

8-31-2005

# Education Policy Analysis Archives 13/37

Arizona State University

University of South Florida

Follow this and additional works at: [http://scholarcommons.usf.edu/coedu\\_pub](http://scholarcommons.usf.edu/coedu_pub)

 Part of the [Education Commons](#)

---

## Scholar Commons Citation

Arizona State University and University of South Florida, "Education Policy Analysis Archives 13/37 " (2005). *College of Education Publications*. Paper 572.

[http://scholarcommons.usf.edu/coedu\\_pub/572](http://scholarcommons.usf.edu/coedu_pub/572)

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the College of Education at Scholar Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in College of Education Publications by an authorized administrator of Scholar Commons. For more information, please contact [scholarcommons@usf.edu](mailto:scholarcommons@usf.edu).

# EDUCATION POLICY ANALYSIS ARCHIVES

A peer-reviewed scholarly journal

Editor: Sherman Dorn

College of Education

University of South Florida

Copyright is retained by the first or sole author, who grants right of first publication to the **Education Policy Analysis Archives**. EPAA is published jointly by the Colleges of Education at Arizona State University and the University of South Florida. Articles are indexed in the Directory of Open Access Journals ([www.doaj.org](http://www.doaj.org)) and by H.W. Wilson & Co.

Volume 13 Number 37

August 30, 2005

ISSN 1068-2341

---

## Response to "What Do Klein et al. Tell Us About Test Scores in Texas?"<sup>1</sup>

Stephen P. Klein, Laura S. Hamilton, Daniel F. McCaffrey, Brian M. Stecher  
RAND

Citation: Klein, S. P., Hamilton, L. S., McCaffrey, D. F., & Stecher, B. M. (2005, August 30). Response to "What do Klein et al. tell us about test scores in Texas?" *Education Policy Analysis Archives*, 13(37). Retrieved [date] from <http://epaa.asu.edu/epaa/v13n37/>.

We have reviewed the article by Toenjes (2005). Below we summarize our responses.

First, Toenjes incorrectly describes the focus of our study. As we note in our paper, the findings from the 20-school analysis merely triggered and supplemented our statewide analyses. Most of our article examined the stark discontinuity between TAAS and NAEP trends for the entire state of Texas (namely, the meteoric increase in scores and the narrowing of the gap between racial/ethnic groups on TAAS not being reflected on NAEP). The huge discrepancy between NAEP and state test scores in Texas is well-documented, it is still present, and it has been described in other studies (Haney, 2000; McCombs et al., 2005; Peterson & Hess, 2005). Toenjes' comments about the representativeness of the 20 schools are irrelevant to our statewide analyses, and that analysis was the focus of our paper.

Second, Toenjes appears to have misunderstood the purpose of our 20-schools analysis. The intent was not to make conclusions about relationships between achievement and socioeconomic status statewide. Rather, the purpose was to examine whether, in this particular sample for which scores on two different tests were available, the TAAS functioned in the same way as an alternative test that many other states use, namely, the Stanford 9. The fact that the TAAS and Stanford 9

---

<sup>1</sup> Accepted under the editorship of Sherman Dorn. Send commentary to Casey Cobb ([casey.cobb@uconn.edu](mailto:casey.cobb@uconn.edu)).

showed radically different relationships with SES does not tell us anything about what those relationships would be in a larger sample, and we never claim that it does. In particular, we do not, as Toenjes claims, use the 20-schools study to conclude that TAAS lacks validity.

Instead, we used the findings with the 20 schools to show that in these particular schools, the scores on a commonly used test of mathematics achievement did not correspond to scores on the TAAS. The difference between these two tests was much larger than can plausibly be explained by differences in content coverage, and therefore raises questions about the meaning of TAAS scores for these schools. As we state clearly, “We are therefore reluctant to draw conclusions from our findings with these schools or to imply that these findings are likely to occur elsewhere in Texas. Nevertheless, they do suggest the desirability of periodic administration of external tests to validate TAAS results. This procedure, which is sometimes referred to as ‘audit testing,’ could have been incorporated into the study of the Metropolitan Achievement Test discussed previously.” This is a much more cautious conclusion than Toenjes claims we make.

Third, Toenjes misunderstands the relationship between our study and the Grissmer, Flanagan, Kawata, & Williamson (2000) study. Toenjes states that we concluded that the observed increases in Texas student academic performance reported by Grissmer et al. (2000) were highly suspect. Our paper contains no such conclusion. We focused on whether the TAAS scores were suspect, whereas Grissmer et al. examined gains in NAEP. As we clearly state in our paper, “these studies differed in the questions they investigated, the data they analyzed, and the methodologies they employed.” The studies do not in fact produce conflicting findings; they simply address different questions.

