-efficacy for sight-reading augmented.

In Greg’s and Dylan’s case, self-efficacy for improvisation was strengthened through T-I instruction. In the pre-lesson questionnaire and first lessons, both Greg and Dylan expressed aspirations for becoming better improvisers. They also stated they felt inadequately prepared for many improvisational music settings and desired to find a suitable method for augmenting their facility. T-I instruction showed to be affective for making improvisation an easier task to do for both students; this was an important finding considering that the two of them have very different experiences with improvisation.

There seemed to be a lack of ability to formulate Blues improvisations comfortably due to a low level of self-efficacy for improvisation. Dylan stated, “I’m
not sure if I could do this,” and Greg stated, “This is too foreign to what I’m used to…” Given the limited background of improvisation in Classical style only explains the aspiring performing artist to improvise in an appropriate Blues style. At the beginning of his first lesson, Dylan felt terrified to improvise. Commencing with the technical instruction in the first lesson proved to be a suitable way for teaching him the fundamentals of improvisation, as that was Dylan’s normal method of receiving instruction. The technical instruction continued on for the second and third lesson. Upon receiving T-I instruction in the fourth lesson, Dylan experienced more confidence as an improviser. His posture was more upright and he smiled more often. Dylan felt that the incorporation of imagery during the lessons expanded his ability to creatively think about improvisation. Additionally, the imagery utilized in the lesson allowed him to relate the information to his technical execution of ideas in a more fluid, natural manner. In the pre-lesson questionnaire, Dylan indicated that he utilized his imagination when listening to and learning music, hence, T-I instruction showed to be a more suitable form of pedagogy that addressed his teaching style, and thus, augmented his self-efficacy for improvisation.

Interestingly, Dylan’s weekly reflection journals indicated that imagery was implemented throughout his practice to strengthen his self-efficacy for improvisation. He watched video performances of renowned improvisers via Youtube.com. As he intently analyzed performers’ body language, melodic and rhythmic approaches, and communication with their ensembles and audiences, he often resorted to envisioning himself as a renowned improviser playing at a jazz festival as a way to encourage his belief to be a competent improviser. By the end of four weeks of instruction, the
combination of receiving technical instruction in the beginning of lessons and T-I instruction later on were suitable catalysts for building up the aspiring performing artist’s self-efficacy for improvisation. So much so that Dylan aspires to implement imagery in his personal practice in the future:

I really enjoyed the lessons. At first when I arrived, I was terrified to improvise. However, the teacher believed I could become a better improviser in a short period of time. I thoroughly enjoyed the way he presented the information for each lesson… it was practical and enjoyable. This last lesson was especially enjoyable because for the first time I felt that this type of teaching built my confidence in becoming a better improviser. I enjoyed interpreting the imagery examples he gave. From now on, I’d like to also utilize this method of thinking when working on improvisation because it was effective for me. I can honestly say I am an improviser now. (Dylan, bi-weekly interview #2)

From a philosophical standpoint, Dylan embraced the notion that thought processes for improvisation should not be limited to thinking about the technicalities of music alone, rather, technicalities should be conjoined with his pre-determined intentions for creating music and expressing human experiences through the medium of expression: music. Dylan felt more confident to practice improvisation and gained a stronger self-concept for becoming an eclectic musician who could play a variety of musical genres, ultimately, fulfilling his dream of becoming a crossover-genre performing artist.

Regarding Greg, he arrived to the lessons with experience in improvisation due to his background in performing improvisatory music at local gigs, and possessed a high-level of self-efficacy for improvising within Latin musical genres since he was acculturated with those genres from an early age. However, when it came to improvising other genres, his self-efficacy for improvisation was low, and thus, wished to improve his improvisational skills in order to feel competent improvising
within other musical genres to become a more multi-faceted performing artist. Greg believes that expanding his improvisational facility is necessary for marketability as a performing artist. This notion is built upon his understanding of the current music industry, as more vocational opportunities for improvisatory musicians are allotted to those who can vacillate effortlessly between musical genres.

With endeavors of becoming a better improviser to obtain more vocational opportunities, Greg had experienced difficulty developing multi-faceted improvisational skills when studying improvisational tutorial books. These books contained appropriated scales to harmonic structures and play-along tracks, however, lacked discussion of other vital components for improvisation (i.e., rhythmic development, historical and artistic approaches, conceptual and creative thinking exercises for improving improvisation, musical and verbal interaction with an ensemble). In his quest to uncover a method for developing cross-genre improvisational skills, Greg enrolled in this study. Results revealed that both forms of instruction he received during this study (i.e., technical instruction and T-I instruction) in a face-to-face setting had positive influences on his self-efficacy for improvisation, and that T-I instruction was the most favored.

First, technical instruction served as a benefactor for understanding the theoretical foundations of the blues (i.e., chord progressions, scales, time-feel, articulation, and so forth). Greg enjoyed the first lesson since he prefers to understand the theoretical aspects of music during the first stages of learning. He enjoyed learning the theoretical aspects of the Blues due to his (1) curiosity to understand the functions of the Blues, and (2) belief that theoretical understanding of the Blues could
foundationally equip him to improvise within other American music-based genres (i.e., rock, bluegrass, folk, contemporary popular music, and so forth).

Upon receiving T-I instruction in the second lesson, Greg’s capability for improvising over the Blues flourished in high-levels of expressivity. For example, there occurred moment during the second lesson when the instructor asked Greg to audiate a prominent bassist of his choice playing a Blues progression. Then, the instructor asked Greg to imagine a rhythm section comprised of his favorite musicians accompanying him during his improvisation, and then to select a mood and describe the scenery supporting the mood, which functioned as an influencer for his improvisation. Within every request made by the instructor, Greg performed an improvisation by himself. The instructor and experts noted drastic improvements in Greg’s ability to formulate expressive, cohesive improvisations. Furthermore, Greg was able to maintain and outline the harmonic structure of the Blues, maintain consistency in the time, and improvise more fluidly. Expert 3 stated his shock at how quick his improvement was and looked forward to implementing this type of instruction in applied lessons with his students. Overall, the aspiring performing artist exuded more confidence as a Blues improviser after partaking in T-I instruction. The increase of self-efficacy also instilled in both aspiring performing artists a sense of hope for witnessing improvements when improvising over other genres by utilizing T-I instruction during his practice sessions, applied lessons, and performances. When asked if there was any information during the lesson he applied during his practice sessions, Greg indicated he implemented imagery to help him refine technicalities (i.e. sound, articulation, vibrato, direction of air stream). Perceived improvement of
his technical facility boosted the self-efficacy for improvisation among aspiring performing artists. Take a look at some of the Greg’s testimonies and notice how he uses emphasizes the importance of thinking imaginatively as performing artist. It seems that T-I instruction strengthened Greg’s self-efficacy for improvisation:

In essence, having improvisation in every lesson, being Classical or non-Classical genres, is very important. Having creativity, imagination, and visual imagery, these are all different tools that could definitely help students with different necessities and is a must in every single classroom. (Greg, bi-weekly interview #2)

…being creative and being a musician is all about imagination. You are an entertainer and having an imagination is part of entertaining people. If you don’t develop that area, I think it would be a boring performance. Also, how can say this? When you are performing in front of people, you could have an act. You could dance, you could laugh, you could scream and everything because it is all a part of your imagination and your creativity. (Greg, bi-weekly interview #2).

…I was more aware of my sound because I never actually payed too much attention to it. I was actually focused on blowing downwards and having a pretty sound because people can actually hear your sound, and yeah, it’s really important. You can imagine blowing into the flute (uses hand signals). It’s not just saying it, its like having that creative imagination. Once you have a visual thing that actually clicks in your mind, you can do it. At least that works for me. (Greg, bi-weekly interview #2)

To summarize, the aspiring performing artists collectively agreed they enjoyed utilizing imagery and acting techniques to enhance their musical expressivity, and to influence their audience’s perception of expressivity when performing. When the instructor introduced imagery in the lessons, Greg’s and Dylan’s technique, phrasing, and nuances became more refined and fitted the genre more appropriately. The instructor gave them many opportunities to improvise over the Blues during the T-I instruction lesson, utilizing various conceptual descriptors (i.e., moods, icons, indexes, and metaphors). Greg and Dylan seemed to relate to
these descriptors and felt that thinking about the descriptors, as opposed to technical instructions, was more helpful in formulating improvisations that were unique and novel; improvisations that sounded different from one another. Witnessing the immediate results of T-I instruction’s influence on the aspiring performing artists’ improvisations resulted in the augmentation of self-efficacy for improvisation. It can be concluded that (1) both technical instruction and T-I instruction can be used to facilitate self-efficacy for improvisation, which is an important attribute of an improvisational performing artist, and (2) instructors should be considerate of when to utilize the two types of instruction to best facilitate aspiring performing artists’ self-efficacy for improvisation.

In Margaret’s and James’s case, both expressed that the implementation of T-I instruction during learning increased their self-efficacy for learning newly composed piece. When the instructor asked Margaret to sight read a newly composed piece in the first lesson, she felt very nervous, and unconfident as a sight-reader. She had arrived the lesson with a skewed self-concept; that she was an inadequate performing artist when learning a piece for the first time. Margaret wrestled with believing in her ability to become a competent performing artist at times. To better understand Margaret’s skills on the flute, it can be described as very expressive when playing musical components, yet, at times inconsistent with technical execution when performing. In past applied lessons, she had entered the room feeling nervous due to various factors: (1) the high level performance standard that exists in the professional music industry; (2) the dynamic of applied lessons focused excessively on her technical limitations; and (3) the lack of self-confidence to learn challenging
repertoire and perform it expressively. In her post-lesson journal #1, Margaret stated that she felt discontent with her performances during the lesson, and that the teacher’s instruction felt too “rigid” and “did not aid to her learning style.” She mentioned that she hoped the teacher would provide a more enjoyable form of instruction that could help her connect with the music in the lessons to come.

However, something extraordinary happened during the second lesson. Margaret’s usual demeanor became different upon receiving T-I instruction in the second lesson—she was more relaxed and less tense. As the instructor analogized the music to various imageries, Margaret thought some of the imagery was humorous:

Instructor: Now, at the end of measure sixteen play those quarter notes like heavy raindrops. Rather than thinking of the notes, imagine heavy raindrops or bells swaying when you articulate the notes.

Margaret: (Laughs) That’s an interesting way to think about it. (Margaret plays the indicated section).

Margaret reported being pleasantly surprised at experiencing more confidence as a performer due to the humor that the imagery brought to the dynamic of her lesson. The balanced incorporation of technical instruction with imagery allowed her to realize that she did not need to stress when learning music, and that she could incorporate more creative tactics to build her confidence as a performer. Below is a statement that relates to T-I instruction’s strengthening of Margaret’s self-efficacy for performing newly composed pieces:

Oh my gosh, I loved this lesson so much more than the last one (laughs out loud)…there was a lot more talking and more descriptions. You did a lot more imagery. I think at one point you even gave me two examples to get me to understand what you were talking about. So, there was a lot of helping, visually, which got me to click with the music (laughs). I feel more confident
in my ability to tackle new pieces I’ve never played before. (Margaret, bi-weekly interview #1).

When the instructor asked if there was any information provided during the lessons that helped her play more expressive or understand the music better, she responded with the following:

Margaret: Yes, in these lessons (lessons #1 and #2) there were a lot of discussions on phrasing with the lines. It was very technical, I’m used to lessons being very technical. However, in one of the earlier lessons, it was a lot more visual and I was using that information in my practice and everything. So, it was a lot easier for me because I am very visually oriented.

Instructor: It became easier on you? Can you expand on that?

Margaret: Yeah. Well, in the second lesson when you were talking about any sort of anecdote, it made me think about the music differently, it became a lot easier for me to make the music sound more expressive. The visual-type of descriptions also allowed me to develop more of a personal connection with the music. (Excerpt from Margaret’s bi-weekly interview #2).

It is important to note that students’ low level of self-efficacy for performing may not be due to their inability to perform the music proficiently, rather, due to their preferred learning style(s) not being address within the teacher’s pedagogy. Margaret’s demeanor changed from feeling like an inadequate musician who was terrified to learn new music to a musician who was ecstatic to learn and full of confidence. Though other variables may have accounted for this change, it is undeniable that T-I instruction was a benefactor to her self-efficacy for performing newly composed pieces.

In James’s case, the use of imagery was an integral part of his creative process when learning music. His talent in the fine arts directly influenced his ability to think visually about music, and thus, he preferred receiving technical instruction, as
opposed to imagery-based instruction, to refine his expertise when learning a new piece. T-I instruction did not induce a positive or negative effect on James’s self-efficacy as a performer due to the fact that he automatizes imagery induction strategies to play more expressively. As a result, receiving technical instruction may be the preferred method of instruction for aspiring performing artists who have a high-level of self-efficacy; T-I instruction may be neutral in its efficacious effects. When asked if there was any information provided during the lessons that helped him play more expressive or understand the music better, James favored technical instruction stating that the discussion of refining musical components helped him the most:

Yes. I think repeating passages, playing with more shape, getting the technique down, and addressing specific accidentals helped me technically. I think playing with more shape and you re-iterating that each time helped. I enjoyed that the most!

Additionally, the instructor was curious to know if any information was borrowed any information from James’s first lesson to help him learn the newly composed piece throughout his practice sessions and during his second lesson. James mentioned he implemented the instructor’s suggestion of practicing the music at slower tempos than indicated. Hence, he used a metronome to help maintain consistency in tempo and progressively increase the tempo, as he felt more competent. Tempos would be taken slower if he committed an error during the performance. Furthermore, James stated that after technically perfecting the notation, he began adding musicality by stylizing each passage and putting cognitive emphasis on phrasing.
Though the practice strategy did not contribute to James’s self-efficacy, results also revealed that he did enjoy receiving T-I instruction. When asked if there was any information provided during the lessons that helped him play more expressive or understand the music better, James felt the T-I instruction greatly fostered his ability to refine the technicalities for performing the music, hence, he enjoyed witnessing the immediate improvement in his ability to translate his image using refiner technique. James describes his feelings towards T-I instruction as useful method for strengthening self-efficacy for performing technical passages with prowess:

… when the instructor had asked me if there was some sort of imagery I recalled when I played the piece…it’s up for interpretation. When we discussed the imagery for parts of the music, you had a different vision than I did. Either way, it helped me with phrasing and stylizing the music a little bit more. That made a huge difference from lesson to lesson in my belief that I could perform the piece. (James, bi-weekly interview #2)

…I felt pretty confident in my ability to learn these pieces from the very beginning. I did enjoy the last lesson because it helped me learn the music better, and refined the technical aspects of my playing. Instantaneously. (James, post-lesson journal #4).

Based on the varied outcomes of T-I instruction’s influence on both aspiring performing artists’ self-efficacy for learning newly composed pieces, it can be concluded that T-I instruction may have greater influence on students who (1) are less-technically competent in their instruments, (2) don’t commonly utilize imagery in their learning, and (3) who convey a low level of self-efficacy on the onset of instruction. In essence, T-I instruction may have greater impact on students' self-efficacy for learning newly composed pieces or improvisation if relationships are cultivated between the instructor and the aspiring performing artist. Along with T-I
instruction being a benefactor for self-efficacy, the instructor and experts noted that
the instruction had positive influence in increasing the majority of aspiring
performing artists’ expressivity when performing improvisations or newly composed
pieces.

**Increased Expressivity**

One of the main goals for aspiring performing artists is to develop an ability to
perform music, regardless of genre, with a high level of perceived expressivity. For
this study, each of the aspiring performing artists arrived with a notably different
level of expressivity, according to the instructor and three experts. The initial
hypothesis of the instructor was that T-I instruction would be more beneficial for
*increasing expressivity* of aspiring performing artists who perform with a lower level
of expressivity. However, that hypothesis was nulled as both the instructor and three
experts saw the least improvement for the aspiring performing artist who had the
lowest level of expressivity, and saw more improved expressivity for performing
newly composed pieces and improvisation with the remaining aspiring performing
artists. Several aspects of aspiring performing artists’ expressivity was increased
including *fluidity*—the cohesiveness of motivic development during improvisation,
*appropriateness*, and *creativity*.

T-I instruction showed to be effective for improving the fluidity of
improvisations for aspiring performing artists. From the onset, Dylan’s
improvisations were stylistically clashing with the Blues, since his phrasing and sense
of time resembled a classical flute soloist. The instructor provided three weeks of
technical instruction to counteract rigid tendencies (i.e. improvising disjunctive
motives that do not seem to relate or connect in a logical manner) that were evident in Dylan’s Blues improvisations due to his inexperience in improvisation. For the first three lessons, the instructor discussed the rhythmical pulse of the accompaniment, the accentuation of eighth notes and triplets, suitable scales to improvise over the harmonic structures, and nuances that are customary in Blues improvisation. With diligent practice, Dylan refined his ability to play the Blues through three weeks of personal practice and listening to acclaimed Blues improvisers. By the fourth lesson when Dylan received T-I instruction, the instructor concentrated on helping him become less mechanical and fluid as an improviser who can create novel improvisations in each attempt by inducing imagery examples for inspiration and artistic thinking. For example, the instructor asked Dylan to work on the weight of his improvised passages by (1) envisioning a light bird flying followed by (2) envisioning a heavy bird flying. Dylan’s timbre and vibrato was distinctly effected as he emulated the characteristics of the two types of images. Dylan enjoyed this exercise and indicated additional images he would use to inspire his improvisations. It seems that T-I instruction was effective in simultaneously cultivating his use of musical components and his conceptual thinking for improvisation.

Another theme emerged for Dylan’s improvisations was appropriateness. To help facilitate the appropriateness of Dylan’s improvisation, the instructor asked him to imitate the imagery descriptors (i.e., colors, scenery, animal characteristics, and moods). The utilization of imagery descriptions improved students’ performance of musical components and phrases to be more appropriately to the Blues. While cognizing the provided imagery, Dylan’s technical facility was impacted positively;
new textures, timbres, motives, and extended techniques manifested in his
improvisations. No longer did he sound stylistically inappropriate, rather, the
production of his improvisations was deemed more creative and expressive,
according to the experts. Furthermore, Dylan was able to produce motivic-based
improvisations for longer time frames without stopping. This attribute was not present
as much during the first three weeks of the study. One important aspect to consider is
that when observing improvements in expressivity and performance, Dylan’s
technique was always improved first, followed by his creative decision-making. His
understanding of appropriated usage of musical components, rhythms, and scales
facilitated his ability to produce more expressive improvisations.

