



University of South Florida

Digital Commons @ University of South Florida

Education Policy Analysis Archives (EPAA)

USF Faculty Collections

August 2005

Educational policy analysis archives

Arizona State University

University of South Florida

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcommons.usf.edu/usf_EPAA

Recommended Citation

Arizona State University and University of South Florida, "Educational policy analysis archives" (2005).
Education Policy Analysis Archives (EPAA). 173.
https://digitalcommons.usf.edu/usf_EPAA/173

This Text is brought to you for free and open access by the USF Faculty Collections at Digital Commons @ University of South Florida. It has been accepted for inclusion in Education Policy Analysis Archives (EPAA) by an authorized administrator of Digital Commons @ University of South Florida. For more information, please contact scholarcommons@usf.edu.

EDUCATION POLICY ANALYSIS ARCHIVES

A peer-reviewed scholarly journal

Editor: Sherman Dorn

College of Education

University of South Florida

Copyright is retained by the first or sole author, who grants right of first publication to the **Education Policy Analysis Archives**. EPAA is published jointly by the Colleges of Education at Arizona State University and the University of South Florida. Articles are indexed in the Directory of Open Access Journals (www.doaj.org) and by H.W. Wilson & Co.

Volume 13 Number 37

August 30, 2005

ISSN 1068-2341

Response to "What Do Klein et al. Tell Us About Test Scores in Texas?"¹

Stephen P. Klein, Laura S. Hamilton, Daniel F. McCaffrey, Brian M. Stecher
RAND

Citation: Klein, S. P., Hamilton, L. S., McCaffrey, D. F., & Stecher, B. M. (2005, August 30). Response to "What do Klein et al. tell us about test scores in Texas?" *Education Policy Analysis Archives*, 13(37). Retrieved [date] from <http://epaa.asu.edu/epaa/v13n37/>.

We have reviewed the article by Toenjes (2005). Below we summarize our responses.

First, Toenjes incorrectly describes the focus of our study. As we note in our paper, the findings from the 20-school analysis merely triggered and supplemented our statewide analyses. Most of our article examined the stark discontinuity between TAAS and NAEP trends for the entire state of Texas (namely, the meteoric increase in scores and the narrowing of the gap between racial/ethnic groups on TAAS not being reflected on NAEP). The huge discrepancy between NAEP and state test scores in Texas is well-documented, it is still present, and it has been described in other studies (Haney, 2000; McCombs et al., 2005; Peterson & Hess, 2005). Toenjes' comments about the representativeness of the 20 schools are irrelevant to our statewide analyses, and that analysis was the focus of our paper.

Second, Toenjes appears to have misunderstood the purpose of our 20-schools analysis. The intent was not to make conclusions about relationships between achievement and socioeconomic status statewide. Rather, the purpose was to examine whether, in this particular sample for which scores on two different tests were available, the TAAS functioned in the same way as an alternative test that many other states use, namely, the Stanford 9. The fact that the TAAS and Stanford 9

¹ Accepted under the editorship of Sherman Dorn. Send commentary to Casey Cobb (casey.cobb@uconn.edu).

showed radically different relationships with SES does not tell us anything about what those relationships would be in a larger sample, and we never claim that it does. In particular, we do not, as Toenjes claims, use the 20-schools study to conclude that TAAS lacks validity.

Instead, we used the findings with the 20 schools to show that in these particular schools, the scores on a commonly used test of mathematics achievement did not correspond to scores on the TAAS. The difference between these two tests was much larger than can plausibly be explained by differences in content coverage, and therefore raises questions about the meaning of TAAS scores for these schools. As we state clearly, “We are therefore reluctant to draw conclusions from our findings with these schools or to imply that these findings are likely to occur elsewhere in Texas. Nevertheless, they do suggest the desirability of periodic administration of external tests to validate TAAS results. This procedure, which is sometimes referred to as ‘audit testing,’ could have been incorporated into the study of the Metropolitan Achievement Test discussed previously.” This is a much more cautious conclusion than Toenjes claims we make.