## References

- Grissmer, D., Flanagan, A., Kawata, J., & Williamson, S. (2000). *Improving student achievement: What state NAEP test scores tell us*. Santa Monica, CA: RAND, [MR-924-EDU](#).
- Haney, W. (2000). The Myth of the Texas Miracle in Education. *Education Policy Analysis Archives*, 8(41). Retrieved June 21, 2005, from <http://epaa.asu.edu/epaa/v8n41/>.
- McCombs, J. S., Kirby, S. N., Barney, H., Darilek, H., & Magee, S. J. (2005). *Achieving state and national literacy goals, a long uphill road: A report to Carnegie Corporation of New York*. Santa Monica, CA: RAND, TR-180-EDU.
- Peterson, P. E., & Hess, F. M. (2005). Johnny can read...in some states. *Education Next*, Summer 2005, 52-53. Retrieved June 21, 2005, from <http://www.educationnext.org/20053/pdf/52.pdf>.
- Toenjes, L. A. (2005). What do Klein et al. tell us about test scores in Texas? *Education Policy Analysis Archives*, 13(36). Available at <http://epaa.asu.edu/epaa/v13n36/>.

### About the Authors

**Stephen P. Klein**  
**Laura S. Hamilton**  
**Daniel F. McCaffrey**  
**Brian Stecher**  
RAND

Email: [klein@rand.org](mailto:klein@rand.org)

**Dr. Stephen P. Klein** is a Senior Research Scientist at RAND, where for the past 30 years he has led studies on health, criminal justice, military manpower, and educational issues. His current projects include analyzing licensing examinations in teaching and other professions, delivering computer performance tests over the Web, and measuring the effects of instructional practices and curriculum on student performance.

**Dr. Laura S. Hamilton** is a Senior Behavioral Scientist at RAND where she conducts research on educational assessment and the effectiveness of educational reform programs. Her current projects include a study of systemic reforms in math and science, an investigation of district and school responses to standards-based accountability, and a study of teachers' and principals' use of information from a value-added assessment system.

**Dr. Daniel F. McCaffrey** is a Senior Statistician at RAND where he works on studies of health and educational issues. His recent research has focused the study of value-added model estimates of teacher effects by evaluating the literature and statistical methods for value-added modeling, by developing new models and algorithms for estimating effects, and by conducting empirical evaluations of the various estimates. He is also studying the effect of a value-added assessment program on student outcomes and educational practice.

**Dr. Brian Stecher** is a Senior Social Scientist in the Education program at RAND. Dr. Stecher's research emphasis is applied educational measurement, including the implementation, quality, and impact of state assessment and accountability systems and the cost, quality, and feasibility of performance-based assessments in mathematics and science.

**Editor: Sherman Dorn, University of South Florida**

Production Assistant: Chris Murrell, Arizona State University

General questions about appropriateness of topics or particular articles may be addressed to the Editor, Sherman Dorn, [epaa-editor@shermamdorn.com](mailto:epaa-editor@shermamdorn.com).