Greg’s expressivity as an improviser also flourished. T-I instruction showed to
be an effective tool for enhancing improvisation for additional genres (i.e. be-bop,
post-bop, acoustic popular music). Greg spent a lot of time listening to recordings and
video footage of professional improvisers within different genres while connecting
imagery inspired by the improvisations. He enjoyed using emotional descriptors and
episodic memory to induce expressive improvisations. In general, relating the music
to personal experiences allowed aspiring performing arts to develop stronger
connections with the music and produce the expressivity for the music. When Greg
received technical instruction in the first lesson, his expressivity for improvising the
blues was fair. It was his personal use of imagery and T-I instruction during applied
lessons that strengthened his expressivity over time.

Upon receiving T-I instruction in the second lesson, Greg stated this was a
common strategy he utilized when improvising over Latin musical genres, but had not
previously done so when improvising over other genres. Hence, this realization encouraged him to implement T-I instruction in all aspects of his learning process for the remainder of his applied lessons that were focused on technical instruction. According to the experts, Greg’s improvisations became more stylistically appropriate and highly expressive for the duration of the study. He produced improvisations that were unique from each other and he became more competent in developing improvisation from a single motive. In a conversation during the applied lesson, Greg recalled Richard Wagner’s compositional technique for associating characters to a motive (i.e., *leitmotifs*) and discovered that by adopting the technique to his own practice, he could develop improvisations with greater ease. Conclusively, T-I instruction was shown to be a positive influencer for increasing expressivity during improvisation regardless of prior experience or competency. Contrarily, results for T-I instruction’s influence on students’ expressivity when performing newly composed pieces were not unanimous.

For James, automatizing and enjoying the use of imagery during performance was a testament to T-I instruction benefiting his appropriateness for performing newly composed pieces. All experts unanimously agreed that James is a naturally expressive performer whose weakness was playing technically proficient when learning a newly composed piece. The greatest result of T-I instruction was that it proved to be effective in helping James play the music with greater technical execution. By associating an image to the characteristic of a musical component, James was able to cognitively transfer the information to make musculature
adjustments. In doing so, his performances became more stylistically appropriate and expressive throughout the lessons.

According to the researcher and three experts, T-I instruction did not produce significant results in Margaret’s ability to perform newly composed pieces more expressively. The experts agreed that the instruction produce subtle improvements in her technical facility overall. Margaret’s weekly journals indicated that she did not implement daily practice towards the assigned newly composed pieces as she did for other musical pieces, which could have been a reason why her performances did not demonstrate significant improvement during the course of the study. The greatest contributions for implementing T-I instruction during Margaret’s lessons were to teach her effective strategy for alleviating stress, learning the music with confidence and enjoyment, and refining her understanding and ability to play musical components (i.e., vibrato, dynamics, articulation, and phrasing).

The subject of creativity also spawned within increased expressivity. All aspiring performing artists agreed that the application of T-I instruction in lessons served as reinforcement for cultivating creative thinking, which is a pillar for their philosophy in being performing artists. All aspiring performing artists indicated they felt that as performing artists it is essential to utilize conceptual descriptors in their practice and performance in hopes of conveying ‘meaningful’, ‘heartfelt’, ‘deeper’, ‘soulful’ music to the audience. However, thinking creatively as performing artists does not always come easily for them since the majority of their efforts are allotted to refining technicalities in their performance; their thinking is a bi-product of the type of instruction they typically receive in their applied lessons. By participating in this
study, aspiring performing artists stated they were reminded of additional essential factors (i.e., imagery, body language, verbal communication with the audience) that contribute their ability in become more expressive, multi-facetted performers, and creative composers, and will make greater efforts to be consciously aware of those factors during personal practice sessions.

**Fostered Enjoyment for Learning**

One of the greatest qualities of engaging in musical activities is the joy that can be experienced by human beings. For many music-majors, the enjoyment for learning music is one of the main reasons why they pursue an education in music. However, sometimes the enjoyment for learning can fade when having to manage a plethora of duties (e.g. classes, rehearsals, lessons, learning, practice sessions, and so forth). It is not uncommon for music-majors to experience a lack of enjoyment for learning music, especially if the instructor does not consider their opinions and musical aspirations valid. The instructor’s method of instruction is also a variable that can effect music-majors’ enjoyment for learning.

In the case of the aspiring performing artists, T-I instruction fostered joy and enthusiasm for learning and for performing newly composed pieces and improvisation. One of the main concepts that appeared under enjoyment was *fun*. According to Margaret, her joyful feelings for learning have fluctuated and dissipated over time due to various factors: (1) a concern for her future as a working performing artist, and (2) the lack of fun she had experienced in past applied lessons. Upon receiving T-I instruction, Margaret conveyed that the discussion of imagery examples and its associations with the newly composed pieces allowed for the applied lessons
to be fun and cognitively stimulating. Furthermore, she stated that some of the imagery examples were highly enjoyable and comical, which made the class fun.

For Dylan, his musical development seemed to show tremendous growth as an improviser as a result of receiving T-I instruction. Dylan expressed he had fun developing different aspects of his playing (i.e., phrasing, melodic ideas, and timbre) and assimilated imagery to influence his thought processes for manipulating his musculature. Greg’s efforts to improve his improvisation by imagining ensemble members performing with him in a renowned concert hall showed to foster enjoyment for learning as well. Greg expressed his enjoyment for learning Blues improvisation with T-I instruction was due to the simplicity of the instruction and its capacity to assist him learning other genres. Each of the aspiring performing artists shared a statement that encompasses the sub-themes that relate to their enjoyment for learning newly composed pieces and improvisations:

I had a lot of fun today in class. Today’s class was so enjoyable. I was able to learn and enjoy the process of learning a new piece with the way the teacher taught. He was funny. (Margaret, Post-lesson journal #2)

Learning with visual examples has helped me develop further as a musician. Whether I am working on improvisation, scales, phrasing, rhythm, or my tone, I am trying to employ imagery examples as a fun and exciting way of speeding up the development process. (Dylan, weekly reflection journal #4)

I enjoy learning how to improvise over the Blues using creative thinking strategies like reminiscing my childhood or loved ones I have not seen in a while. These images have helped simplified the steps for me to learning how to improvise with heart-felt emotion. (Greg, weekly reflection journal #3)

For each of the aspiring performing artists, the enjoyment for learning is experienced differently. Margaret’s enjoyment was attributed to the humor of the imagery examples. Dylan experienced enjoyment when he witnessed himself learning
the music at a quicker pace. Greg enjoyed how implementing T-I instruction allowed him to re-experience treasured moments of his life. Whatever the case may be, T-I instruction showed to be capable for fostering enjoyment for learning newly composed pieces and improvisation in applied lessons.

**Improved Technical Facility for Performance**

Technical facility is probably the most addressed topic of importance for aspiring performing artists, and is indeed of great importance. As discussed in chapters one and two, the researcher holds the position that technique is the foundation when learning an instrument. Without technique, performing artists do not possess the ability to express their musical intentions, and there are standardized techniques for most genres of music. One of the findings of T-I instruction was its ability to improve aspiring performing artists’ *technical facility*. After carefully analyzing the video footage of the applied lessons, the researcher and three experts concurred that T-I instruction improved students’ technical facility at varying degrees. Greg’s *intonation* was improved. When the instructor utilized directional imagery examples, his intonation became more in tune. The instructor stated to Greg, “Lower your pitch like heavy gravity.” In turn, Greg understood his intonation was very sharp and made the muscular adjustment to play the note in tune. The second sub-theme was *rhythm*. At one instance, the instructor told James that he could learn to play the 16th note passages correctly if he envisioned the passages as squared blocks as opposed to analyzing the passages note for note.

The third sub-theme was *vibrato*. During Dylan’s T-I instruction-based lesson, the instructor requested for Dylan to widen his vibrato during his melancholic
improvisation “like the rhythmic pace of a child crying.” Instantaneously, Dylan cognitively transferred the imagery to his playing and successfully performed with wider vibrato. The fourth sub-theme was *tonguing*. While Margaret received T-I instruction, she experienced difficulty playing the music staccato. The instructor then requested from Margaret to tongue the notes in a staccato fashion “like a woodpecker.” Margaret cognitively translated the image and successfully performed the music with more detachment between the notes. The fifth sub-theme was *tone quality*. During Greg’s T-I instruction-based lesson, Greg was improvising with a spread tone. The instructor requested Greg to aim the airstream downward “like an arrow falling down from the sky.” This imagery example helped Greg adjust his embouchure to produce a focused tone. James’s *consistency* also showed improvement upon receiving guided imagery. James had difficulty playing the newly composed piece #1 with consistent accuracy. The instructor requested for James to calm his mind by thinking of a location where he is relaxed. James took a moment to reflect on the imagery, took a deep breath, and then proceeded to play the piece three times with minimal errors. Hence, various aspects of aspiring performing artists’ technical facility showed improvement when receiving T-I allowing them to perform the music with more consistent accuracy.

**Improved Cognition for Improvisation**

Improvisation is a creative task that demands a high level of concentration. Many aspiring performing artists understand its value as a skillset, yet, may struggle to maintain focus during the act of improvisation causing them to feel frustrated. One theme that was insightful regarding the effects of receiving T-I instruction was its
potential to improve cognition for improvisation. Both Greg and Dylan expressed much enthusiasm for T-I instruction’s facilitating their cognitive processes for developing structured, refined improvisations.

One of the key aspects that were noted by the three experts was the organization of Dylan’s improvisations when applying imagery examples as a source of inspiration. Dylan felt the use of iconic descriptors helped lay down a structure for his cognition, and thus, he showed steady improvements in organizing melodic ideas while improvising. For his first three lessons, the instructor taught with technical instruction, which served to introduce Dylan to the theoretical fundamentals of improvisation. On the fourth lesson, the instructor utilized T-I instruction to help Dylan better organize motivic aspects of his solos. One imagery example the instructor utilized was, “As you try to develop a motive during your solo, latch on to one motive like a leash is attached to a dog’s collar and think about how each motive will either climb up the stairs or go down the stairs; there will be variances of notes and rhythms as you improvise but the main goal is for you to be able to see the outline of the melody like a drawing.” After providing this anecdote, Dylan improvised several time. His solos became more melodically organized each attempt, and he was able to expound on one motive at a moment’s notice. Throughout his last lesson, Dylan learned to utilize T-I instruction to facilitate the direction of his improvisations towards a climactic moment. The organization of motivic ideas allowed him to sonically indicated the climax of his improvisation, which in turn, influenced the instructor’s and expert reviewers’ perception of his improvisation to being “much more engaging.” One expert review commented, “He was able to play a
nice balance of ‘tension and release’ ideas that kept the solo interesting to the listener.” Overall, T-I instruction facilitated Dylan’s abilities to organize the overarching structure of their improvisations.

Another sub theme was thoughts. Considering that Greg and Dylan were new Blues improvisers, they felt unable to communicate the thoughts (or images) formulated in their minds when improvising. During both students’ first lesson, the instructor as the students what thoughts occurred during their improvisations. Both students replied, “not sure” and “I don’t know.” These statements occurred several times when asked during their first technical instruction-based lesson. When the instructor and aspiring performing artists bounced off imagery examples to one another, both aspiring performing artists learned how to (1) formulate imagery to help construct improvisations, and (2) manipulate musical components to resemble an image’s characteristics or to convey an image’s representation. To provide an example for the reader, the instructor asked Dylan what thoughts occurred during his improvisation, Dylan communicated his thought, “I was thinking of a cat chasing a mouse.” For the following improvisation, Dylan stated, “I was thinking about myself walking on egg shells.” Greg also became a better communicator of his thoughts that occurred during improvisation. The instructor allowed for Greg to formulate his own imagery to influence his cognizance during improvisation. When the instructor asked Greg what thoughts occurred during his improvisation, Greg said, “I was thinking about my home in Puerto Rico. I was think about my family and friends, and how much I miss them. I used this memory to influence me to play more nostalgically.” Hence, T-I instruction showed to be helpful to aspiring performing artists in
becoming better communicators of thought during improvisation, organizers of improvised content, and thinkers of improvisation.

**Modern Music Technology**

Within the last decade, there has been a shift in the way expert and non-expert musicians learn, engage, produce, and perform music; *modern music technology* has made it possible learning in a multi-sensory fashion, and learning and collaborating with people around the world. It is no wonder that the aspiring performing artists implemented various types of modern music technology to facilitate their learning; especially for learning newly composed pieces and improvisation. For this study, no questions were directed towards aspiring performing artists’ use of modern music technology, however, considering its prevalence and availability in today’s society, reports of their use of modern music technology simmered in their bi-weekly journals, and showed to be significant to their learning and practice. All aspiring performing artists indicated they believed that the role modern music technology plays in their learning is an essential facet for propelling them toward their goals of becoming professional performing artists.

There were six types of technological resources used to facilitate learning, performance, and entrepreneurial endeavors mentioned in their weekly-reflection journals. The first was *audio recordings*. All students indicated they enjoy utilizing audio recordings to obtain a variety of sonic references for how to perform specific repertoire. *Video footage* was also a handy tool for studying their stage presence and sound production. Particular in Greg’s case, he indicated in his weekly-reflection journal #3 that he regularly records video footage of his performance for post-
performance analysis to uncover strengths and weaknesses of his performance. Based on his observations, Greg would make the adjustments for the next performance. The Internet was a tool utilized unanimously by all aspiring performing artists. Their weekly-reflection journals that their use of the Internet was to (1) search artists’ performances and suggested tips for playing repertoire, (2) research historical and theoretical aspects of pieces and composers, (3) analyses performances from students across the globe, (4) uncover new performing artists, and (5) post video footage of their performances to market themselves and to receive constructive criticism pertaining to their performances.

The fourth modern music technology was SMART music. All aspiring performing artists indicated they utilize SMART music (i.e., a musical accompaniment software that has the unique sensitivity for adjusting accompaniment to match the performer’s tempo and dynamic in real time; distinct from play-along tracks) to facilitate their learning of repertoire during practice sessions at their homes. Margaret, Greg, and Dylan felt grateful towards their applied lesson teacher for incorporating the software program into their lessons. Regarding a similar type of technology, play-along tracks, Greg indicated he utilized play-along tracks as a learning tool for improvisation; tracks created by the acclaimed jazz educator Jamey Aebersold. The sixth sub-theme was digital audio workstation. Greg indicated that he has been composing and arranging tunes in the digital audio workstation—Garageband—to (1) create play-along tracks for his gigs, (2) analyze his performance tendencies through sonic and wave representations, and (2) produce his first album that will be used as marketing tool to advance his career as a performing artist. In
essence, the use of modern technology to facilitate their learning, performance, and
trepreneurial endeavors was shown to be an integral resource for aspiring
performing artists.

As the reader can see, these 10 themes emerged as a bi-product of receiving T-I instruction in applied lessons and applying it to their practice regimen. The commonality of all the themes is that T-I instruction showed to be an effective facilitator for aspiring performing artists learning newly composed pieces and improvisation. The following section will discuss three themes that relate to the overarching theme, quality of life.

Quality of Life

Under the meta-theme of quality of life, the researcher presents the three themes in the sequence as indicated on Figure 4.2.

Increased Life Satisfaction

*Life satisfaction* is something that virtually all humans aspire to obtain. Feeling a sense of productivity, self-worth, enjoyment, relationship with others, and love are several variables that constitute to life satisfaction. The researcher was pleasantly surprised to find out that aspiring performing artists benefited from T-I instruction beyond learning; the instruction enriched non-musical aspects of their lives. The two domains within quality of life that were enriched dealt with identity and engagement. There appeared three sub-themes within quality of life. The first sub-theme was *consistent satisfaction*. Margaret and Greg expressed that the use of T-I instruction during personal practice over the course of three weeks contributed to their positive outlook on life throughout the day. Both stated that when not practicing,
they still engaged in T-I instruction while walking to the store or exercising; in essence, students practiced associating imagery to specific musical passages through audiation. This activity was perceived as a fun activity, and thus, had a positive effect on their days. Throughout the day, Margaret and Greg employed T-I instruction to think about their music, and in doing so; they felt that their aspirations to become professional performing artists could be realized partly by employing the instruction diligently. Hence, aspiring performing artists became more encouraged and gained a more positive outlook for life, and for obtaining goals in the days to come.

The feeling of joy was another aspect of quality of life that was experienced by aspiring performing artists upon receiving T-I instruction. Margaret expressed that her experience with receiving and utilizing imagery during the course of the study has renewed her joy for practice; a joy that was lost sometime ago. She stated that her excitement for practice stems from the utilization of comical imagery she incorporated during personal practice causing her to feel joy. Margaret’s body language conveyed more elation toward the end of the study than when she commenced. The last facet of quality of life that manifested within the data was relational. James expressed that his experience utilizing T-I instruction during his fourth week of practice uplifted his spirit due to evident progress made when practicing re-visited pieces. Consequently, James desired to reach out to other colleagues and share his feelings of T-I instruction’s positive influence on his learning. This is significant considering that James is an introvert. The non-musical effect of T-I instruction was that it inspired him to be more relational with his
colleagues and invest in his friendships more than before. Here is one statement that relates to T-I instruction’s positive effects on James’ outlook in life:

I think one of the most exciting outcomes of this study was that I became more relational with other people. I have not socialized with my peers in a while. I really enjoyed this study; seeing the immediate result on my performance due to cognitive approach (using images and scenery) has motivated me to reach out to my peers, reconnect, and re-build some friendships I had neglected due to schedules. It’s cool because my renewed passion for practicing the flute has been a topic I’ve been sharing with my friends. Life is better! (James, weekly-reflection journal #4).

It is easy for aspiring performing artists to lose sight of their impetuses for learning and practicing music, especially since those tasks are commonly done in isolation from other humans. It seems that T-I instruction may have been one of the contributing factors for increasing his life satisfaction; the instruction seems to have re-instilled his love for learning, which influenced his mood and relationship with others. James’s testimony is an indication that an instructor’s way of teaching not only affects a students’ musicianship but other variables pertaining to their quality of life as well.