Third, Toenjes misunderstands the relationship between our study and the Grissmer, Flanagan, Kawata, & Williamson (2000) study. Toenjes states that we concluded that the observed increases in Texas student academic performance reported by Grissmer et al. (2000) were highly suspect. Our paper contains no such conclusion. We focused on whether the TAAS scores were suspect, whereas Grissmer et al. examined gains in NAEP. As we clearly state in our paper, “these studies differed in the questions they investigated, the data they analyzed, and the methodologies they employed.” The studies do not in fact produce conflicting findings; they simply address different questions.

References

- Grissmer, D., Flanagan, A., Kawata, J., & Williamson, S. (2000). *Improving student achievement: What state NAEP test scores tell us*. Santa Monica, CA: RAND, [MR-924-EDU](#).
- Haney, W. (2000). The Myth of the Texas Miracle in Education. *Education Policy Analysis Archives*, 8(41). Retrieved June 21, 2005, from <http://epaa.asu.edu/epaa/v8n41/>.
- McCombs, J. S., Kirby, S. N., Barney, H., Darilek, H., & Magee, S. J. (2005). *Achieving state and national literacy goals, a long uphill road: A report to Carnegie Corporation of New York*. Santa Monica, CA: RAND, TR-180-EDU.
- Peterson, P. E., & Hess, F. M. (2005). Johnny can read...in some states. *Education Next*, Summer 2005, 52-53. Retrieved June 21, 2005, from <http://www.educationnext.org/20053/pdf/52.pdf>.
- Toenjes, L. A. (2005). What do Klein et al. tell us about test scores in Texas? *Education Policy Analysis Archives*, 13(36). Available at <http://epaa.asu.edu/epaa/v13n36/>.

About the Authors

Stephen P. Klein

Laura S. Hamilton

Daniel F. McCaffrey

Brian Stecher

RAND

Email: klein@rand.org

Dr. Stephen P. Klein is a Senior Research Scientist at RAND, where for the past 30 years he has led studies on health, criminal justice, military manpower, and educational issues. His current projects include analyzing licensing examinations in teaching and other professions, delivering computer performance tests over the Web, and measuring the effects of instructional practices and curriculum on student performance.

Dr. Laura S. Hamilton is a Senior Behavioral Scientist at RAND where she conducts research on educational assessment and the effectiveness of educational reform programs. Her current projects include a study of systemic reforms in math and science, an investigation of district and school responses to standards-based accountability, and a study of teachers' and principals' use of information from a value-added assessment system.

Dr. Daniel F. McCaffrey is a Senior Statistician at RAND where he works on studies of health and educational issues. His recent research has focused the study of value-added model estimates of teacher effects by evaluating the literature and statistical methods for value-added modeling, by developing new models and algorithms for estimating effects, and by conducting empirical evaluations of the various estimates. He is also studying the effect of a value-added assessment program on student outcomes and educational practice.

Dr. Brian Stecher is a Senior Social Scientist in the Education program at RAND. Dr. Stecher's research emphasis is applied educational measurement, including the implementation, quality, and impact of state assessment and accountability systems and the cost, quality, and feasibility of performance-based assessments in mathematics and science.

Editor: Sherman Dorn, University of South Florida

Production Assistant: Chris Murrell, Arizona State University

General questions about appropriateness of topics or particular articles may be addressed to the Editor, Sherman Dorn, epaa-editor@shermamdorn.com.

Editorial Board

Michael W. Apple

University of Wisconsin

Greg Camilli

Rutgers University

Linda Darling-Hammond

Stanford University

Gustavo E. Fischman

Arizona State University

Gene V Glass

Arizona State University

Aimee Howley

Ohio University

William Hunter

University of Ontario Institute of Technology

Daniel Kallós

Umeå University

Thomas Mauhs-Pugh

Green Mountain College

Heinrich Mintrop

University of California, Berkeley

Anthony G. Rud Jr.