### **Editorial Board**

**Michael W. Apple**

University of Wisconsin

**Greg Camilli**

Rutgers University

**Linda Darling-Hammond**

Stanford University

**Gustavo E. Fischman**

Arizona State University

**Gene V Glass**

Arizona State University

**Aimee Howley**

Ohio University

**William Hunter**

University of Ontario Institute of Technology

**Daniel Kallós**

Umeå University

**Thomas Mauhs-Pugh**

Green Mountain College

**Heinrich Mintrop**

University of California, Berkeley

**Anthony G. Rud Jr.**

Purdue University

**Terrence G. Wiley**

Arizona State University

**David C. Berliner**

Arizona State University

**Casey Cobb**

University of Connecticut

**Mark E. Fetler**

California Commission on Teacher Credentialing

**Richard Garlikov**

Birmingham, Alabama

**Thomas F. Green**

Syracuse University

**Craig B. Howley**

Appalachia Educational Laboratory

**Patricia Fey Jarvis**

Seattle, Washington

**Benjamin Levin**

University of Manitoba

**Les McLean**

University of Toronto

**Michele Moses**

Arizona State University

**Michael Scriven**

Western Michigan University

**John Willinsky**

University of British Columbia

**EDUCATION POLICY ANALYSIS ARCHIVES**  
**English-language Graduate-Student Editorial Board**

**Noga Admon**  
New York University

**Jessica Allen**  
University of Colorado

**Cheryl Aman**  
University of British Columbia

**Anne Black**  
University of Connecticut

**Marisa Burian-Fitzgerald**  
Michigan State University

**Chad d'Entremont**  
Teachers College Columbia University

**Carol Da Silva**  
Harvard University

**Tara Donahue**  
Michigan State University

**Camille Farrington**  
University of Illinois Chicago

**Chris Frey**  
Indiana University

**Amy Garrett Dikkers**  
University of Minnesota

**Misty Ginicola**  
Yale University

**Jake Gross**  
Indiana University

**Hee Kyung Hong**  
Loyola University Chicago

**Jennifer Lloyd**  
University of British Columbia

**Heather Lord**  
Yale University

**Shereza Mohammed**  
Florida Atlantic University

**Ben Superfine**  
University of Michigan

**John Weathers**  
University of Pennsylvania

**Kyo Yamashiro**  
University of California Los Angeles

## Archivos Analíticos de Políticas Educativas

### Associate Editors

**Gustavo E. Fischman & Pablo Gentili**

Arizona State University & Universidade do Estado do Rio de Janeiro

Founding Associate Editor for Spanish Language (1998—2003)

**Roberto Rodríguez Gómez**

### Editorial Board

**Hugo Aboites**

Universidad Autónoma  
Metropolitana-Xochimilco

**Dalila Andrade de Oliveira**

Universidade Federal de Minas  
Gerais, Belo Horizonte, Brasil

**Alejandro Canales**

Universidad Nacional Autónoma  
de México

**Erwin Epstein**

Loyola University, Chicago,  
Illinois

**Rollin Kent**

Universidad Autónoma de  
Puebla. Puebla, México

**Daniel C. Levy**

University at Albany, SUNY,  
Albany, New York

**María Loreto Egaña**

Programa Interdisciplinario de  
Investigación en Educación

**Grover Pango**

Foro Latinoamericano de  
Políticas Educativas, Perú

**Angel Ignacio Pérez Gómez**

Universidad de Málaga

**Diana Rhoten**

Social Science Research Council,  
New York, New York

**Susan Street**

Centro de Investigaciones y  
Estudios Superiores en  
Antropología Social Occidente,  
Guadalajara, México

**Antonio Teodoro**

Universidade Lusófona Lisboa,

**Adrián Acosta**

Universidad de Guadalajara  
México

**Alejandra Birgin**

Ministerio de Educación,  
Argentina

**Ursula Casanova**

Arizona State University,  
Tempe, Arizona

**Mariano Fernández**

**Enguita** Universidad de  
Salamanca. España

**Walter Kohan**

Universidade Estadual do Rio  
de Janeiro, Brasil

**Nilma Limo Gomes**

Universidade Federal de  
Minas Gerais, Belo Horizonte

**Mariano Narodowski**

Universidad Torcuato Di  
Tella, Argentina

**Vanilda Paiva**

Universidade Estadual Do  
Rio De Janeiro, Brasil

**Mónica Pini**

Universidad Nacional de San  
Martín, Argentina

**José Gimeno Sacristán**

Universidad de Valencia,  
España

**Nelly P. Stromquist**

University of Southern  
California, Los Angeles,  
California

**Carlos A. Torres**

UCLA

**Claudio Almonacid Avila**

Universidad Metropolitana de  
Ciencias de la Educación, Chile

**Teresa Bracho**

Centro de Investigación y  
Docencia Económica-CIDE

**Sigfredo Chiroque**

Instituto de Pedagogía Popular,  
Perú

**Gaudêncio Frigotto**

Universidade Estadual do Rio  
de Janeiro, Brasil

**Roberto Leher**

Universidade Estadual do Rio  
de Janeiro, Brasil

**Pia Lindquist Wong**

California State University,  
Sacramento, California

**Iolanda de Oliveira**

Universidade Federal  
Fluminense, Brasil

**Miguel Pereira**

Catedrático Universidad de  
Granada, España

**Romualdo Portella do**

**Oliveira**

Universidade de São Paulo

**Daniel Schugurensky**

Ontario Institute for Studies in  
Education, Canada

**Daniel Suarez**

Laboratorio de Políticas  
Públicas-Universidad de  
Buenos Aires, Argentina

**Jurjo Torres Santomé**

Universidad de la Coruña,  
España