**Multi-Faceted Musicianship**

Another major theme that was brought to light is the goal aspiring performing artists had for *multi-faceted musicianship*. Based on the statements from the pre-lesson questionnaires and bi-weekly interviews, aspiring performing artists expressed a common pinnacle goal they desired to attain as performing artist—to obtain multi-faceted skills including: (1) the ability to perform multiple genres with fluency, (2) the ability to sight-read, read notation, improvisation, compose, lead ensembles, conduct, engineer live and studio performances, produce other artists, promote their work, and teach a wide range of populaces. Beyond these skills, aspiring performing
artists aspired to be different, as opposed to being a carbon copy of their predecessors. One way they expressed they could achieve this goal is by expanding musical playlists to include additional genres of music they were unaccustomed to hearing. James stated he listened to a variety of different types of music from various parts of the world and of different time periods for enjoyment, and for broadening their musical eclecticism. In doing so, he could potentially become proficient in learning other styles of music. Greg indicated he enjoyed listening to recordings and live performances, learning, and performing a variety of musical styles beyond Western art music and jazz (i.e., Indian classical music, Celtic flute music, electronic dance music). In sum, aspiring performing artists expressed that the importance of learning and appreciating other styles of music could eventually lead to more vocational and networking opportunities, and allow them to reach larger populaces. A summation of the musical styles indicated included: Western art, contemporary pop, jazz, American folkloric, hip hop, rock & roll, Latin jazz, and contemporary flute pieces.

**Instrumentation** was another factor that appeared under multi-faceted musicianship. Aspiring performing artists mentioned that their studies of different musics was not limited to the flute, rather, they aspired to listen and watch performances where other musical instruments in hopes of learning new instrument; and that in doing so, their quality of life would be enriched. Greg and Dylan expressed that listening to other instrumentalists teaches them different approaches to phrasing musical passages, which helps them become more expressive performers. The instruments they were drawn to included: bassoon, saxophone, piano, violin, bass, Latin percussion, and cello. Greg and Dylan also mentioned reasons for
studying performances of other instrumentation were due to: (1) cultural upbringing, (2) perceived expressivity, and (3) relationships with colleagues who perform other instruments. Hence, multi-faceted musicianship was a recurring theme that was viewed as an essential quality to attain as performing artists. By embracing a multi-faceted mindset, students believed their opportunities for work would flourish in today’s society, resulting in increased quality of life.

Redefining Performing Artist

The last emerging theme for quality of life and phase one of this study was *redefining performing artist*. The term *performing artist* can take on different connotations depending on the context. For this reason, the term was operationalized for this study in the Introduction chapter; performing artist was defined as someone who can think, and communicate their ‘ideas’ and ‘approaches’ to an audience and one who challenges the status quo in a given area of study. Based on the analysis of statements regarding students’ impetuses for becoming performing artists, a new definition is proposed after discussing seven sub-themes that emerged from redefining performing artist.

The first sub-theme was *together*. Being social, together, or interactive with others are variables that constitutes to quality of life. Margaret and Greg indicated they love how one of music’s phenomenological attribute is its ability to “bring people together.” They noticed people of diverse cultural backgrounds, socio-economic statuses, ages, and vocations put aside their differences and enjoy musical performances together. They also indicated that it is because of this phenomenon that they aspire to cause the same effect through their performances, and that by uniting
people together they can minister to the world. The notion that a performance can awaken memories was another aspect that redefined the researcher’s definition of performing artist. James and Greg expressed one of the main reasons they love watching artists performing is because of their ability to evoke episodic memories through their music. Greg stated, “Evoking episodic memories is an important role of the performing artists because of its ministerial benefit.” (Greg, bi-weekly interview #2). James stated, “I love playing certain pieces because it unlocks memories that are dear to my heart and sooth me in times when I need it most” (James, pre-lesson questionnaire).

The third sub-theme was feeling better. Students expressed that one of music’s phenomenological qualities is its ability to brighten people’s days causing them to feel better. Greg indicated he loves to “prepare for a performance with the goal of blessing people and helping them feel.” (Greg, weekly reflection journal #2). Dylan stated that he desires for his performances “to heal people’s spirits.” (Dylan, bi-weekly interview #2). It is commonly known that music is used by many cultures as a form of communication. Aspiring performing artists clinged to idea of communicating through their instruments as one of the primary goals to attain as an artist. Each of them expressed one of their main desires, as performing artist is to communicate their thoughts, feelings, and life experiences through their compositions and performances.

Aspiring performing artists also desired to cause their audiences to experience transportation on a psychological level. James stated, “…while watching performances or performing, the music transports people to places that cannot be
experiences through other mediums of expression. Places where dreams are realized and broken hearts are mended.” and that it is his goal to “…transport the audience to worlds yet to be explored.” (James, weekly reflection journal #3). A sixth aspect that spawned from the term, performing artist, was the need for expression. All aspiring performing artists indicated they enjoyed expressing their emotions and moods through playing their instruments. Margaret stated, “Music is my main source of expression.” (Margaret, pre-lesson questionnaire).

The final component of a performing artist that appeared was spiritual healing. During Greg’s bi-weekly interview #2, he expressed that one of his main aspirations is to heal people’s disheartenment cause by the trials of life. He also mentioned that ‘healing’ is a central topic that fuels his inspiration to compose, song write, and improvise. Greg indicated in his weekly reflection journal #4 that when he gets invited to perform at different churches, his repertoire is predominantly comprised of original compositions, contemporary Christian pieces, and hymns that contain a message of Christ’s healing power embedded within the lyrics.

Definitively, the impetuses for students becoming performing artists have caused the researcher to examine his initial definition of a performing artist and propose a new definition. The sub-themes—healing, together, memories, transportation—have a common underlying theme, which is ministry. The statements indicate students had a strong desire to minister to audiences. It seems that aspiring performing artists hope their music could reach audiences and propel them forward in a constructive way of direction and meaning; this goal is directly to enriching quality of life audiences and performing artists. For a clearer understanding of the term,
ministry, the researcher is not talking about its religious connotation. Rather, ministry can be defined as meeting people’s needs with a compassionate heart. Hence, ministering is the first over-arching concept for redefining performing artist. The second meta-theme is communication. The sub-themes—expression and communication—can be summarized under the need for communication. Based on the statements, aspiring performing artists have a strong desire to communicate their thoughts, express their feelings, and evoke representational messages through their musical performances. Hence, a new definition of a performing artist can be proposed. A performing artist is a musician whose central goals are to communicate, minister to their audiences, and have a good quality of life. Now that themes under quality of life have been discussed, the researcher will summarize the findings for phase one.

**Summary of Themes**

The researcher commenced this study to test out six deductive themes: emotional connection, frame of reference, self-efficacy, technical facility, cognition and expressivity. After thoroughly analyzing the qualitative data, seven inductive themes emerged: non-threatening environment, enjoyment, life satisfaction, intrinsic motivation, modern music technology, multi-faceted musicianship, and redefining performing artist. Collectively, no negative themes appeared regarding T-I instruction’s influence on aspiring performing artists’ acquisition of learning newly composed pieces or improvisation. In analyzing the 13 themes that emerged for the first research question, two meta-themes appeared: Learning and Quality of life. These meta-themes hold intrinsic value for humans. They seem to correlate with nine
concepts pursued by aspiring performing artists throughout life: self-actualization, self-improvement, creativity/personal expression, socializing, independence, helping and encouraging others, understanding of self, occupational role, and intellectual development (Burckhardt & Anderson, 2003). The researcher summarizes how the conclusions based on the findings lead to learning and quality of life. Then, the researcher will describe the relationship between the two meta-themes and how they work collectively to serve as impetuses for aspiring performing artists’ pursuit of learning, practice, and performance.

**Learning**

Overall, T-I instruction was shown to be an effective and strategic tool that aspiring performing artists’ utilized to augment their learning sub-set skills: skills that must be well developed in order to facilitate their aspirations of being becoming professional performing artists. Aspiring performing artists’ learned to tactfully implement T-I instruction during applied lessons and personal practice to *learn* how to: (1) develop an emotional connection with newly composed pieces and improvisations; (2) establish a frame of reference before commencing reading performances and improvisations; (3) foster a non-threatening environment for learning; both external and internal environments; (4) develop intrinsic motivation for practicing newly composed pieces, improvisations, challenging repertoire, and fundamentals, as well as practicing at home; (5) strategize imagery-based remedies to strengthen self-efficacy for performance; (6) methodically practice music with imagery to influence their musical perception and production, ultimately, increasing their expressivity; (7) raise the level of enjoyment for practicing and learning about
music; (8) improve their technical facility to become better sight-readers, improvisers, and performers of notated music; (9) improve their cognition during improvisation; to think about their development of improvisations holistically, conceptually, and advantageously, and; (10) utilize various types of modern music technology to aid their visual and sonic comprehension of music during their personal practice sessions. Evidently, one of the benefits of T-I instructions was its capacity to teach aspiring performing artists’ effective strategies for developing essential factors for becoming professional performing artists.

**Quality of Life**

In addition to having a positive impact on aspiring performing artists’ learning, T-I instruction had a positive impact on non-musical variables such as their outlook on life, their day, their ambitions, and their relationships with their colleagues. The positive influence of T-I instruction on aspiring performing artists’ self-efficacy and musicianship motivated them to want to share their successes with their peers. In essence, aspiring performing artists’ identity and engagement with other peers were positively affected by the instruction. Dylan was an introverted individual who kept his feelings and perceptions of his musicianship to himself. Amazingly, his experience during the T-I instruction-based lesson inspired him to continue implementing the instruction during personal practice, to re-visit neglected pieces of music, and in turn, to share his progress with other colleagues. Dylan expressed that partaking in the study has been an uplifting experience for him; socializing with the instructor, learning about his musical strengths and weakness,
and how to overcome those weaknesses caused a transformational outlook of his daily life, aspirations, and relationships.

In Margaret’s case, T-I instruction had a positive effect on her life as well. Margaret expressed that she had dealt with negative perceptions of her future as a performing artist; these internal struggles also affected her emotions when not engaging in musical practice or performance. By partaking in T-I instruction, Margaret stated that she felt a renewed love for music and that her love for music vicariously influenced her outlook on life; she became more joyful and optimistic about her endeavors in becoming a performing artist. In her weekly-reflection journal #4, Margaret stated that her friends noticed a change in her behavior towards them; they perceived her as friendlier and more outgoing. As a result of implementing T-I instruction, Margaret gained more confidence as a performer and desired to communicate her progress with her peers in social contexts.

The themes, multi-faceted musicianship and redefining performing artists, was surprising to the researcher. For all aspiring performing artists, their continual pursuit to grow into competent musicians had a deeper purpose beyond entertaining audiences; each of them expressed a desire to use music as a tool to minister to their audiences. They also expressed that their main impetus for learning different styles of music and instruments was to potentially reach a demographically broader audience.

Beyond entertainment, all aspiring performing artists believed their musical talents were bestowed to them to help their audiences feel better emotionally, remember meaningful episodes, receive spiritual healing, transport to a state of serenity, and feel a sense of connectedness with other humans. It is these things that
helped define the aspiring performing artists’ identity, purpose, and role – to use music as a tool to enrich the quality of life of their audiences. In doing so, they augmented their quality of life.

It is a natural desire for humans to work towards finding out who they are, their purpose in life, and what specific roles they will have in society. It is also a natural desire for humans to want to better themselves holistically (e.g., spiritually, emotionally, intellectually, and so forth). In this study, aspiring performing artists’ pursuits for happiness were realized through the guidance of the instructor, who utilized T-I instruction during the applied lessons in a variety of ways. One of the main purposes for teaching aspiring performing artists with T-I instruction was to help them develop a deeper understanding of their occupational role as a performing artist; their reflections from the study brought new insight for their role as a performing artist causing a redefining of the term. Their testimonies revealed they had a deeper purpose for advancing their musical endeavors beyond the showcasing of talent. The essence of their pursuit was to reach a state of confidence and develop musical independence for creativity to flourish through their performances, and to connect with their audiences socially and ministeringly. The results of the study seem to suggest that T-I instruction was effective in propelling the aspiring performing artists towards this goal.

In analyzing the aspiring performing artists’ testimonies, the researcher referred to a Burckhardt and Anderson’s (2003) modified version of the Quality of Life Scale (QOLS), which was initially tested empirically by American psychologist, Joseph Flanagan (1982), to observed how the aspiring performing artists’ testimonies
relate to quality of life. The testimonies appear to be directly linked to the seven out of sixteen items from the QOLS. Items are indicated in italicized font.

Aspiring performing artists expressed they reconnected with disconnected friendships and developed more communication with colleagues (relationship with friends). Aspiring performing artists stated they began “paying-it-forward” by teaching other students with T-I instruction, and in doing so, gained a feeling of satisfaction (helping and encouraging others). Greg became more involved in volunteering his talents at a church and community outreach organizations (participating in organizations and public affairs), and gained a renewed passion for his music endeavors and a sense of purpose for being a performing artists (personal understanding of self). Dylan and Margaret felt that by participating in this study they gained a better understanding of learning how to practice music (intellectual development). James felt that implementing T-I instruction in his personal practice was an effective tool for developing his expressivity and creative thinking (creativity/personal expression). Finally, Greg became enthusiastic of his progress in improvisation, which lead to an increased level of self-efficacy for improvisation. Consequently, he began hosting jam sessions with other colleagues (socializing).

To be more in depth, the instructor chose to concentrate on cultivating the aspiring performing artists’ intellectual understandings of repertoire, performances, and practice, so their creativity/personal expression could flow out of their cognizance with ease. It is important to note that the engagement of learning was experienced simultaneously by both the instructor and aspiring performing artists, and thus, both entities experienced help and encouragement from one another—the
instructor encourages the aspiring performing artists, and in return, the instructor received affirmation of his pedagogical style. This process cultivated a healthy relationship between the instructor and aspiring performing artists that was necessary for experiencing other facets contributing to life satisfaction. Finally, intellectual development seemed to be a factor that aspiring performing artists pursued to enrich their quality of life. By obtaining knowledge, wisdom, and understanding for many subjects, aspiring performing artists have the potential to function and relate in society, and thus, could improve their quality of life.

Now that the meta-themes, themes, and sub-themes for phase one have been reported, the researcher will report the themes and sub-themes that emerged for the second research question. Categorizations for students’ feelings of T-I instruction versus technical instruction when learning during the applied lesson setting included the following three inductive themes: (1) Preference for improvisation-learning aspiring performing artists (2) Variability for instruction; and (3) Additional support for T-I instruction. Figure 4.2 presents a diagram the represents the structure of these themes.
**Research Question I. b.**

The researcher will describe the three themes in the sequence as indicated on Figure 4.2.

**Preference for Improvisation-Learning Aspiring Performing Artists**

Many aspiring performing artist develop pedagogical preferences for learning repertoire, whether it is technical instruction, imagery-based instruction, listening to music, reading about pieces’ significances, and so forth. The researcher sought to find out if there were any preferences among the aspiring performing artists for one of the two instructions or for both. Both Greg and Dylan testified their reservations for both instructions and when they should be applied, hence, implications are limited to aspiring performing artists learning improvisation. Keep in mind that the instructor never mentioned the purpose of the study to the aspiring performing artists and that
their perceptions of the two instructions are based on their opinions from the post-
lesson journals. Greg and Dylan mentioned that technical instruction was most
beneficial during the first lesson. As new Blues improvisers, they preferred receiving
technical instruction in the beginning stages. The also indicated that the instructor
might not have noticed vast improvements in the short time frame of the study had
the instructor commenced with T-I instruction at the beginning lessons. Greg
expressed that he would have been confused and lost if the instructor tried to teach
him how to improvise using imagery at first, since he did not posses the theoretical
foundation to improvise comfortably with appropriateness and authority:

I really enjoyed receiving more conceptual-type of instruction in this lesson. I
thought the way the teacher taught the lesson last week provided me a
necessary foundation and prepared me for this week’s lesson, which was more
oriented in creative thinking.

Hence, technical instruction was the preferred method of instruction for the
beginning stages of applied lessons, and T-I instruction was more beneficial for the
latter stages of applied lessons for aspiring performing artists learning improvisation.
This finding confers the researcher’s theoretical framework for learning that was
discussed in the Chapter One: technical instruction should be the initial form of
instruction for students. Once aspiring performing artists’ technique is fortified, the
instructor should introduce a multi-sensory approach to their pedagogy—utilizing
imagery, movement, technology, and so forth.

Aspiring performing artists also postulated that one of the main benefits for
learning with technical instruction is the technical flourishing that the instruction
facilitates. James expressed that as a performer and visual artist, he aimed to focus his
energy learning how to play the pieces with technical flawlessness. After achieving this goal, he implemented imagery to influence his expressive output, body language, and creative thinking during performance. Hence, aspiring performing artists learning improvisation preferred technical instruction as a technical-refinement tool and T-I instruction as an expressive-inducing tool.

Theoretical understanding was also enhanced with technical instruction. Greg expressed that upon receiving technical instruction, he was able to strengthen their theoretical understanding for the music. Both Greg and Dylan appreciated learning the functionality of scales with chords, the construct of the Blues harmonic progression, and the manipulation of musculature to perform the Blues appropriately. Teaching with technical instruction enabled them to understand the application of scales and arpeggios that were learn as a part of a requirement for their undergraduate degree. Dylan stated:

I love practicing scales and modes. A lot of my peers don’t like to practice their scales because they don’t know how it will apply to them in the real world, aside from being able to reading scales on a page. I learned from this lesson that the reason why I learned scales was to help me understand music, and create music myself. (Dylan’s, post-lesson journal #2)

Hence, technical instruction can serve many purposes beyond refining technical facility. It can be a gateway for explaining theoretical aspects of music which (1) can be interesting for aspiring performing artists to learn, and (2) can spark an interest for aspiring performing artists to apply their theoretical understanding in their own compositions and improvisations.
Variability for Instruction

Another concept to consider is that there was variability for instruction. This study confirms other studies’ findings in that the effectiveness and preferences for both instructions varied among students case by case. Considering the complexity of each individual (e.g., biological make-up, acculturation, influences, temperament, and so forth), it is understandable that the effectiveness of both instructions is varying. The results of this study also confirm the theory that suitable pedagogical methods that address specificities of aspiring performing artists’ learning are best implemented when the instructor has developed an understanding of students’ needs, strengths, and weakness, which are revealed through the cultivation of teacher-student relationships.