Purdue University

Terrence G. Wiley

Arizona State University

David C. Berliner

Arizona State University

Casey Cobb

University of Connecticut

Mark E. Fetler

California Commission on Teacher Credentialing

Richard Garlikov

Birmingham, Alabama

Thomas F. Green

Syracuse University

Craig B. Howley

Appalachia Educational Laboratory

Patricia Fey Jarvis

Seattle, Washington

Benjamin Levin

University of Manitoba

Les McLean

University of Toronto

Michele Moses

Arizona State University

Michael Scriven

Western Michigan University

John Willinsky

University of British Columbia

EDUCATION POLICY ANALYSIS ARCHIVES
English-language Graduate-Student Editorial Board

Noga Admon
New York University

Jessica Allen
University of Colorado

Cheryl Aman
University of British Columbia

Anne Black
University of Connecticut

Marisa Burian-Fitzgerald
Michigan State University

Chad d'Entremont
Teachers College Columbia University

Carol Da Silva
Harvard University

Tara Donahue
Michigan State University

Camille Farrington
University of Illinois Chicago

Chris Frey
Indiana University

Amy Garrett Dikkers
University of Minnesota

Misty Ginicola
Yale University

Jake Gross
Indiana University

Hee Kyung Hong
Loyola University Chicago

Jennifer Lloyd
University of British Columbia

Heather Lord
Yale University

Shereza Mohammed
Florida Atlantic University

Ben Superfine
University of Michigan

John Weathers
University of Pennsylvania

Kyo Yamashiro
University of California Los Angeles

Archivos Analíticos de Políticas Educativas

Associate Editors

Gustavo E. Fischman & Pablo Gentili

Arizona State University & Universidade do Estado do Rio de Janeiro

Founding Associate Editor for Spanish Language (1998—2003)

Roberto Rodríguez Gómez

Editorial Board

Hugo Aboites

Universidad Autónoma
Metropolitana-Xochimilco

Dalila Andrade de Oliveira

Universidade Federal de Minas
Gerais, Belo Horizonte, Brasil

Alejandro Canales

Universidad Nacional Autónoma
de México

Erwin Epstein

Loyola University, Chicago,
Illinois

Rollin Kent

Universidad Autónoma de
Puebla. Puebla, México

Daniel C. Levy

University at Albany, SUNY,
Albany, New York

María Loreto Egaña

Programa Interdisciplinario de
Investigación en Educación

Grover Pango

Foro Latinoamericano de
Políticas Educativas, Perú

Angel Ignacio Pérez Gómez

Universidad de Málaga

Diana Rhoten

Social Science Research Council,
New York, New York

Susan Street

Centro de Investigaciones y
Estudios Superiores en
Antropología Social Occidente,
Guadalajara, México

Antonio Teodoro

Universidade Lusófona Lisboa,

Adrián Acosta

Universidad de Guadalajara
México

Alejandra Birgin

Ministerio de Educación,
Argentina

Ursula Casanova

Arizona State University,
Tempe, Arizona

Mariano Fernández

Enguita Universidad de
Salamanca. España

Walter Kohan

Universidade Estadual do Rio
de Janeiro, Brasil

Nilma Limo Gomes

Universidade Federal de
Minas Gerais, Belo Horizonte

Mariano Narodowski

Universidad Torcuato Di
Tella, Argentina

Vanilda Paiva

Universidade Estadual Do
Rio De Janeiro, Brasil

Mónica Pini

Universidad Nacional de San
Martín, Argentina

José Gimeno Sacristán

Universidad de Valencia,
España

Nelly P. Stromquist

University of Southern
California, Los Angeles,
California

Carlos A. Torres

UCLA

Claudio Almonacid Avila

Universidad Metropolitana de
Ciencias de la Educación, Chile

Teresa Bracho

Centro de Investigación y
Docencia Económica-CIDE

Sigfredo Chiroque

Instituto de Pedagogía Popular,
Perú

Gaudêncio Frigotto

Universidade Estadual do Rio
de Janeiro, Brasil

Roberto Leher

Universidade Estadual do Rio
de Janeiro, Brasil

Pia Lindquist Wong

California State University,
Sacramento, California

Iolanda de Oliveira

Universidade Federal
Fluminense, Brasil

Miguel Pereira

Catedrático Universidad de
Granada, España

Romualdo Portella do

Oliveira

Universidade de São Paulo

Daniel Schugurensky

Ontario Institute for Studies in
Education, Canada

Daniel Suarez

Laboratorio de Políticas
Públicas-Universidad de
Buenos Aires, Argentina

Jurjo Torres Santomé

Universidad de la Coruña,
España