Seven sub-themes emerged from variability of instruction. The first sub-theme was essential. Students expressed that technical instruction was an essential form of instruction needed for gaining foundational understanding for how to play music with conviction and expressivity. Students mentioned that they value the practice of technical mastery because it eventually leads to the limitless ability to express ideas and emotion through their instrument.

When it came to receiving a balance of different types of instruction, all aspiring performing artists students indicated that they preferred to receive an interchangeable balance of different types of instruction to keep learning engaging and inspiring. In other words, they enjoy receiving lessons that are different in approach on a weekly basis. By combining technical instruction with imagery or other non-conventional instructions, students believed that their learning rate would increase, and their artistic development would blossom holistically. There was a
common form of instruction among Margaret’s and Greg’s applied lessons: technical instruction. Margaret stated that she has never had an applied lesson in which the instructor utilized imagery descriptions. Technical instruction is the main method of instruction she had received in all her years of flute study. Greg stated that his former flute teachers in Puerto Rico also taught primarily with a technical-based approach.

The fourth theme was overload. Students expressed that too much technical instruction could become cognitively overloading and debilitating to their rate of learning. Margaret stated during her bi-weekly interview #1, “receiving only technical instruction has made it stressful and non-personal experience for my learning.” By not varying pedagogical styles in applied lessons, aspiring performing artists could experience boredom. All aspiring performing artists expressed that being raised in a multi-media driven society made them accustomed to learn from multi-sensory pedagogical approaches. However, their primary form of instruction they received during applied lessons, and when attending master classes was solely technically-driven, which students expressed that they sometimes experience boredom when learning and long for more multi-sensory learning experiences.

Preference for instructions varied based on the subject that aspiring performing artists where learning—newly composed pieces or improvisation. James indicated his preferred method of instruction was technical instruction when learning a newly composed piece. He expressed that his preference for technical instruction stemmed from the fact that he already utilized imagery to establish musical meaning and to help increase his musical expressivity, hence, preferred to receive guidance that would help him to achieve technical mastery of the pieces he was learning. The
final sub-theme was dislike. Margaret expressed that having received solely technical instruction has caused her to dislike learning, pieces she initially enjoyed, and her own playing. However, her participation in this study has made her that she is more drawn to T-I instruction when learning notated pieces. It seemed that T-I instruction was an effective tool in renewing her passion for learning, repertoire, and her playing.

Additional Support for T-I Instruction

Additionally, aspiring performing artists expressed that by growing up in a multi-media prevalent society, they are entrained to experience art forms in a multi-sensory fashion. Hence, they preferred T-I instruction because it encouraged aspiring performing artists to utilize their sonic, visual, and touch senses during learning. Though all of them agreed that learning music from a technical standpoint is essential for their musicianship, they posit that learning solely from a technical standpoint facilitates one of several factors needed for producing a satisfactory level of expressivity—the physical ability to perform music through their instruments.

Margaret, James, and Greg indicated three other factors they yearn to address during applied lessons and personal practice for strengthening their expressivity: (1) The implementation of imagery techniques to induce inspiration, motivation, and expressivity, (2) A thorough discussion and understanding of the background and significance of a piece and its composer, (3) The development of student’s stage presence and body language to better convey their emotional connection to the piece, and to strengthen their audiences’ perception of expressivity while listening to their performances, and (4) The development of verbal communicating designed to engage audiences. Hence, when all aspiring performing artists received T-I instruction, they
unanimously agreed the instruction had greater effects on their development towards becoming well-rounded performing artists, as opposed to receiving solely technical instruction.

**Phase Two**

**Research Questions**

For phase two of this study, the researcher sought out to answer the five research questions:

II.a. Does T-I instruction have a statistically significance on influence listeners’ perceived expressivity of phase-one students’ performances of newly composed pieces and improvisations?

II.b. What is the degree of listeners’ perceived expressivity of students’ reading versus improvised performances influenced by T-I instruction or technical instruction?

II.c. Is there a statistical significant difference of T-I instructions’ influence on the progressive differences in the means of listeners’ perceived expressivity between the students across the time frame of the study?

II.d. What are listeners’ reasons for their ratings of perceived expressivity?

II.e. What kind of information helps listeners perceive music as expressive?

**Data Analysis**

Listeners ($N = 60$), rather than aspiring performing artists, were the unit of analysis for phase two of the study. Listeners comprised of music-majors ($n = 30$) and non-music majors ($n = 30$). The purpose of having the two groups was for potential stratification and comparison of the qualitative results if the data was shown to have internal consistency. A total of ($n = 24$) recordings from phase-one aspiring performing artist performances were provided for the listeners (six audio recordings per aspiring performing artist) to rate the degree of perceived expressivity on the
Perceived Expressivity Questionnaire (PEQ). The recordings were un-tampered audio recordings; the researcher did not mix or edit the recording. Identities of the aspiring performing artist were not disclosed to the listeners. For each rating, there was a qualitative component where listeners could explain their reason for their rating. Afterwards, listeners were asked to fill out any information that helps them to perceive music as expressive in the Brief Essay Response.

Descriptive statistics were applied to the demographic data. Then, before answering research questions #1 through #4, Cronbach’s alpha statistic was implemented to verify the internal consistency of the data set (i.e., listeners’ responses from the PEQ) to determine if further analysis was necessary. The researcher and experts applied the same techniques from phase-one for analyzing the phase-two’s qualitative data. A total of 18 themes emerged from the data. Eleven themes emerged for research question #5 which can be compiled into a meta-theme, musical components: dynamic contrast, rhythm, vibrato, tone quality, articulation, intonation, weight, phrasing, use of space, confidence, and time feel. Seven themes emerged from the data for research question #6: imagery, wide contrast of musical components, knowledge of significances, familiarity, instrumental preferences, musical genres, and exuberant stage presence.

**Unacceptable Internal Consistency**

Initially, a mixed-effects ANOVA statistical procedure was to be implemented to determine the progressive differences of listeners’ perceived expressivity, and stratified means of demographic data. However, the Cronbach’s alpha results for listeners’ perceived expressivity of musical performances indicated a surprising low
degree of internal consistency, $\alpha = .02$. Descriptive statistics (i.e., mean $[m]$, standard deviation $[\sigma]$, and variance $[\sigma^2]$) of listeners’ perceived expressivity were implemented for each aspiring performing artists’ performances. Results for Margaret showed a $m = 4.20$, $\sigma = 1.80$, $\sigma^2 = 3.25$. Results for James showed a $m = 3.97$, $\sigma = 1.41$, $\sigma^2 = 1.99$. Results for Greg showed a $m = 5.87$, $\sigma = 1.20$, $\sigma^2 = 1.44$. Results for Dylan showed a $m = 3.99$, $\sigma = 1.22$, $\sigma^2 = 1.50$. Data stratification of the internal consistency of listeners’ perceived expressivity of performances indicated the following results: $\alpha = .06$, skewness = .42, and kurtosis = -1.89 for sight-reading performances; $\alpha = -.31$, skewness = .04, and kurtosis = -.13 for technical instruction-influenced performances; $\alpha = .20$, skewness = .19, and kurtosis = .43 for T-I instruction-influenced performances.

Additionally, data stratification of the internal consistency of listeners’ perceived expressivity of performances indicated the following results: $\alpha = -.27$, skewness = -0.13, and kurtosis = .38 for technical instruction-influenced reading performances; $\alpha = -.65$, skewness = -1.65, and kurtosis = .61 for technical instruction-influenced improvisations; $\alpha = .18$, skewness = .07, and kurtosis = .47 for T-I instruction-influenced improvisations; $\alpha = .02$, skewness = .06, and kurtosis = .36 for T-I instruction influenced reading performances. Hence, the mixed-effects ANOVA statistical procedure was not implemented or needed to answer research questions one through three due to the low internal consistency of listener’s perceived expressivity of aspiring performing artists’ performances.

In a previous pilot study, the internal consistency of the listener’s perceived expressivity was $\alpha = .73$ which is considered acceptable internal consistency.
However, the audio performance stimuli that listeners rated their perceived expressivity included T-I instruction or technical instruction examples preceding each aspiring performing artist’s performance, which were variables that influenced listeners’ perceived expressivity. One of the objectives of this study was to see whether T-I instruction’s influence on aspiring performing artists’ performances could vicariously influence listeners’ perception of expressivity when listening to the performances without disclosing any imagery examples to listeners. In the case that it was possible, the researcher could draw the conclusion that T-I instruction is an effective tool for enhancing listeners’ (or audience’s) perceived expressivity of musical performances without the need for performers to explain the imagery influencing their performances. This finding would have shown to be a useful tool for aspiring performing artists who wish to be perceived as more expressive, yet, who perform in settings in which imagery examples are not openly discussed before a performance. To minimize the subjectivity of listeners’ rating for this study, the researcher did not: (1) disclose the purpose of the study, (2) disclose the identity of aspiring performing artists, (3) state T-I instruction or technical instruction examples before aspiring performing artists’ performances, (4) select a variety of instrumentation; only flutists, and (5) utilize any standard Western art or Blues repertoire.

In sum, listeners from the pilot did have contextual information of the performances whereas listeners for this study did not, which could be one reason why the internal consistency of perceived expressivity was strong for the pilot study and weak for this study. This finding suggests that the conditions in which the stimuli
were presented to listeners was not the most productive way for measuring their perceived expressivity of performances and there may be no instrument that would show to be reliable due to the high degree of subjectivity among listeners’ perceptions. Perceived expressivity is a highly subjective variable that is influenced and cultivated by other variables. Listeners only heard aspiring performing artists’ sight-reading and final performances of each lesson. Listeners had no reference for each aspiring performing artists’ (1) initial level of expressivity or expertise, (2) progress throughout the time frame of the study, nor (3) the imagery description that improvisation-learning students chose to influence their final improvisatory performances, which were three other variables that could have contributed to low internal consistency of perceived expressivity. Since T-I instruction did not have a statistically significant effect on listeners’ perceived expressivity due to the conditions the stimuli were presented to them, the researcher chose not to discuss the emerging themes from their explanations for their ratings in great detail. A summation of the findings from listeners’ explanations is provided after the demographic results. Afterwards, emerging themes from the brief essay responses are presented.

**Demographic Results**

Overall, a total of $N = 60$ listeners comprised of a range of ethnicities including White (German, Irish, English, Dutch) = 30, Black (African American, Jamaican, Hatian) = 19, Hispanic (Puerto Rican, Cuban, Dominican, Guatemalan) = 7, Asian (Chinese, Korean) = 3, and Native American = 1. The average age of listeners was a mean of $M = 20.8$ years old. Results for gender of listeners included
Male = 32 and Female = 28. Listeners were a convenient sample of music majors = 30 and non-music majors = 30 from a school of music in a large Southeastern university. All non-music majors listed an instrument they play in vernacular settings. Listeners indicated their primary instruments: flute = 5, piano = 4, drums = 5, trumpet = 5, clarinet = 4, male vocalists = 5, female vocalists = 5, violin = 5, cello = 5, bass = 3, DJ = 4, trombone = 3, tuba = 2, bassoon = 2, guitar = 2, and French horn = 1. No student indicated having a hearing impairment.

**Listeners’ Explanations for Their Ratings**

After reviewing, coding, and discussing the qualitative data, the researcher and experts established 11 emerging themes from the listeners’ explanations for their ratings of perceived expressivity from listening to phase one aspiring performing artist’ performances. The 11 themes that emerged from listeners’ explanations dealt with mixed opinions regarding the students’ utilization of musical components—dynamic contrast, rhythm, vibrato, tone quality, articulation, intonation, weight, phrasing, use of space, confidence, and time feel. Listeners provided a wide range of opinions for all emerging theme. The researcher organized the qualitative results for each theme by providing one positive response and one negative response for each theme to show the lack of internal inconsistency from the data set. Contradicting responses were extracted from the PEQ. Figure 4.3 presents a diagram the represents the structure of these themes.
Contrasting Explanations for Listener’s Ratings of Perceived Expressivity

Theme 1: Dynamics

**Margaret’s sight-reading performance (Lesson #1)**

- “Dynamics weren’t that different.” (Listener 1)
- “I thought the flutist had pretty good use of dynamics.” (Listener 29)
Theme 2: *Rhythm*

**Margaret’s final performance (Lesson #1)**

- “The rhythm wasn’t that strong. It was shaky.” (Listener 8)
- “The flutist played with good rhythmic feel.” (Listener 20)

Theme 3: *Vibrato*

**Margaret’s T-I final performance (Lesson #2)**

- “I thought use of vibrato was okay. It could be better.” (Listener 3)
- “Beautiful vibrato and tone.” (Listener 4)

Theme 4: *Tone Quality*

**Margaret’s sight-reading performance (Lesson #3)**

- “I didn’t like the sound of the flute. Too edgy.” (Listener 16)
- “Nice warm tone.” (Listener 38)

Theme 5: *Articulation*

**Margaret’s final performance (Lesson #3)**

- “The tonguing was really awesome.” (Listener 9)
- “I don’t thinking the articulation fits the style.” (Listener 16)

Theme 6: *Intonation*

**Margaret’s final performance (Lesson #4)**

- “Pitchy. Not that in tune.” (Listener 1)
- “I thought it was a great performance, great intonation.” (Listener 25)

Theme 7: *Weight*

**James’s final performance (Lesson #2)**

- “There music had more weight which made it sound good.” (Listener 37)
- “It felt too heavy.” ( Listener 47)

Theme 8: *Phrasing*

**Greg’s final performance (Lesson #2)**
• “I really like his phrasing during the solo. It made sense.” (Listener 5)
• “The phrasing of the improvisation was to rigid.” (Listener 37)

**Theme 9: Use of Space**

**Dylan’s sight-improvisation performance (Lesson #1)**

• “It was too busy. No space.” (Listener 5)
• “I thought the flutist took his time very well.” (Listener 37)

**Theme 10: Confidence**

**Dylan’s final performance (Lesson #1)**

• “It seemed like the flutist lacked confidence in their solo.” (Listener 7)
• “I dug the solo a lot. Great command and confidence.” (Listener 56)

**Theme 11: Time Feel**

**Dylan’s final performance (Lesson #4)**

• “Flutist had a great sense of time feel in his solo. It grooved.” (Listener 11)
• “The flutist’s timing didn’t line up well with the 8th note pulse from the accompaniment.” (Listener 26)

Though the internal consistency may seem unacceptable, listeners’ qualitative responses from the brief essay response in the PEQ provided plausible explanations for the strong disagreement of listeners’ perceptions of phase one students’ musical expressivity. Further discussion of variables that potentially caused the low internal consistency of listeners’ perceived expressivity of performances is provided in the Discussion chapter. The researcher reviewed all listeners’ brief essay responses, coded responses thoroughly and collectively with the three experts, discussed findings, and agreed on titles for recurring themes that were uncovered. Results are indicated below.
Themes from Brief Essay Responses

When performing artists have an in-depth understanding of their listeners (i.e., demographic information, interests, preferences for different types of music, preferences for a performance’s delivery, and so forth), they can better prepare performances to meet their listeners’ needs, which can lead to successful performances. For this reason, the research included a Brief Essay Response section at the end of the Perceived Expressivity Questionnaire with one question that pertained to their perception of expressivity—“What kind of information helps you to perceive music as expressive?” Seven themes emerged from the brief essay responses: imagery, contrast of musical components, knowledge of significance, familiarity, instrumentation preferences, musical genres, and stage presence. Figure 4.4 presents a diagram that represents the structure of these themes.

Figure 4.4. Themes from The PEQ’s Brief Essay Response
Imagery

The first theme was imagery. Listeners expressed that they perceive music as more expressive when the artist provides them with conceptual descriptors associated with the music: a story, mood, episodic memory, representation, resemblance, or characters associated with the music. Listeners also indicated they formulate imagery in their minds when listening to music to foster enjoyment. Look at the statements below and notice the varying types of imagery expressed—imagery that represents a story line, episodic, and indexical and iconic descriptors. These listeners tend to think conceptually about the music, not so much technically:

“I love it when music tells me a story. When I hear a song, I want to know why was the song created. When I listen to instrumentals, I want to know what the composition represents.” (Listener 13).

“I like it when music causes me to go back in time and relive my child moments” (Listener 46)

“Knowing the music’s representation.” (Listener 9).

“Innately feeling the mood of a piece.” (Listener 27).

These nature of these statements are significant for aspiring performing artists; they stress the importance for performing artists to think imaginatively about the music so that they could better relate to how their audience thinks. In doing so, artists may perform with a higher degree of aestheticism.

Contrast of Musical Components

The second theme was contrast of musical components. Listeners expressed that when musicians perform with a wide range of musical components they perceive the music as more expressive. The musical components that were mentioned
included: dynamics, vibrato, articulation, space, tone quality, and time feel. Take a few moments to observe the statements related to contrast of musical components’ effect on listeners’ perceived expressivity. The testimonies from these listeners were specifically music-majors:

“Vibrato is key.” (Listener 32)

“For me, music is more expressive when an artist is tactful with his/her vibrato, dynamics, use of space, and other musical attributes.” (Listener 54).

“When a performer uses space in his solos and has a warm tone; cool jazz.” (Listener 36).

The quotes indicate that music-major listeners are very attentive to vibrato and tone, which happens to be two of the most common musical components that are reinforced during flute applied lessons. It may be valuable for aspiring performing artists to be consciously aware of their tone and vibrato if they desire to maintain listeners’ interests.

**Knowledge of Significances**

The second theme was *knowledge of significance*. Listeners indicated they perceive music as more expressive when they understand the significance of the piece. Sub-themes pertaining to significance include: knowledge of the composer(s), historical significance, and theoretical significance of the composition. Listeners expressed that by understanding these significances; they can uncover information to establish a personal connection with the composer’s work and the performer, ultimately, perceiving the music as more expressive. It seems that the prevailing aspect for listeners’ perceived expressivity is learning information about the composer; all three testimonies indicated as such:
“I like to know how the piece was constructed and personal background of the composer. As a composer, I generally will perceive the music to be expressive once I grasp the theoretical knowledge.” (Listener 7).

“Know who the was the composer.” (Listener 48).

“Learning the history of the composer, the history that took place during the creation of this piece.” (Listener 31).

Hence, aspiring performing artists should consider mentioning to their audiences interesting details about the composer, as well as the historical and theoretical aspects of the piece.

**Familiarity**

The third theme was *familiarity*. Listeners indicated they perceive music as more expressive when they become familiarized with (1) the composer, (2) the composition, (3) the style of music, and (4) the performer. By becoming familiar, listeners expressed that they feel more connected to the music and performer, hence, altering their perceived expressivity. These listeners’ indicated that the value of becoming familiar with the composer and/or style of music is to relate with the music on a personal level:

“Relating with the composer or performer. Finding out if we have anything in common.” (Listener 55).

“Listening to the styles of music I grew up on.” (Listener 13).

“Learning about who the artist are and what was their story.” (Listener 4).

Listeners enjoy performances that provide them some form of emotional or episodic connection. Aspiring performing artists could potentially gain the respect of other listeners if they are provided with contextual information of the composer or
meaning of a piece. In doing so, listeners can become more familiar with the piece and may come to like the performance as a result of their familiarity.

**Instrumentation Preferences**

The fourth theme was *instrumentation*. Some listeners indicated that their perceive expressivity of music is dependent on the instrumentation for which the composition was written for. Listener 3 stated that he perceived jazz music to be more expressive when a saxophonist is improvising than when a trombonist improvises. Listeners expressed that their instrumental preferences is attributed to their cultural upbringing, attended concerts, involvement with various ensembles (i.e., large ensembles, church ensembles, vernacular jam bands), witnessing a “killer” soloist performing, and musical exposure (i.e., radio, Youtube and Facebook videos). Take a look at the statements related to instrumentation’s effect on listeners’ perceived expressivity and notice that each listener mentioned a different family member of instruments:

“I navigate towards string instruments.” (Listener 47).

“Music that includes brass instruments.” (Listener 51).

“Anything with drums. Drums are the most expressive instruments ever.” (Listener 39).

These statements postulate to aspiring performing artists the importance of offering timbral diversity in their performances. In doing so, aspiring performing artists could prevent listeners from experiencing sonic fatigue and keep them engaged during the performance.
Musical Genres

The fifth theme was musical genres. Listeners indicated that their perceived expressivity of music is dependent on the musical genre. Some listeners expressed that because of their domestic exposure with certain genres, they tend to prefer those genres. Other listeners stated that their preferences of genres are based on the lyrical and sonic content that portraying their emotional state. They pick a style of music that reflects how they feel in the moment, which causes them to perceive the music as more expressive. The listeners’ testimonies indicate the broad scope of genre interests that can exist within a performance sitting:

“ I like jazz because it calms me down. I think that is the most expressive artform.” (Listener 48).

“Pieces from the Romantic period.” (Listener 37).

“Rock music…it reflects my emotions.” (Listener 22).

These statements postulate to aspiring performing artists the importance of being eclectic in the offering of genres to listeners during a performance. Since it is common to have a diverse group of people within an audience, some of the most notable artists in the 20th Century have evolved into cross-over genre performers to expand the demographic reach of their audiences. Among many, some of the artists include Yo-Yo Ma, Bobby McFerrin, and Paquito D’Rivera.

Stage Presence

The seventh theme was Stage Presence. Listeners expressed that exuberant body movement, appropriated attire, upright posture, dance moves, and facial expressions during performance all contribute to their perception of expressivity.
These testimonies indicate that different listeners are observant of various parts of the performer’s body, which should be taken into consideration by the aspiring performing artist:

“When a performer squints his eyes while he playing.” (Listener 50).

“Performers who know how to dress. Nice dress or tux.” (Listener 41).

“I love it when a performer can dance while playing their instruments. I think that is super expressive.” (Listener 12).

The subject of stage presence may not be as commonly addressed as other subjects (i.e., technical facility, nuance, expressivity, musical components), however, it is one of the most importance facets of any performance and should be addressed by the instructor and studied by the aspiring performing artists. Since a live performance is a multi-sensory experience, performers may receive more positive responses from the audience if they make efforts to present their best performances, sonically and visually.

**Themes From Brief Essay Responses Not Present in Listeners’ Stimuli**

One of the explanations for the low internal consistency of listener’s perceived expressivity of aspiring performing artists’ performances is that the seven emerging themes from the brief essay responses (i.e., imagery, contrast of musical components, significance, familiarity, instrumentation, musical genres, and stage presence) were never presented to the listeners in the stimuli. In the attempt to control for subjective responses from the listeners, the researcher did not include any information of the composer, performer, performances, or composition within the stimuli. However, without any information provided to the listeners, it may have been
difficult for listeners’ to provide a more accurate reflection of their perceived expressivity. Furthermore, listeners’ may have experienced fatigue from listening to stimuli that was solely flute performances. Listener 8 stated in his rating explanations, “It’s all flute?” Conclusively, the conditions in which the stimuli were presented may not have been the most efficient way for measuring listeners’ expressivity. Future research could observe the change, if any, of listeners’ perception of expressivity while listening to performances with additional information contained within the stimuli.

**Answers to Phase-Two Research Questions**

The summation of all results and thematic findings for phase offers several conclusions for the research questions. First, listeners’ perceived expressivity is very difficult to measure quantitatively. Though previous pilot studies inferred acceptable internal consistency of listeners’ responses, the results of this study inform the researcher that perceived musical expressivity is a highly complex and subjective concept that is formed by many extraneous variables, and is unique to each individual.

Second, the variances of listeners’ perceived expressivity of performances influenced by T-I instruction offer several generalizations to the field under the: (1) Listeners cannot generally agree on the perceive expressivity of aspiring performing artists’ performances of newly composed pieces and improvisations; (2) Listeners cannot perceive differences in expressivity for aspiring performing artists’ reading performances verses improvised performances; (3) Listeners cannot perceive differences in expressivity of aspiring performing artists’ performances influenced by
T-I instruction across the time frame of the study; (4) Explanations for listeners’ ratings of perceived expressivity mainly consisted of mixed opinions regarding the students’ utilization of musical components; and (5) Listeners perceive music as expressive: if they are provided with imagery descriptions for the music; if musicians perform with a wide contrast of musical components; if they understand significances of the piece, composer, its history, and its theoretical components; if the are familiar with the piece, composer, performer, and style of music; if the music contains their instrumentation preferences; if they are familiar with the musical genre; and if the performer has exuberant stage presence.

**Conclusion of the Study’s Results**

In summary of the results for the study, T-I instruction was shown to be a very effective tool for enhancing students’ learning and quality of life. T-I instruction and technical instruction are both effective pedagogical tools for influencing various outcomes and should be implemented appropriately as determined by the instructor. Listeners’ perceived expressivity of performances is a complex topic that needs to be investigated in a variety methods beyond the method that was done for this study. The results for phase two demonstrated that notion due to the unacceptably low consists of of listeners’ responses. Listeners were unable to perceive significant differences in expressivity of aspiring performing artists’ performances that were either influenced by T-I instruction or technical instruction. The also results indicated that music listeners are sonically, visually and informatively stimulated; these factors should be made available to the listener simultaneously in a performance setting. Listeners
desire to understand contextual information of the music and desire to witness the
music transcend visually through performers’ body language.

Now that the results from this study have been presented, the researcher
provide the following information in Chapter Five, *Discussion*: answers to the
research questions, gains from the study, implications for performers, implications for
music educators, discuss the limitations of the study, suggest future research, personal
reflection from conducting the study, and concluding thoughts.
CHAPTER FIVE

DISCUSSION

The construct of this chapter commences with the impetus for conducting the study. Then, the researcher provides (1) answers to the research questions, (2) gains from the study, (3) implications for performers and music educators, (4) discussion of the limitations of the study, (5) suggestions for future research, and (6) a personal reflection from conducting the study.

Why Was This Study Needed?

For aspiring performing artists to develop into performing artists, many variables must be present in aspiring performing artists’ lives in order to witness their continual growth towards their artistic-developmental goals. Some of those variables may include the following: receiving suitable forms of instruction, having a deep understanding of different types of music, experience with performing in ensembles of assorted instrumentation and genres, having support systems, having various outlets to exercise their creative thinking, possessing public relations and marketing skills, and so forth. To narrow down the investigation, the researcher chose to focus on a particular form of instruction that has been highly effective for many other performers’ artistic development and expressivity, including the researcher’s personal artistry—T-I instruction, or the synchrony of technical and imagery-based instruction,
and to see if and how the instruction would influence other aspiring performing artists who aspire to become performing artists.

The researcher has observed over the years that many of his colleagues have struggled to reach certain goals pertaining to personal practice, performance, or vocational opportunities. These struggles can stem from an inability to uncover an effective cognitive strategy to implement during learning and performing. Many aspiring performing artists struggle to expedite artistic-developmental processes at a quicker time frame. Sometimes the instruction aspiring performing artists receive in the applied lesson setting does not effectively compliment their learning style. For these reasons, the impetus for this study spawned from the researcher’s desire to find a suitable method of instruction that can be utilized to cultivate aspiring performing artists in becoming entrepreneurial, multi-faceted performing artists who graduate with higher marketability in the music industry.

Hence, the researcher chose to (1) observe T-I instruction’s influence on aspiring performing artists’ acquisition of learning and performing newly composed pieces and improvisations. The focus on learning newly composed pieces and improvisation is due to the current music industry’s expectancy of many performing artists having to perform newly composed pieces and/or improvisations in a variety of musical contexts with a high degree of expressivity and ownership, with minimal time for preparation. The researcher was also curious to (2) discover aspiring performing artists’ feelings of learning with T-I instruction versus solely technical instruction. Furthermore, since one common goal for performing artists is to effect listeners’ perceived expressivity of their performances, the researcher assessed
listeners’ (3) perceived expressivity of aspiring performing artists’ performances that were either influenced by T-I instruction or technical instruction, and whether there was statistical significance, (4) explanations for their ratings, and (5) information that helps listeners perceive music as expressive. The answers to the five research questions are provided below.

**Answers to the Phase-One Research Questions**

**Question I. a.**

*What is T-I instruction’s influence on aspiring performing artists’ acquisition of learning newly composed pieces or improvisations?* In essence, 13 emerging themes spawned for the first research question – 10 themes dealt with aspiring performing artists’ *learning* and three theme dealt with *quality of life*. T-I instruction had 10 positive influences on aspiring performing artists’ ability to learn tactics for: (1) developing emotional connections with the music; (2) establishing frames of references; (3) facilitating a non-threatening environment for learning; (4) augmenting their intrinsic motivation for practice; (5) strengthening their self-efficacy for performance; (6) increasing their musical expressivity; (7) increasing their enjoyment during learning; (8) refining their technical facility for play their instrument; (9) fortifying their cognition for and during improvisation, and for perform newly composed pieces or improvisations, and; (10) utilizing modern music technology to facilitate their learning and practice sessions. T-I instruction also (11) enriched aspiring performing artists’ life satisfaction outside of applied lessons and personal practice sessions; (12) contributed to aspiring performing artist’ goals of
becoming multi-faceted musicians, and; (13) inspired a redefinition of the term performing artist.

**Learning**

**Emotional Connection**

T-I instruction helped aspiring performing artists learn to foster emotional connection with newly composed pieces and improvisations. Aspiring performing artists indicated that the selection of music they listen to is based on their emotions. To perform expressively, aspiring performing artists indicated they first attempt to discover the emotionality of piece they are learning, and then make technical decisions that will sonically project that emotion to their listeners. Establishing emotional connections is very important for the aspiring performing artists. Doing so allows them to humanize the music and allow the music to transcend beyond the notation and technique.

**Frame of Reference**

T-I instruction helped aspiring performing artists learn to established frame of references for the music to guide their approach to learning the music. Aspiring performing artists’ statements supported the researchers’ notion that imagery-based instruction allows for meaningful learning to occur when learning music. Aspiring performing artists appreciated knowing the associations and representations of the pieces to gain an understanding for the pieces’ significances. T-I instruction helped them understand how and why to play the pieces; answers to these questions was a pre-determinant factor for increasing their intrinsic motivation for learning the music, performing the music with more expressivity, and fostering enjoyment for learning the music.
Non-Threatening Environment

T-I instruction helped teachers learn to facilitate non-threatening learning environments for aspiring performing artists learning unfamiliar notated piece and genres for improvisation. Some of the aspiring performing artists entered the lessons tense due to their low self-efficacy, but became more relaxed as T-I instruction was implemented. Aspiring performing artists learning improvisation felt more comfortable expressing their thoughts, performing the instructor’s requested suggestions, and tried out new musical ideas during improvisation. They embraced their mistakes as natural processes that occur during their developmental stages.

Intrinsic Motivation

T-I instruction helped aspiring performing artists learn a method for increasing their intrinsic motivation for practice. Aspiring performing artists expressed they have often experience boredom, uncertainty, or stress when practicing, and thus, have neglected to engage in continual practice routines or study more challenging repertoire. Upon implementing T-I instruction in the applied lesson setting, aspiring performing artists’ enjoyment for learning increased due to the instructors’ affirmation of their progress, in which they also witnessed an increased understanding of their pieces. Hence, aspiring performing artists felt motivated to continue this instructional tool in their personal practice. Over the time frame of the study, they expressed an increased desire to practice more music in various settings, including their home.
Self-Efficacy

T-I instruction helped aspiring performing artists learn a strategy for *strengthening their self-efficacy* for performing newly composed pieces and improvisations. Self-efficacy is defined as the conviction that one can successfully execute the behavior required to produce the outcome (McPherson & McCormick, 2006). Self-efficacious thoughts refer to a person’s beliefs about the extent to which she or he can do a task in a particular situation. Though the aspiring performing artists are competent musicians, they experienced low self-efficacy for performing (1) newly composed pieces written in a non-tradition style, and (2) improvisations over the Blues, an unfamiliar genre for them. Upon receiving T-I instruction, all aspiring performing artists’ self-efficacy was augmented.

Expressivity

T-I instruction helped aspiring performing artists learn to *enhance their musical expressivity* when playing newly composed pieces and improvising the Blues. Each aspiring performing artist arrived at his or her lessons with a different level of musical ability. Qualitative results (i.e., opinions of researcher and three experts) showed that three out of the four aspiring performing artists’ expressivity increased at varying levels by implementing T-I instruction in their practice. According to the experts, the increase of aspiring performing artists’ expressivity was immediately noticeable for the individual learning newly composed pieces, and for both improvisation-learning students. However, the increase of expressivity was more noticeable for improvisation-learning aspiring performing artists.
Enjoyment for Learning

T-I instruction helped aspiring performing artists learn to induce enjoyment for learning newly composed pieces and improvisation. Aspiring performing artists expressed that they had enjoyed developing different aspects of their playing (i.e., phrasing, melodic ideas, and timbre) and assimilated imagery inspired from T-I instruction to influence his thought processes for learning pieces and improvisation.

Technical Facility

T-I instruction helped aspiring performing artists learn how to improve technical facility for playing their instrument. For example, one aspiring performing artist underwent a cognitive translation process where they observed the characteristics of a feather (i.e., light, soft, having a taper at the tip) and translated those characteristics to their technical approach for playing the music. He then adjusted their facial and manual musculatures, breathing, and posture to convey the imagery of the piece with more resemblance.

Cognition for Improvisation

T-I instruction helped improvisation-learning aspiring performing artists’ cognitive processes for developing structurally refined improvisations. T-I instruction improved aspiring performing artists’ organization of melodic ideas while improvising. Furthermore, T-I instruction assisted their in their ability to evoke imagery, and fully understand their cognitive processes to verbally communicate those processes with the instructor.
Modern Music Technology

In the weekly-reflection journals, aspiring performing artists indicated they used modern technology to facilitate their learning and performance of notated and improvisational repertoire, and entrepreneurial endeavors. They expressed modern technology to be an integral resource for the development in becoming aspiring performing artists. The specific modern technology aspiring performing artists utilized included: audio recordings, video footage, Internet, SMART music, play-along tracks, and digital audio workstations (hereinafter, DAW). Aspiring performing artists used these modern technologies to observe their performances from different perspectives such as playing back their performances and seeing the sound waves in relation to DAW’s set tempos and rhythms. Aspiring performing artists also recorded video footage of themselves performing to observe and refine their body language during performance. They utilized DAWs to create play-along tracks to accompany them during their performances. Aspiring performing artists learning newly composed pieces preferred SMART music, as they are able to transfer the notation onto the software and have a MIDI-piano play back their parts to ease the learning process. Lastly, aspiring performing artists used the Internet to view video footage of recorded performances of pieces they are currently learning; they observed how the professional performers employ musical components to produce expressive performances.

Quality of Life

Life Satisfaction

Aspiring performing artists experienced the benefits of T-I instruction during musical and non-musical settings; their life satisfaction was enriched as a result of
receiving T-I instruction. Life satisfaction is one aspect of quality of life, a term that has taken on various definitions in past research. For this study, the term focuses on the overall emotional and social well-being of an individual. The two domains of quality of life that were enriched fall under culture: identity and engagement. (Gregory et al., 2011; Hughes et al., 1995). The enthusiasm students gained from the lessons carried over to their daily lives by positively influencing aspiring performing artists’ psyche, confidence, and relationships with their colleagues.

Multi-Faceted Musicianship

Aspiring performing artists expressed a common pinnacle goal to attain as performing artist—to possess multi-faceted skills including: (1) the ability to perform multiple genres with fluency, (2) the ability to sight-read, read notation, improvisation, compose, lead ensembles, conduct, engineer live and studio performances, produce other artists, promote their work, and teach a wide range of populaces.

Redefining Performing Artist

Before commencing the study, the researcher had a deductive definition for the term performing artist: someone who can think, and communicate their ideas and ‘approaches’ to an audience and one who challenges the status quo in a given area of study. However, after thoroughly analyzing the data and uncovering meta-themes their reasons for pursuing careers as performing artists, the researcher was able to propose a new definition of the term. A performing artist is a musician whose central goals are to communicate and minister to their audiences.
Overall, the influences that spawned from aspiring performing artists receiving T-I instruction were positive; no negative themes emerged in this study. T-I instruction was shown to be an effective pedagogical tool for aspiring performing artists to facilitate their ability to learn newly composed pieces and improvisation that are necessary for their artistic development. T-I instruction was also shown to enrich aspiring performing artists’ quality of life outside of musical contexts. The joy they experienced from the lessons was continuous throughout the day. Furthermore, students became more relational with their colleagues. Now that the first research question has been answered, the researcher will provide the answer for the second research question.

**Question I. b.**

What are aspiring performing artists’ feelings of T-I instruction versus technical instruction when learning during the applied lesson setting? Based on the qualitative results, students had preferential opinions for the two instructions, and indicated benefits for both instructions. The three emerging themes were: (1) preference for improvisation-learning students, (2) variability for instruction, and (3) additional support for T-I instruction.

**Preference for Improvisation-learning Aspiring Performing Artists**

Technical instruction was the preferred method of instruction for the beginning stages of applied lessons, and T-I instruction was more beneficial for the latter stages of applied lessons for improvisation-learning aspiring performing artists. They preferred technical instruction as a technical-refinement tool. They postulated the strength of T-I instruction’s implementation when learning music is its ability to
induce higher levels of expressivity, and to address aspiring performing artists’ comprehension of the music’s aesthetic qualities. Teaching with technical instruction enabled aspiring performing artists to (1) understand the application of scales and arpeggios, and reasons for learning them, and (2) learn to play their instrument with proper technique.

**Variability for Instruction**

The effectiveness and preferences for both instructions varied among aspiring performing artists case-by-case. Each of them expressed that technical instruction is an essential form of instruction needed for gaining foundational understanding for *how* to play music with conviction and expressivity. All aspiring performing artists indicated their preferences for receiving different types of instruction to keep learning engaging and inspiring. By combining technical instruction with imagery or other non-conventional instructions, aspiring performing artists believed that their learning rate would increase, and their artistic development would blossom holistically. Additionally, technical instruction was indicated to be the most common form of instruction aspiring performing artists received in applied lessons. They expressed that too much technical instruction could become cognitively overloading and debilitating to their rate of learning. They also stated they sometimes experience boredom when learning with solely technical instruction, and are drawn to multi-sensory learning experiences. One aspiring performing artist expressed that he prefers technical instruction to help facilitate technical mastery of the pieces.
Additional Support for T-I Instruction

Aspiring performing artists expressed that by growing up in a multi-media prevalent society, they are entrained to experience art forms in a multi-sensory fashion. Hence, they preferred T-I instruction because it encourages students to utilize their sonic, visual, and touch senses during learning. Aspiring performing artists posited that T-I instruction was a better way of addressing two other factors (i.e., historical information of the composer and piece, body language) during applied lessons, and desired for instructors to address these factors more frequently.

Consequently, the results suggest that both instructions have strengths and weaknesses, and preferences for both instructions vary greatly. Instructors should cultivate healthy relationships with their students to better understand their needs, strengths, and weakness much like the way many parents understand their children. In doing so, teachers may develop a firmer understanding of their students’ learning needs and implement appropriate forms of instruction to help students enjoy and learn music at a productive rate. Now that the second research question has been answered, the researcher will discuss three emerging themes beyond instruction and learning that were not a part of the phase-one research questions: (1) technology, (2) multi-facetted musicianship, and (3) redefining performing artist.

Answers to the Phase-Two Research Questions

In this phase, the researcher had five questions; four questions that dealt with T-I instruction’s influence on listeners’ perceived expressivity of aspiring performing artists’ performances, and one question that dealt with information that helps listeners
to perceive music as expressive. The researcher sought to investigate the following questions:

II.a. Does T-I instruction have a statistically significance on influence listeners’ perceived expressivity of aspiring performing artists’ performances of newly composed pieces and improvisations?

II.b. What is the degree of listeners’ perceived expressivity of aspiring performing artists’ reading versus improvised performances influenced by T-I instruction or technical instruction?

II.c. Is there a statistical significant difference of T-I instructions’ influence on the progressive differences in the means of listeners’ perceived expressivity between the aspiring performing artists across the time frame of the study?

II.d. What are listeners’ reasons for their ratings of perceived expressivity?

II.e. What kind of information helps listeners perceive music as expressive?

The Perceived Expressivity Questionnaire (PEQ) was the instrument used to collect the data. The need for the phase-two investigation stemmed from the notion that performing artists’ need to captivate their audiences by producing expressive performances. If the results to the first five questions were statistically significant, the researcher could suggest that T-I instruction not only influences aspiring performing artists’ expressivity, but could also influence listeners’ perceived expressivity of students’ performances. Answers to phase-two research questions are provided below after a discussion on the low internal consistency of listener’s ratings.

**Low Internal Consistency of Listeners’ Ratings**

For phase two, the researcher’s hypotheses were that (1) T-I instruction would have influenced listeners’ perceived expressivity of aspiring performing artists’ performances to be more expressive than performances influenced by technical instruction; (2) T-I instruction would have influenced listeners’ perceived
expressivity of improvisational performances to be more expressive than notated performances, and; (3) progressive differences of perceived expressivity would increase more for aspiring performing artists whose expressivity is considered lower, as determined by the researcher and the three experts. In analyzing the internal consistency of listeners’ perceived expressivity of aspiring performing artists’ performance (24 performances total), results indicated hardly any agreeability within the listeners of aspiring performing artists’ performance. Listeners’ rating of perceived expressivity of performances ranged from a score of 1 = minimal expressivity to 7 = maximum expressivity. Due to the unacceptable internal consistency of listeners’ perceived expressivity ($\alpha = .02$), the researcher could not proceed with further statistical analyses to answer the research questions. Listeners’ brief essay responses to the questions, “What kinds of information help you to perceive music as expressive?” did give light to possible explanations for the inconsistency of listeners’ perceived expressivity.

In general, the stimuli that listeners’ rated were audio recordings that lacked the various kinds of information that helps them perceive music as expressive, with the exception of wide contrast of musical components. The stimuli did not give any indication of aspiring performing artists’ identity and body language, nor references about the composer and composition. Since the stimuli captured a brief moment of aspiring performing artists’ lessons, listeners were not able to observe neither the aspiring performing artists’ initial level of expressivity nor their progress over the time frame of the study. Listeners were unaware of the imagery examples that were discussed in the applied lessons to influence aspiring performing artists’
performances, and thus, could not have understood the intended approach of the performance. For example, one of Greg’s improvisational performances is his intention to project a feeling of anger and rage. Greg purposefully altered his tone and technique to sound unrefined, really loud, and busy. It is possible that some listeners may have perceived his performance to be unfitting to the play-along track, and thus, provided a low rating. Furthermore, listeners were unfamiliar with the newly composed pieces and the play-along tracks that accompanied aspiring performing artists’ improvisations. Lastly, listeners were unaware of the composer and the significance of the compositions.

In a pilot study, the researcher provided contextual information for the performances to the listeners. The stimuli also included performances with different instrumentation. These conditions could have been one reason why the internal consistency of perceived expressivity was strong for the pilot study and weak for this study. In this study, one instrument was utilized (i.e., the flute) and contextual information was omitted in the stimuli to account for extraneous variables that could influence bias ratings of perceived musical expressivity (i.e., knowledge of the performer, composition, or composer; preference for particular instruments). In an attempt to control these extraneous variables to minimize bias responses, it became apparent that controlling too many variables might have countered listeners’ internal consistency of perceived expressivity. Listeners may have experienced sonic fatigue from listening to 24 reading and improvised flute performances using the two newly composed pieces, and two play-along tracks. It is possible the stimuli’s conditions were not the most productive way for measuring their perceived expressivity of
performances. Perceived expressivity is a highly subjective variable that is influenced and cultivated by other variables. Listeners only rated aspiring performing artists’ sight-reading and final performances of each lesson. Controlling for too many variables may have been the cause for the unacceptable internal consistency score. Future research and modified instruments are needed to effectively collect data on listeners’ perceived expressivity of music performances. The explanations account for the first four research questions for phase two of the study.

**Research Question II. a.**

*Does T-I instruction have a statistically significance on influence listeners’ perceived expressivity of aspiring performing artists performances of newly composed pieces and improvisations?* T-I instruction was unsuccessful in influencing listeners’ perceive expressivity of aspiring performing artists’ performances of newly composed pieces and improvisations. No statistical test could be computed on the degree of perceived expressivity for both types of performances due to low internal consistency of the listener’s responses.

**Research Question II. b.**

*What is the degree of listeners’ perceived expressivity of aspiring performing artists’ reading versus improvised performances influenced by T-I instruction or technical instruction?* Due to the unacceptable internal consistency of listeners’ responses, T-I instruction was unsuccessful in influencing listeners’ perceived difference in expressivity for reading versus improvised performances. No statistical test could be computed on the degree of listeners’ perceived expressivity when listening to both types of performances.
Research Question II. c.

Is there a statistical significant difference of T-I instructions’ influence on the progressive differences in the means of listeners’ perceived expressivity between the aspiring performing artists across the time frame of the study? T-I instruction was unsuccessful in influencing listeners’ perceived differences of expressivity for each student across the time frame of the study. No statistical test was computed.

Research Question II. d.

What are listeners’ reasons for their ratings of perceived expressivity?

Explanations for listeners’ ratings of perceived expressivity mainly consisted of mixed opinions regarding the students’ utilization of 11 musical components—dynamic contrast, rhythm, vibrato, tone quality, articulation, intonation, weight, phrasing, use of space, confidence, and time feel.

Research Question II. e.

What kind of information helps listeners perceive music as expressive?

Listeners perceive music as expressive if:

- They are provided with imagery descriptions for the music
- Musicians perform with a wide contrast of musical components
- They understanding significances of the piece, composer, its history, and its theoretical components
- They are familiar with the piece, composer, performer, and style of music
- The music contains their instrumentation preferences
- They are familiar with the musical genre
- The performer has exuberant stage presence

Imagery is a phenomenon that has been discussed historically, philosophically, theoretically, and has been researched substantially in different fields (i.e., sports, martial arts, dance, theater, health sciences, neuroscience, psychology,
and so forth). However, imagery is a relatively fresh topic within the field of music education research (Woody, 2006). In Chapter two, *Literature Review*, the researcher discussed similarities between types of imagery implemented in non-music fields and music education for attaining perceptive and productive results. A common understanding within the fields of research is that imagery is utilized to positively enhance human perception and production, and to enrich learning experiences. Due to some studies lack of providing an operational definition of imagery, and since the phenomenon is an abstract concept manifesting in multiple forms for various uses; imagery has been an obscure topic for understanding its application for music performers and educators, and has been a scarcely visited topic within music education research. The scarcity of imagery-based research in music education inspired the researcher to further investigate its uses and gains for aspiring performing artists and educators. This study attempted to investigate imagery’s influence on aspiring performing artists’ acquisition of learning newly composed pieces or improvisation, aspiring performing artists’ musical expressivity, and listeners’ perceived expressivity of aspiring performing artists’ performances. The results confirm many gains from the study—gains that had not been discovered yet in music education research.

**Gains From The Study**

There are many gains for incorporating T-I instruction during music lessons, personal practice sessions, and performances. The researcher will discuss six gains from conducting this study as it relates to T-I instruction’s influence on aspiring performing artists’ acquisition of learning newly composed pieces or improvisation.
This study has offered deeper understanding of how T-I instruction (1) induces benefits in learning; (2) enriches quality of life; (3) strengthens improvisational skills; (4) improves cognitive skills, and; (5) improves performances of newly composed pieces. (6) This study also informs readers of the complexity and subjectivity of perceived expressivity.

**Induces Benefits in Learning**

One significant gain for music education research that was discovered through this study is a deeper understanding for how T-I instruction can be a positive inducer for learning, and enricher of students’ quality of life. T-I instruction can induce many benefits for aspiring performing artists who are learning in applied lesson settings—it can help them to: (1) develop emotional connection with the music; (2) gain a frame of reference for learning their music; (3) facilitate non-threatening environments for learning; (4) increase their intrinsic motivation for personal practice; (5) raise their self-efficacy for learning and performing newly composed pieces and Blues improvisation; (6) increase their musical expressivity over time; (7) refine their technical facility for performing in a short time frame; (8) improve their cognitive processes for improvisation; (9) experience enjoyment for learning; (10) witness musical growth during their personal practice with the synchrony of modern music technology; (11) enrich their life satisfaction outside of their musical endeavors; (12) reach their aspirations of becoming multi-faceted musicians; and (13) understand purposes for becoming performing artists. In comparing these findings to other research, this study confirmed Woody’s (2006) findings of improved expressivity and White’s (2011) findings of improved cognition for improvisation and refined
technical facility, and brought to light 10 themes that haven’t been discovered in studies pertaining to imagery’s effects on teaching, learning, performance, and quality of life.

**Enriches Quality of Life**

Quality of Life was one of the inductive themes from phase-one of the study. To the researcher’s knowledge, there has never been a study that discussed imagery’s influence on aspiring performing artists’ quality of life. Particularly, the study uncovers one domain within quality of life that were enriched through T-I instruction, culture; two sub-domains that were positively affected were aspiring performing artists’ identity and engagement. The utilization of T-I instruction had a causal effect on aspiring performing artists’ quality of life becoming enriched. The processes started with aspiring performing artists enjoyed receiving T-I instruction more than technical instruction, which lead to an increase of self-efficacy for performance, then an increase in self-esteem, which influenced non-music variables (i.e., communication and relationships with colleagues, continuous positive attitude, optimistic view of life, renewed passion for their musical endeavors). It is likely that this study offers the first discussion of imagery-based instruction’s enrichment of aspiring performing artists’ quality of life.

**Strengthens Improvisation Skills**

The literature sparsely addresses the function of imagery for learning improvisation. In White’s (2012) dissertation, he qualitatively analyzed the imagery-based processes of three prominent jazz trumpeters during improvisation and their personal development, content and musical intent that transpired from their use of
imagery. However, White’s subjects comprised of internationally respected performing artists known for their abilities to improvise with a high level of expressivity, clear technical authority, and intellectual prowess. In this study, the researcher dealt with two subjects who are aspiring performing artist (i.e., flutists) and who were new to improvising over the Blues to see if any benefit can arise from receiving T-I instruction.

The first gain was a broader understanding of T-I instruction to be an effective assister in helping aspiring performing artists’ produce expressive improvisations that are stylistically appropriate regardless of familiarity with the genre, and compositional in its development. Second, T-I instruction can help aspiring performing artists develop musical intent for their improvisations by utilizing imagery to evoke the solo’s representation or representation. Eventually, each improvisation produced by the two aspiring performing artists was characteristically inimitable in comparison to one another. This is valuable considering that one of the goals, yet struggles, for amateur improvisers is finding a strategy for developing improvisations over the same tunes that are different with each attempt. One of the greatest gains is the knowledge of aspiring performing artists being able to become better improvisers of the Blues in a relatively short amount of time (four weeks) with T-I instruction’s influence. Since the aspiring performing artists entered with established technical facility on their instrument, T-I instruction showed to be successful in expediting their growth as expressive improvisers.
Improve Cognitive Skills

Another gain from the study is a better understanding of the relationship imagery has with musicians’ cognition when performing newly composed pieces and improvisation. Teaching with T-I instruction can help aspiring performing artists make cognitive connections when processing technical and conceptual information. Learning with T-I instruction made it easier for aspiring performing artists to play expressively during reading and improvised performances. Instead of over-analyzing technical and theoretical information, aspiring performing artists cognitively translated the characteristics of the image (i.e., iconic or indexical images) to (1) fortify their technique, (2) improvise more appropriately to the genre, (3) formulate clear, sequential improvisations from a single motivic idea, and (3) perform newly composed pieces and improvisations with musical intent.

Improves Performances of Newly Composed Pieces

To the author’s knowledge, there are no studies that observe aspiring performing artists’ use of imagery to help increase their expressivity when performing newly composed pieces. Woody’s (2006) study did utilize stimuli of short originally composed excerpts that were several measures in length, however, complete pieces were needed to better analyze T-I instruction’s influence on students’ expressivity when performing newly composed pieces. One of the gains from this study is a better understanding of T-I instruction’s role for aspiring performing artists’ learning and performing newly composed pieces: (1) it helped provide aspiring performing artists with musical and directional context of pieces, (2) it helped aspiring performing artists develop an emotional connection with the piece, (3) it
helped aspiring performing artists’ focus during performance not waver as much, and
(4) it helped most of the aspiring performing artists’ perform more expressively. This
gain can be valuable for teachers who introduce newly composed pieces to their
students or students who volunteer to perform their colleagues’ new works. They may
experience these benefits by implementing T-I instruction during applied lessons and
practice sessions.

Perceived Expressivity

Expressivity has been a subject of interest in the field of music education
research for quite some time. As more studies on perceived musical expressivity are
conducted, scholars realize how subjective listeners’ perceptions of expressivity are
due to extraneous variables (e.g., acculturation, musical genre preferences, domestic
upbringing, instrumental preferences, information provided for the music, familiarity,
and so forth). There are several discoveries from this study that contribute to music
education research’s conversation of perceived musical expressivity. For example,
this study answers two over-arching questions that have not been addressed within the
literature: (1) How does imagery-based instruction affect aspiring performing artists’
expressivity when performing newly composed pieces or improvisation? (2) Can the
instruction vicariously influence listeners’ perceived expressivity? Though phase-one
of the study indicated an increase in aspiring performing artists’ musical expressivity
as indicated by experts’ observations, phase two suggested that listeners’ weren’t able
to perceive differences in aspiring performing artists’ musical expressivity while
listening to their performances. Surprisingly, this study showed that the type of
performance or the influence of two types of instruction on aspiring performing
artists’ performances had no significant influence on listeners’ perceived expressivity. In this study, listeners’ explanations for the ratings and brief essay responses did provide insight to variables that influenced their ratings. Appropriated usage of musical components was the prevailing theme from listeners’ explanations. The themes from the brief essay responses (i.e., imagery, musical significance, familiarity, and stage presence) were not present within listeners’ stimuli, and thus, may have contributed to the diverse perceptions of students’ musical expressivity. Perhaps if those themes were present within the stimuli, listeners’ ratings of expressivity would have been significantly different. Hence, perceived expressivity is a far more complex subject that requires more inquisitive thought and innovative strategies for measuring it in future research.

Overall, the methods for conducting this research has provided further understanding of T-I instructions’ application and influences as it relates to performing artists and applied lesson teachers. Considering that imagery is widely implemented by many professional musicians on a regular basis, it is no surprise that these six gains surfaced from the study. In conducting this study, a greater understanding of imagery’s role as a beneficial tool for improving instruction, learning, performance, and quality of life has been obtained for the field of music education research. Now that the gains from the study have been discussed, the researcher will provide implications for performers and for educators.

**Implications For Performers & Music Educators**

In many fields including music education, imagery has shown to be an effective pedagogical tool for performers’ learning, perception, production, and
performance. There are many forms of imagery discussed in the literature review, and each type of imagery can serve a specific purpose, whether it be to enhance cognition, technical facility, remediate people’s physical or emotional conditions, and so forth. Since the researcher was interested in observing how the utilization of imagery and technical instruction could affect performers’ learning newly composed pieces, improvisation, and musical expressivity, he chose to synchronize the two forms of instruction into one instruction called T-I instruction. The researcher speculated aspiring performing artists would reap greater rewards learning with T-I instruction as opposed to solely technical instruction or imagery-based instruction. Additionally, aspiring performing artists dealt with learning one of two forms of musical mediums—newly composed pieces and improvisation. Hence, the researcher offered implications to performers and music educators based on the study’s results as it relates to the study’s subjects and variables.

**Implications from Phase-One Findings**

T-I instruction was shown to help performers develop emotional connections with music they are learning. The value of this finding suggests that by developing emotional connections or passion for the music, performers may choose to practice the pieces with diligence, and perform music with a higher level of expressivity. The value of this finding also suggests that by utilizing T-I instruction to develop emotional connections with their improvisations may allow performers to execute music with more fluidity and expressivity, and allow for their improvisations to sound organic as opposed to non-mechanical.
T-I instruction was shown to help provide performers with a frame of reference for learning music. This finding is valuable for students who wish to learn newly composed pieces and improvisation (often in a short time frame) with contextual information—historical, theoretical, aesthetic, inspiration, and so forth. In doing so, performers could develop and music educators could provide more structure, establish goals for practice sessions, and expedite the learning process. This finding is also valuable for aspiring performing artists who wish to approach their learning of new pieces and improvisation with more referential information in addition to technical and theoretical aspects.

T-I instruction was shown to facilitate a non-threatening learning environment for aspiring performing artists learning in an applied lesson setting. This finding is valuable for aspiring performing artists who wish to calm nerves when learning and performing music. Often, aspiring performing artists face an enormous amount of pressures and responsibilities, which can cause them to feel nervous and unprepared upon arriving to their applied lesson. Music educators could consider implementing humorous analogies or descriptors associated with the music to alleviate stress that aspiring performing artists may display.

T-I instruction was shown to enhance intrinsic motivation for personal practice. This finding is valuable for aspiring performing artists who have lost a desire to practice or may experience difficulty in exercising effective practice. T-I instruction can be implemented as a cognitive tool to help make personal practice more enjoyable and productive, and thus, propel aspiring performing artists to become more acclimated to routinely practice. The long-term benefit is that aspiring
performing artists can develop consistency as they improve their musicianship over time.

T-I instruction was shown to enhance students’ self-efficacy and musical expressivity. Music educators should try teaching music with icons and indexes that relate to musical passages so that aspiring performing artists can perform more confidently and expressively in musical situations that may be different from what they are accustom to performing. The finding is valuable for aspiring performing artists who are seeking ways to learn how practice and perform newly composed pieces, or how to improvise within an unfamiliar style of music with more expressivity. It is common for professional performers having to learn unfamiliar repertoire or musical styles. It is important in these days for performers to quickly be adaptive and expressive regardless of what the performance opportunity entails. Hence, T-I instruction can be effective for enhancing musical expressivity for performers learning unfamiliar music in a short time frame. Performers’ self-efficacy may increase upon utilizing T-I instruction if they are visual-oriented learners by analogizing compositions or improvisations with thematic content, scenery, and episodic memory.

T-I instruction was shown to foster enjoyment for learning. This finding is valuable for teachers who wish to make the applied lesson experience and music more enjoyable for aspiring performing artists. It is common for music educators to get stuck teaching predominantly from a technical standpoint, which can disencourage aspiring performing artists to learn and practice, especially if the technical instruction does not compliment their learning preference. Moreover,
participating in ensembles or musical competitions have become such competitive activities, that aspiring performing artists may at times lose sight of their initial reasons for participating in ensembles. Many aspiring performing artists may not desire to learning and perform music for competition, rather, may desire to participate in musical activities for the sake of enjoyment; engaging in musical activities makes them feel happy and complete. Hence, music educators should consider implementing T-I instruction as a way of making their students’ learning experiences enjoyable. Performers may also experience enjoyment from implementing T-I instruction during personal practice and performance.

T-I instruction was shown to improve technical facility. This finding is valuable for aspiring performing artists who wish to refine their technique through exercising creative thinking strategies. For example, music educators could apply imagery descriptors to induce cognitive translations processes—translating the properties of a non-musical item to the characteristics of a musical item. If a music educator provides too many suggestions for playing a single excerpt, aspiring performing artists may experience cognitive overload, and thus, fail to perform with technical precision. However, if a music educator can provide an imagery example that characterizes the essence for how the excerpt should be played, aspiring performing artists could concentrate on emulating the description, and allow the image to sub-consciously influence their musculature and dexterity. Implementing T-I instruction may also be a valuable way of teaching proper technique to aspiring performing artists who prefer learning with conceptual jargon.
T-I instruction was shown to improve cognitive skills for improvisation. This finding is valuable for performers who wish to improvise with more musical structure, and to clearly communicate their transpired thoughts for improvisation with other musicians. As discussed in Whites’ (2011) study, music educators could consider describing to students improvisational exercises that are imagery-based. For example, a music educator could request students to imagine mental architectural structures or colors in their minds to establish a relative structure for which their improvisations will built upon. Many acclaimed musical improvisers have testified that as artists they view role of theoretical information as to become an instinctual part of their playing, not making it the focus of their cognizance during improvisation. These acclaimed improvisers prefer to focus on aesthetic qualities of their music and employ assorted forms of imagery as inspiration to produce novel improvisations. These testimonies suggest that imagery can be utilized as a tool performers use to become creative thinkers during improvisation and aesthetic-focused performers.

Modern music technology was shown to be integral tools improving aspiring performing artists’ learning and performances. The findings are valuable for teachers who wish to explore the incorporation of different modern technology in applied lessons such as SMART music, Internet, digital audio workstations, video footage, audio recordings, and play-along tracks. Teachers may consider utilizing modern technology to facilitate more student autonomy since many of them are already familiar with these technologies and can complete assignments single handedly. The findings also suggests that modern technology can be used to help aspiring
performing artists become more creative and expressive musicians through audio recording software to review their performances and make necessary adjustments for future performance. Modern technology is beneficial as long as the music takes precedence over the technology.

T-I instruction was shown to enrich aspiring performing artists’ life satisfaction. This value of this finding is that teachers can implement an instructional tool that is capable of enriching aspiring performing artists’ lives beyond the applied lesson experience. It is subsumed that applied lesson teachers are endowed with the unique privilege to inspire, influence, and cultivate students’ lives. Their pedagogical style can effect both their musical development and well-being positively or negatively. Within quality of life, identity and engagement were the two sub themes that were enriched. This study showed us that T-I instruction could boost aspiring performing artists’ livelihood, relationship dynamics, emotionality, and revive musical passions. This finding could be meaningful for amateur and professional performing artists who have lost sight of their purpose for pursuing their vocation, and neglected human relationship due to the inconsistent itinerates that come with the being an artist. Though there are many variables that determine performing artists’ career outcome, perhaps the implementation of imagery in their daily life and musical career can help enrich performing artists’ life satisfaction.

One of the central goals for the aspiring performing artists was to become multi-facetted musicians. This finding may function as the impetus for learning and practicing. This goal can give insight to music educators for how to construct their syllabi to address these factors during applied lesson, ultimately, to assist students in
becoming multi-faceted performing artists. In embracing multi-faceted musicianship as a long-term goal, music educators could instill aspirations in aspiring performing artists who need direction, and prepare them for an eclectic world of musical opportunities.

After analyzing students’ statements, a new definition of *performing artist* was suggested by the researcher—a musician whose central goals are to communicate, minister to their audiences, and have a good quality of life. This significance of this inductive finding is valuable for teachers who wish to develop concrete understanding for the role of performing artists in today’s musical society. Aspiring performing artists could embrace this definition as a philosophy to influence decisions that will affect their learning and performing (e.g., selection of repertoire, cognitive approaches to learning, and so forth).

Finally, T-I instruction was shown to be preferred for specific situations during the learning stages of improvisation. Preferences for T-I instruction or technical instruction vary greatly depending on aspiring performing artists’ learning style, level of ability, interest, rate of acquisition when learning newly composed pieces or improvisation, mood, and so forth. Music educators should gain a better understanding for both forms of instruction’s benefits, and balance the two types of instructions in a productive way to foster aspiring performing artists’ acquisition for learning newly composed pieces and improvisation. Aspiring performing artists may learn better if the music educator diligently observes their needs, strengths, and weaknesses, in which they can employ the most suitable form of instruction to enrich aspiring performing artists learning experiences. Both instructions serve different
purposes and are suited best for aspiring performing artists’ learning in case-by-case scenarios.

**Implications from Phase-Two Findings**

Furthermore, the brief essay responses provided a greater insight to seven kinds of information that help listeners perceive music as more expressive: (1) imagery descriptions for the music; (2) wide contrast of musical components; (3) understanding significances of the piece, composer, its history, and its theoretical components; (4) familiarity with the piece, composer, performer, and style of music; (5) instrumentation preferences; (6) familiarity with the musical genre, and; (7) exuberant stage presence. Performers should not withhold these kinds of information from their listeners to increase the possibility of listeners’ perceived expressivity of their performances. It is common of Western art or jazz music performers to simply state the name of the piece and author, and perform the piece without providing additional information to the listeners. It is also very common for music students performing notated compositions to glare at the music stand without any display of exuberant stage presence. Performers would benefit learning how to present these kinds of information in their delivery before, during, and after their performances. Music educators should teach aspiring performing artists how to communicate these kinds of information in a tasteful way that keeps listeners engaged. In doing so, music educations will facilitate aspiring performing artists’ aspirations of becoming professional performing artists and increase their marketability as dynamic performers. Concordantly, educators and performers should take in consideration (1)
their listeners’ demographics and background, and (2) the kinds of information that help listeners’ perceive music as expressive.

As addressed in chapter one and two, Wellington (2008) proposed that musicians should practice their music visually, sonically, technically, and historically. The results of this study suggest that aspiring performing artists should focus their energy to learning, practicing, and performing music much like the way listeners’ experience music. The outcome may produce promising outcomes for aspiring performing artists to become more expressive in their playing, and assist them in attaining an effective career as a performing artist.

Now that implications for performers and music educators are supplemented, the researcher will provide the transferability of the study, limitations of the study, suggest future research, a personal reflection from conducting the study, and concluding thoughts.

**Transferability of the Study**

The narrative of the study and gains from teaching with T-I instruction are very transferable for applied lesson teachers. The musical terms, imagery, language, and teaching strategies can be adapted to teaching most instrumentalists. There is a moderate level of transferability for music educators as a whole. Though the context may not be similar (e.g. applied lesson versus large ensemble setting), the nature of humans, expressive qualities, social interaction, and teaching humans how to study are common when teaching and learning music.
Limitations

In conducting this study, the researcher has observed several limitations. First, the stimuli used for listeners’ to rate their perceived expressivity did not vary in instrumentation; only flutists were used. This was to control for bias ratings based on listeners’ instrumental preferences. Second, only two styles of music were used for the applied lessons; newly composed pieces were written in a Western art music tradition and improvisations were based of the Blues progression. The researcher chose to teach with these two art forms to minimize the potential struggles that often come with learning newer repertoire, especially if the repertoire are complex and purposefully challenging. Third, the allotted time the researcher had to for each student was four weeks; one lesson per week. This was the agreed amount of time that aspiring performing artists were willing to offer due to their availability. Consequently, the average time of each applied lesson was 20 minutes. Since newly composed pieces only approximately a minute in length, which may be short in comparison to standard newly composed pieces, the allotted time of the applied lessons was sufficient in teaching aspiring performing artists one musical piece per lesson. The newly composed pieces were purposefully composed to last approximately one minute for consideration of listeners’ time to rate all 24 recordings of aspiring performing artists’ performances, which accumulated to a total of 29 minutes. Finally, the instructor had an extroverted personality that influenced positive outcomes from the study. It is possible that the emergent themes uncovered in this study could have manifested differently if the instructor had an introverted personality.
Future Research

The researcher had questions regarding: (1) the influence of imagery on aspiring performing artists who are learning music; (2) the gains that would manifest as they are exposed to a different form of instruction than they commonly experience, and; (3) whether listeners could perceive differences in expressivity when listening to two types of performances (i.e., newly composed piece and improvisations) influenced by two forms of instructions. Many findings that manifested from the study either confirmed the researcher’s hypotheses or were inductive. The power of utilizing imagery to positively influence a person’s perception and production is truly a phenomenon that requires more research to gain a better understanding of its potential and limitations. Though this study has answered the researcher’s questions, other questions arose during the study that requires further investigation to better apprehend imagery’s application in music education. The researcher will provide eight suggestions for future research.

Several modifications of dependent variables for researchers wishing to replicate the study are suggested. First, researchers could examine the influence of T-I instruction on aspiring performing artists’ acquisition when learning other musical genres. In this study, only two genres were utilized—Western art music and the Blues. The researcher was able to compare and contrast the impact T-I instruction had on learning the two genres. Scholars could explore researching T-I instruction’s impact when learning other genres to gain a more holistic understanding of its capabilities. If the benefits gained from T-I instruction also apply to aspiring performing artists’ learning other genres, then the instruction can be seen as all-
inclusive way of imparting information to aspiring performing artists’ learning.

Second, the influence of T-I instructions on aspiring performing artists’ acquisition when learning other musical mediums of expression such as composition, singing, audio engineering, musical production, and teaching could be investigated. Though much of the literature deals with imagery’s ability to improve people’s performances in various fields, imagery may also be highly influential in improving other executive functions and skill sets.

Third, scholars could compare phase-two of the study’s results to listeners’ perceived expressivity of performances when listening to stimuli accompanied with one or several of the kinds of information that help them to perceive music as expressive (i.e. imagery, theoretical information, background information of the composer or piece). The research speculates that listeners’ perceived expressivity was not internally consistent due to the lack of any contextual information listeners received when listening to performances. Perhaps if the stimuli were more ecologically valid, listeners’ may provide ratings that show statistical significance.

Fourth, researchers could study if and how student are able to formulate improvisations inspired by spontaneously provided imagery examples. In many instances, an ensemble leader or a film scorer may ask musicians to perform improvisations portraying suggested imagery examples as opposed to performing notated music. This is a skill set that could benefit aspiring performing artists. If T-I instruction is shown to bolster students’ skills in translating imagery into performance, than the instruction could be seen as a benefactor for artistic development. Though this task is not commonly done in a concert setting, it would be
interesting to compare the differences in audience’s perceived expressivity or preferences of aspiring performing artists’ improvisation before and after receiving T-I instruction.

Fifth, researchers could replicate this study utilizing music students with (1) different levels of educational training (i.e., elementary, middle school, high school, and undergrad) or (2) different academic pursuits—music education, vocal performance, jazz performance, music therapy, and so forth. The sample for phase-one of the study consisted of graduate students pursuing a Master’s degree in music performance. It would be interesting to uncover themes that spawn from students with different levels educational training or academic pursuit to see if T-I instruction is domain specific or ameliorative across vast circumstances.

Sixth, another interesting topic to research would be to study listeners’ perceived expressivity of performances on different instrumentation influenced by T-I instruction. Since this study only utilized flutists, it is possible that listeners’ experienced sonic fatigue and influenced their ratings. Researching differences in perceived expressivity of flute student performances versus piano student performances after receiving T-I instruction, for example, could inform researchers whether there is significant variability of listeners’ perceived expressivity. This topic would benefit scholars in informing them whether or not timbre significantly affects the outcome of perceived expressivity while listening to T-I instruction-influenced performances.

Seventh, researchers could replicate this study to observe expressive performance outcome of ensembles during rehearsals as opposed to solo performance
outcomes in applied lessons. Qualitative researchers could describe in great detail the uniformity and agreeability of interpreting T-I instruction examples, and see if the provided imagery influences the production of expressive performances. Causal comparative studies could compare listeners’ perceived expressivity of ensemble versus solo performances influenced by T-I instructions to understand if the instruction equivocally improves expressivity of two types of performances.

Finally, researchers could replicate phase two of this study using a non-music-oriented audience as listeners (i.e., those who have never played an instrument or sing a group) to rate their perceived expressivity of performances.

The exploration of this topic is by no means complete. There are many opportunities for researchers to obtain a deeper understanding of T-I instruction’s strengths and weakness. An over-arching suggestion for further research is to consider having more homogeneity within the participants to minimize variances caused by diversification. Now that eight suggestions for future research have been stipulated, the researcher will provide his personal reflection from conducting the study.

**Personal Reflection**

After concluding this dissertation process, which I considered a transformational process, I humbly confer that I am not the same person who entered into the Ph.D. in Music Education program. Initially, I had certain reservations of expatiated outcomes when teaching students pursuing a performance career; mainly, that the purpose for teaching students was to improve their expressivity to a level that was “satisfactory” to professional performance standards. It was my initial belief that
if a music educator could facilitate students in their ability to consistently produce expressive performances, they could become more marketable upon graduation and be prepared for a professional career in performance. Though that belief can assist aspiring performing artists’ artistic development, other variables are needed for aspiring performing artists becoming marketable and prepared for a professional performance career; these variables were brought to light through conducting the study: their dedication to their craft, quality of life, musical aptitude, self-efficacy regardless of their musical abilities, personalities, and so forth. These variables also contribute to the rate in which aspiring performing artists develop their artistry. Hence, I no longer postulate my initial reservation.

Contrarily, I believe this study has expanded my understanding of the power a music educator possesses, and my horizons for what music educators should desire when teaching students. It is my belief that for educators to have an impact on students’ lives through music education, educators must (1) be cognizant of students’ needs; (2) have immense compassion and patience; (3) celebrate progresses regardless of how large or small, and (4) understand that some of the greatest rewards may emerge during students’ learning stages, not necessarily the final performance. Finally, it has been made apparent to me that though I have become well informed of imagery’s influences in music education, I am also aware of my ignorance of the subject. Yes, I have learned a lot about imagery’s power in musical contexts, however, there is so much more to learn. I’ve learned that this subject is far more phenomenological in nature than I originally understood. Imagination is one of the greatest tools humans have and can influence varying outcomes depending on the
context. Hence, I look forward to continue my research on this fascinating topic, ultimately, to (1) provide performers with strategies to improve their musicianship and expressivity, and foster their artistic development; (2) provide music educators with pedagogical suggestions for enriching students’ learning experiences, and; (3) to provide scholars with newfangled information for the function of imagery in varying musical contexts.

Imagery is a powerful communicative tool that has been utilized for millennia to express humanity’s deepest desires, ideas, and emotions. It is a subject that is both transparent in its ability to improve human perception and performance, and yet, mysterious in its unpredictable influence on people’s expressions and perceptions that are dependent on the context and medium in which people employ to express themselves. This study has testified to the benefits of imagery, in conjunction with technical instruction, for teaching aspiring performing artists strategies to remediate obstacles that impinge their learning, to enhance their musical expressivity, and to enrich their quality of life. Imagination is the root for which expression, creativity, and innovation spawn from. Let us never negate the power of imagery in educational contexts, for cultivating students’ ability to engage the imagination can liberate them to becoming expressive communicators of thought, especially through music.
REFERENCES


212


*Linking practice and theory: The pedagogy of realistic teacher education.*

Routledge.


APPENDICES

Appendix A: Perceived Expressivity Questionnaire

Please listen to each audio recording of musical performances carefully. There are 24 short performances. Rate the degree of expressivity for each performance. At the end of each musical example, briefly explain the reasons for your ratings. Have fun!

The Likert Scale Rating is the following

![Likert Scale Rating]

#1) 1 2 3 4 5 6 7

Please explain why you rated the way you did.
#2) 1 2 3 4 5 6 7

Please explain why you rated the way you did.

____________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________

#3) 1 2 3 4 5 6 7

Please explain why you rated the way you did.

____________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________

#4) 1 2 3 4 5 6 7

Please explain why you rated the way you did.

____________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________
#5) 1 2 3 4 5 6 7

Please explain why you rated the way you did.

____________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________

#6) 1 2 3 4 5 6 7

Please explain why you rated the way you did.

____________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________

#7) 1 2 3 4 5 6 7

Please explain why you rated the way you did.

____________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________
Please explain why you rated the way you did.

____________________________________________________________________

____________________________________________________________________

#1)

Please explain why you rated the way you did.

____________________________________________________________________

____________________________________________________________________

#9)

Please explain why you rated the way you did.

____________________________________________________________________

____________________________________________________________________
Please explain why you rated the way you did.
____________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________

#11) 1 2 3 4 5 6 7
Please explain why you rated the way you did.
____________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________

#12) 1 2 3 4 5 6 7
Please explain why you rated the way you did.
____________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________
#13) 1 2 3 4 5 6 7

Please explain why you rated the way you did.

____________________________________________________________________

____________________________________________________________________

#14) 1 2 3 4 5 6 7

Please explain why you rated the way you did.

____________________________________________________________________

____________________________________________________________________

#15) 1 2 3 4 5 6 7

Please explain why you rated the way you did.

____________________________________________________________________

____________________________________________________________________
#16) 1 2 3 4 5 6 7

Please explain why you rated the way you did.

____________________________________________________________________

____________________________________________________________________

#17) 1 2 3 4 5 6 7

Please explain why you rated the way you did.

____________________________________________________________________

____________________________________________________________________

#18) 1 2 3 4 5 6 7

Please explain why you rated the way you did.

____________________________________________________________________

____________________________________________________________________
#19) 1 2 3 4 5 6 7

Please explain why you rated the way you did.
____________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________

#20) 1 2 3 4 5 6 7

Please explain why you rated the way you did.
____________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________

#21) 1 2 3 4 5 6 7

Please explain why you rated the way you did.
____________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________
#22)  

Please explain why you rated the way you did.

____________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________

#23)  

Please explain why you rated the way you did.

____________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________

#24)  

Please explain why you rated the way you did.

____________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________
Brief Essay Response

What kind of information helps you to perceive music as expressive?

Background Information

Age ______________

Gender Female Male

What is your primary instrument? ________________

What is your ethnicity?

Do you have any known hearing impairment? YES NO
Appendix B: Post-Lesson Reflection Journal

Thank you for participating in this study. In your own words, please answer the questions below. Take your time and enjoy!

Name: ______________________
Date: ______________

1) How did you feel today during the lesson?

2) Was there anything you enjoyed learning during the lesson? If so, what?

3) Was there anything you did not enjoy learning during the lesson? If so, what?

4) Please describe your favorite part of the lesson.

5) In what ways did the instruction help you?
6) How did you feel about the piece you were learning?

7) Was there any information from the lesson that you would apply to personal practice?

8) What information helps you perceive music as expressive?

9) Do you plan to apply anything from the lesson to other pieces after this study? How?

10) What strategies do you use to keep yourself engaged in practice and in performance?
Appendix C: Student Weekly Reflection Journal

Name: _________________________

Date: __________

Thank you for participating in this study. In your own words, please answer the questions below. Take your time and enjoy!

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

1) How long did you practice?

2) Can you please describe the setting where you practiced?

3) Did you implement any information acquired from the lessons? If so, what and how?

4) Reflect on what you did or thought about to help you play more expressively?
Appendix D: Bi-Weekly Interview Questions for Aspiring Performing Artists

Interview type: Semi-Structured
Data Collection: Video & Audio Recording

• What did you enjoy most about these lessons?

• Was there any information provided during the lessons that helped you play more expressively? Understand the music better?

• Can you describe anything that was helpful for your musical comprehension during your practice sessions?

• Was there anything the instructor did or said that helped you musically, non-musically?

• Can you describe anything that did not help play the music more expressively? Did not help you get engaged with the music? If so, please explain.

• Is there anything else you would like to add?
Appendix E: Pre-Lesson Questionnaire for Aspiring Performing Artists

Thank you for participating in this study! Please take a moment and answer the questions in detail. Upon arrival to your first applied lesson, please hand the pre-lesson questionnaire to the instruction. Take your and enjoy!

• What instrument do you play?

• What strategies do you do to help you practice better?

• What strategies do you do to help you perform better?

• Why do you love music?

• When you listen to your favorite music, what do you think about?

• What is one of your favorite pieces of music?
• Why do you want to be a musician?

• What information helps you perceive music as expressive?

• How do you learn music best?

• What strategies do you use to keep yourself engaged in practice?
Appendix F: IRB Expedited Approval for Initial Review

Jose Ruiz School of Music Tampa, FL 33612

RE: Expedited Approval for Initial Review

IRB#: Pro00015353

Title: The Effects of Mental Imagery on an Audience's Perception of Expressiveness derived from Student's Performance


Dear Mr. Ruiz:

On 11/27/2013, the Institutional Review Board (IRB) reviewed and APPROVED the above application and all documents outlined below.

Approved Item(s): Protocol Document(s): Protocol guidelines.pdf

Consent/Assent Document(s)*: Consent form.docx.pdf

*Please use only the official IRB stamped informed consent/assent document(s) found under the "Attachments" tab. Please note, these consent/assent document(s) are only valid during the approval period indicated at the top of the form(s).

It was the determination of the IRB that your study qualified for expedited review which includes activities that (1) present no more than minimal risk to human subjects, and (2) involve only procedures listed in one or more of the categories outlined below. The IRB may review research through the expedited review procedure authorized by 45CFR46.110 and 21 CFR 56.110. The research proposed in this study is categorized under the following expedited review category:

(7) Research on individual or group characteristics or behavior (including, but not limited to, research on perception, cognition, motivation, identity, language, communication, cultural beliefs or practices, and social behavior) or research employing survey, interview, oral history, focus group, program evaluation, human factors evaluation, or quality assurance methodologies.

As the principal investigator of this study, it is your responsibility to conduct this
study in accordance with IRB policies and procedures and as approved by the IRB. Any changes to the approved research must be submitted to the IRB for review and approval by an amendment.

We appreciate your dedication to the ethical conduct of human subject research at the University of South Florida and your continued commitment to human research protections. If you have any questions regarding this matter, please call 813-974-5638.

Sincerely,

Kristen Salomon, Ph.D., Vice Chairperson USF Institutional Review Board
Jose Ruiz School of Music 4202 East Fowler Ave., MUS 101 Tampa, FL 33620

RE: Expedited Approval for Amendment

IRB#: Ame2_Pro00015353

Title: The Effects of Mental Imagery with Technical Descriptions on Audience's Perception of Expressiveness While Listening to Original Musical Performance

Dear Mr. Ruiz:

On 1/14/2015, the Institutional Review Board (IRB) reviewed and APPROVED your Amendment. The submitted request has been approved for the following:

Revised Protocol, version 2, dated 01/12/2015 Revised Consent Form, version 2, dated 01/13/2015 Addition of Jeff Temple and Dr. C. Victor Fung to key personnel. Deletion of Dr. Jennifer Bugos from key personnel.

Approved Item(s): Protocol Document(s): Protocol v.2 (no tracking).pdf

Consent Document(s)*: Consent Form v.2 (no tracking).pdf.pdf

*Please use only the official IRB stamped informed consent/assent document(s) found under the "Attachments" tab on the main study's workspace. Please note, these consent/assent document(s) are only valid during the approval period indicated at the top of the form(s) and replace previously approved versions.

We appreciate your dedication to the ethical conduct of human subject research at the University of South Florida and your continued commitment to human research protections. If you have any questions regarding this matter, please call 813-974-5638.

Sincerely,

John Schinka, Ph.D., Chairperson USF Institutional Review Board
John A. Schinka, Ph.D.
Appendix H: IRB Expedited Approval for Continuing Review

Jose Ruiz USF School of Music 4202 E Fowler Ave MUS 101 Tampa, FL 33620

RE: Expedited Approval for Continuing Review

IRB#: CR1_Pro00015353

Title: The Effects of Mental Imagery on an Audience's Perception of Expressiveness derived from Student's Performance


Dear Mr. Ruiz:

On 11/25/2014, the Institutional Review Board (IRB) reviewed and APPROVED the above application and all documents outlined below.

Approved Item(s): Protocol Document(s): Protocals guidelines.pdf

Consent/Assent Document(s)*: Consent form.docx.pdf

*Please use only the official IRB stamped informed consent/assent document(s) found under the "Attachments" tab on the main study's workspace. Please note, these consent/assent document(s) are only valid during the approval period indicated at the top of the form(s) and replace the previously approved versions.

Please submit a reportable event to the IRB within 5 business days to report the use of unstamped consent forms.

Please submit an amendment to the IRB within 30 days to increase the study enrollment.

The IRB determined that your study qualified for expedited review based on federal expedited category number(s):

(7) Research on individual or group characteristics or behavior (including, but not limited to, research on perception, cognition, motivation, identity, language, communication, cultural beliefs or practices, and social behavior) or research employing survey, interview, oral history, focus group, program evaluation, human
factors evaluation, or quality assurance methodologies.

As the principal investigator of this study, it is your responsibility to conduct this study in accordance with IRB policies and procedures and as approved by the IRB. Any changes to the approved research must be submitted to the IRB for review and approval by an amendment.

We appreciate your dedication to the ethical conduct of human subject research at the University of South Florida and your continued commitment to human research protections. If you have any questions regarding this matter, please call 813-974-5638.

Sincerely,

John Schinka, Ph.D., Chairperson USF Institutional Review Board
BIOGRAPHY

José Valentino Ruiz is a Latin-GRAMMY nominated artist, multi-instrumentalist, composer, producer, educator, clinician, and record producer known for his passionate performances, versatility & fluid expression on the flute, saxophone, bass, piano, and Latin percussion. His albums, performances, ensemble leadership in higher education, improvisations and compositions, and engineering skills have won an unprecedented 42 International DOWNBEAT Student Music Awards (2006 - 2016) for the following categories: Best Jazz Soloist - 7, Classical Soloist - 2, Blues/Pop/Rock Soloist - 7, Studio Engineered Recording - 5, Live Engineered Recording - 3, Latin Group - 8, Jazz Group - 3, and Blues/Pop/Rock Group - 3. Other awards include: Winner of International Yamaha Young Performing Artist Competition, Winner of the International COG Teen Talent Competition (Woodwind) - 3, and Winner of the National Flute Association Jazz Flute Competition. José has collaborated as a co-main artist, sideman, and producer for albums with Grammy-winning and internationally recognized artists/composers such as Chick Corea, Paquito D'Rivera, Jim Walker, Phil Ramone, Jonathan Butler, Alex Acuña, Aaron Neville, Brian Lynch, Nestor Torres, Dave Valentin, Andy Montanez, Hubert Laws, Horacio "El Negro" Hernandez, Dave Cleveland, and Abraham Laboriel, just to name a few.
As a radiant performer, José has performed with his ensembles, *Crossmatch Vamp*, *José Valentino Band*, and *Touch* (iPad Band), at many prestigious venues: Carnegie Hall, Tanglewood Music Center, DC Jazz Festival, The NAMM Show (Largest music convention in the world), RCA Dome, Festival Miami, Orlando Convention Center, COG International General Assembly, National Museum of Arts of Puerto Rico, Tampa Jazz Festival, Low Country Jazz Festival, Cape Coral Jazz Festival, St. Armand's Jazz Festival, Jacksonville Jazz Festival, Winter Park Jazz festival, Clearwater Jazz Festival, National Flute Association, Florida Music Educator's Association Conference, Texas Music Educator's Association Conference, National Association for Music Education Conference, Florida Technology and Education Conference, Popular Music Education Conference, TEDx Talk, ESPN, FOX News, CBS, NBC, World News, CNN, ABC, Univision, Telemundo, and CBS.

As a composer and film scorer, his work has been featured in several films, shorts, and documentaries that have garnered 13 awards in various categories at the Gasparilla International Film Festival, Los Angeles Shorts Festival, Chelsea Film Festival (3x), Newport Film Festival, Bahamas International Film Festival, Champs Elysees Film Festival, and Best Short Competition. José also works extensively as a music supervisor, composer, and music producer for Hayden5Media LLC., a company that has produced nationally-publicized commercials - Swiffer, Coca Cola, Converse, Truth, Pasties, Doritos, Slim Fast, and so forth.

In 2015, the 16th Annual Latin GRAMMY awards nominated José's album, *José Valentino & The Latin Jazz Ensemble* "*I Make You Want To Move*" for Best Latin Jazz Album of the Year. Initially, this album began as a music education project
to help students gain a deeper understanding of music production and technology, music industry, world musics, the performing arts, and endorsements. Fueled by a student-centered learning philosophy and a professional production opportunity, José's students realized their dreams and became relevantly equipped for the music industry post-graduation. Today, those students are competent in these subjects, have obtained numerous endorsements and awards, have released solo albums, and have established thriving careers in performance and production.

His 15 years of professional experience in the music industry and passion for education has been expressed as a higher educator (Instructor of Record at USF School of Music), a music educator for special needs students (The Pepin Academies), a music production teacher for at-risk students (C. Leon King High School), and as an international touring clinician for 17 music manufacturers. With a compassionate heart towards students, José attracts musicians of different demographic backgrounds and musical levels to his master classes. His lessons are described as highly interactive, humorous, and Christ-centered. Notable topics include: (1) Cultivating artistic identity, self-efficacy, and intrinsic motivation; (2) Effective strategies for becoming competent improvisers and composers; (3) Proficiency in music production, film scoring pedagogy, and music business.

José has extended his educational and ministerial reach as a leader of 11 music-based mission trips focused on developing music programs for at-risk population groups in third world countries - Guatemala, Nicaragua, El Salvador, Colombia, Costa Rica, Puerto Rico, and U.S.A. Today those programs are thriving after-school music programs that provide adolescents and youth within their
communities with an alternative to drugs and gangs.

José's albums offer listeners an opportunity to experience global and chronological perspectives of music meshed together. His discography has harmonized musical traditions including: Jazz, Classical, R&B, Funk, Latin rhythms, Gospel, Hip Hop, Electronic Dance Music, Pop, Rock, World musics, and American Folk. José performed, produced, and engineered other national artists' albums including Gualo (The Other Side of Love Songs – 2016), Jesse Pitts (Genesis – 2012), Bruno Miranda (Mosaico – 2016), Zohet (Revelación del Viento - 2016), and Jim Walker (We Are One – 2016), which is a one-of-a-kind multi-cultural music project that celebrates the music from Latin America, Middle East, Ireland, and West Africa. José's current discography includes: A Traveler's Journey (2015), I Make You Want To Move (2015), Dialogue With The King (2015), Soul Speak: A Lyrically Soloistic Bass Project (2016), Expressions: The Jazz Piano Album (2016), Remembering (2016), and A Walk With God (2016).

As of May 3rd, 2016, José accepted the position as Assistant Professor of Music Business at the School of Music at Lee University in Cleveland, TN. In his leisure time, José enjoys playing billiards, eating exotic foods, playing basketball, traveling abroad, spending quality time with his family and friends, discussing philosophy, reading The Bible, and playing music with other musicians. For more information, visit: www.josevalentino.com.